CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

In Chapter 3, I explain the use of the case study methods offered by Stake (1995, 2000) and Yin (2003) in my qualitative research. I will examine the case study methodology theoretically, discuss its types and goals, and describe my application of the methods in my research design. In this chapter, I will discuss my research questions, describe each research site context, my data collection methods, approach to data analysis, and writing. The data I collected were from observations, interviews, document studies, and reflective journals.

My goals, in this research, are to better understand multicultural- and dance education in the U.S., and explore its usefulness to dance teacher education programs in Indonesia. My dissertation research has included a literature review of multicultural education, its application with dance education, and its implementation through case studies of two dance teachers working in Columbus public schools. Based on my literature review and findings from the case studies, I will formulate recommendations for multicultural dance education in Indonesia.

Research Design

Yin (2003) states that the definition of the case study research technically includes

two methods: an empirical inquiry and the case study itself. First, Yin defines that "a case

study is an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within itsreal-

life context, especially when the boundaries between the phenomenon and the context are

not clearly evident" (p. 13). In an empirical inquiry, the researcher wants to

cover contextual conditions that are important to the phenomenon being studied. Second,

Yin states that because phenomenon and context cannot be divorced in real-life

situations, the case study inquiry necessitates a comprehensive research strategy that

includes data collection and data analysis. Additionally, Yin asserts that case study

inquiry,

- copes with the technically distinctive situation in which there will be many more variables of interest than data points, and as one result
- relies on multiple sources of evidence, with data needing to converge in a triangulating fashion, and as another result
- benefits from the prior development of theoretical propositions to guide data collection and analysis (Yin, 2003, pp. 13-14).

In the first bullet, Yin affirms that a case study is used as a tool to multiply examine the

existence of the contemporary phenomenon within its context. In the second bullet, Yin

calls for comprehensive data collection and analyses that have been cross-examined and

triangulated. The third bullet acknowledges the role of theory being at the center of the

research strategy.

Stake (2000) simply states that a case study is a bounded system. When the case is

a system, "its behavior is patterned. Coherence and sequence are prominent. It is common

to recognize that certain features are within the system, within the boundaries of the case,

and other features outside. Some are significant as context" (p. 436). Stake emphasizes that the case study has boundaries and connects with the context. Therefore, a case study uses an inquiry approach.

Stake identifies three types of case studies: intrinsic, instrumental, and collective case study. The intrinsic case study considers a particular case in which the researcher is curious to better understand the intrinsic interest, for instance, a child's behavior, a conference, or the curriculum of a school. The instrumental case study deals with the understanding of the issues or an external interest of a case study. In an instrumental case study, the case itself is secondary and it functions as a tool to understand something else. According to Stake, a collective case study is an "instrumental study extended by several cases" (p. 437). The instrumental study is based on "a research question, puzzlement, a need for general understanding, and a feeling that we may get insight into the question by studying a particular case" (Stake, 1995, p. 3).

Yin and Stake have similar ideas about case study types and goals. They suggest two types of a case study: a central study and an instrumental one. Even though Stake identifies a collective case study, this type integrally involves an instrumental case study. When the case is used as a tool or an instrument, its goal is to functionally support the issues or phenomena being studied.

My research strategy is to use Stake's ideas about the collective case study and Yin's propositions on empirical inquiry. The purpose of both is to examine cases that can deepen understanding of a contemporary phenomenon or issue. In my research, I examine the cases of two dance teachers in the Columbus public schools in order to better understand multicultural education and its promise to Indonesian dance education.

56

Research Questions

In my research, the contemporary phenomenon I sought to study is multicultural education in the U.S., particularly its usefulness in teaching dance. I then discuss the implications of multicultural dance education in the U.S. for dance education in Indonesia. Hence, I raise the following research question: What aspects of American experiences with multicultural education are helpful in promoting multicultural dance education in Indonesia?

To further explore this question and to trigger a more in-depth investigation, the question was divided into two parts:

1. Which theories of multicultural education are most relevant to the context of education in Indonesia, and specifically to dance education?

2. What aspects of two dance teachers' practice in the U.S. will be most useful to multicultural dance education in Indonesia?

My sub questions for the cases were the following:

a. What is each dance teacher's teaching philosophy?

b. How do the teachers view diverse students?

c. How do the teachers develop curricula and pedagogy that address diverse students?

d. How do the teachers communicate and interact with diverse students in and outside of their dance classes?

e. How do the school environments, other teachers, and principals provide support for teaching dance?

f. What are the differences in context between these two Columbus public schools and Indonesian schools?

g. How can the research findings from the case studies be transferred to Indonesian

schools?

The first research question investigates the theories, goals, curricula, and

pedagogy of multicultural education and multicultural issues in dance education in the

U.S. context. My literature review of the previous chapter addresses the first question.

The second question investigates the implementation of multicultural education in

teaching dance in the U.S. by looking at two dance specialists in the Columbus public

schools. The findings from the literature review and the case studies of the two dance

teachers in the U.S. were then intertextually analyzed to determine whether or not the

findings could fit and help promote multicultural dance education in an Indonesian

context.

Methods

Literature Review

When selecting major texts on multicultural education in the U.S. context, I used

the commonly cited works on multicultural education in the citation index and the works

published in multiple editions. I also reviewed the recent literature on dance education

between 1996 and 2006 that was relevant to multiculturalism in the U.S., including all

materials in the *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation and Dance (JOPERD)* and *the

Journal of Dance Education*, as well published books. While reviewing the literature, I

focused on the categories of content: theories, goals, curricula, and pedagogy in teaching

multicultural education through dance.

Case Studies

The investigation of the cases focused on knowledge, disposition, and performance, all of which are embedded in the teachers' profiles, the teachers' teaching philosophies, their approaches to curriculum and pedagogy, classroom management styles, and the teachers' collaboration with students and other teachers. Through the case studies of two dance teachers, I sought to better understand the implementation of multicultural education in teaching dance in the U.S. context and how this practice connects with approaches to multicultural education and dance.

The two dance teachers I studied are Ms. Marlene Robbins at the Indianola Informal Alternative Elementary School and Ms. Karen King-Cavin at the Arts IMPACT (Interdisciplinary Model Program in the Arts for Children and Teachers) Middle School (AIMS). The two schools have arguably the strongest dance programs in Columbus public schools. Robbins teaches K–5, while King-Cavin teaches 6th–8th grades. Both teachers were members of the revised K-12 dance course of study for Columbus Public Schools in 1998. Both also are visiting professors in the Department of Dance at The Ohio State University. I was interested in researching elementary and middle schools because the arts are required courses in both levels in American and Indonesian schools.

Furthermore, I chose the two dance teachers in the Columbus public schools because of their distinction in teaching dance and their interest in teaching multicultural dance. For instance, Robbins emphasizes teaching creative dance and uses an inquiry-based approach. King-Cavin uses choreography and dances from various cultures, including Irish, Indian, African, Mexican, and Caribbean. King-Cavin is more concerned

59

with theory and the historical perspectives of those cultures and the interconnectedness of diverse groups of people.

The Research Context

The situation of the two Columbus public schools is similar to urban Indonesian schools that are heterogeneous and contain homogeneous subgroups of students in terms of ethnic and socioeconomic diversity. In an email communication, Loren Bucek, a dance teacher in the Arts IMPACT Middle School, explained to me that with regard to their ethnic backgrounds, the students in this school consist of 87% African-American, 12% Hispanic, and 1% from other races (email communication, May 14, 2006). The Arts IMPACT Middle School is the more homogeneous of the two schools studied, but still maintains heterogeneity concerning ethnic backgrounds. The Indianola Alternative Informal Elementary School consists of students from more heterogeneous ethnic backgrounds, including Euro-Americans, African-Americans, Hispanics, Asian-Americans, students from the Middle East, and biracial students. In terms of socioeconomic backgrounds, 67% Arts IMPACT Middle School students have free and or reduced price for lunch in school (email communication, Loren Bucek, May 14, 2006). According to Katryn Moser, the Principal of the Indianola Alternative Informal Elementary School, 23 % of the students receive free or reduced price for lunch in school (personal communication, April 3, 2007).

American schools are historically and ethnically heterogeneous, a population consisting of immigrants from around the world since the 1820s (Bennett, 1999). Indonesian schools are more homogeneous, but in rural/urban, and urban areas the

population since the 1970s has come to include people from different ethnic backgrounds in Indonesia and from other nations. The major difference between Columbus public schools and Indonesia urban schools is the fact that Indonesia does not have huge immigrant populations of persons from other nations.

The students' ethnic backgrounds in the Columbus public schools are comprised of Euro-American, Hispanic, American-Indian, African-American, Asian-American, Asian, Pacific Islander, biracial, and other ethnicities. The groups migrated to the U.S. because of better opportunity, war, employment, or marriage. The students come from working lower and middle class families, and include Jews, Christians, Buddhists, Muslims, and non-religious people. In the U.S., the official language of instruction is English, even though some schools have English as Second Language (ESL) programs.

In Indonesia, people from diverse ethnic backgrounds come from the islands, including Sumatra, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, and Irian Jaya, to the capital cities, like Jakarta, Bandung, Medan, Padang, Yogyakarta, and Surabaya, to find jobs and pursue further education. They come from lower and middle income families. These capital cities, located on the main Islands of Java and Sumatra, are centers of industrialization, government bureaucracy, and higher education. The people's religious backgrounds in Indonesia are diverse and consist of Muslims, Christians, Buddhists, Hindus, Confucians, and people who have animistic beliefs. The majority of Indonesians are Muslim. The language of instruction in Indonesian schools is *Bahasa Indonesia*. Nevertheless, most students in rural areas enter school speaking their respective ethnic languages.

In the broader context, dance exists in academic settings in the U.S. as well as in Indonesia. Along with music, theater, visual arts, and visual culture, dance is part of the

educational reform movement, so that dance education for K-12 is maintained as a core

subject in dance and physical education departments in U.S. colleges and universities.

These departments prepare dance specialist teachers to teach K-12 students, even though

only a small number of American schools offer strong and effective dance programs.

With regard to an increasingly diverse population in the U.S., since the 1970s, most

education proponents have discussed the restructuring of schooling, curriculum, and

pedagogy to better meet students' and society's needs. Politicians are more focused on

quantitatively measurable outcomes and are preoccupied with scores in math, science,

and language arts.

Like in the U.S., since the 1980s, at least twelve Indonesian universities have

developed music and dance teacher education programs called Sendratasik (*Seni Drama,

Tari, dan Musik* [theatre, dance, and music])[1] even though none of them have started a

theater teacher education program. Dance is considered a part of the core subjects of arts

education and local content curriculum in schools and is listed in the national curriculum

content. Previously, the purpose of teaching dance in Indonesian schools was to preserve

and develop local cultural heritage. Since 1994, the purpose of educational dance for K-

12 students expanded not only to preserve local cultural heritage, but also to develop

students' creativity and appreciation of dance and its cultural context for both local and

other cultures.

Although the dance teacher education programs in Indonesia always includes

students from diverse ethnic backgrounds, these programs do not pay much attention to

issues of diversity, whether concerning race, ethnicity, gender, religion, and

---

[1] Fine arts are normally taught in separate study programs.

socioeconomic status. For instance, dance in Indonesia is part of the ritual, social, and cultural events of the respective ethnicities, but the curricula of the dance programs mostly focus on dance as an art form from the dominant local culture; while just a small part of the curricula relate to dances from other local cultures of Indonesia.

Data Collection

In my dissertation research, I considered several steps such as having access to the field, collecting data, analyzing the data, and writing the research report. To collect data, researchers need to negotiate entry into the field setting. This negotiation involves problems of data quality, research ethics and protecting the subject's interest and the findings. Ethics involve building mutual trust with the research participants.

To establish validity and trustworthiness, triangulation of data is necessary. "Triangulation is a means of checking the integrity of the inference one draws" (Schwandt, 2001, p. 257). Stake (2000) maintains that "triangulation has been generally considered a process of using multiple perceptions to clarify meaning, verifying the repeatability of an observation or interpretation" (p. 443). Data triangulation involves the use of multiple data sources of evidence in case studies, including observations, interviews, and document analyses, or a combination of two or more of these techniques. Therefore, in order to triangulate the data, it is important to build mutual trust between the researcher and participants.

Access

　　To gain access to the research field, I followed three steps. First, I recruited the

main subjects and confirmed whether they were willing to participate in my research.

After the main subjects agreed, I applied for an exemption to the Institutional Review

Board (IRB) at The Ohio State University. Initially I completed the comprehensive

tutorial and test qualifying my understanding or best practices, risks, and issues. I then

filled out the form concerning ethical principles, including respect for persons,

beneficence, and justice (Christians, 2000, p. 139). Second, I applied to get permission

from the Columbus District of Evaluation Services to gain access to the schools. Third, I

sought the permission of the schools' Principals who administratively have authorized

my research in their schools. All of the above codes of ethics aim to protect human

subjects from risks so that they are not placed at risk from participating the research.

Observation

　　I spent my time on-site between February and June 2007. I intended to spend one

day a week in each school respectively, to see how the teacher used curriculum content,

developed their instruction, managed the classroom, communicated with diverse students

and parents, and collaborated with students, other teachers, and staff. Of necessity, I

changed my schedule from one to two days a week because one day was not a sufficient

amount of time to accomplish my research objectives.

　　I observed Robbins's teaching K-5 grades from 9:00 a.m. to 12:00 p.m 18 times

and students' performances that were held in the evening from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. on

two occasion times. I observed King-Cavin's teaching of $6^{th} – 8^{th}$ grades, including

general and special needs students from 12:00 p.m. to 2:30 p.m. and from 9:00 a.m to

12:00 p.m. 18 times, and a students' performance that was held in the evening from 6:00

p.m. to 9:00 p.m. As a participant-observer, I also observed the school environment and

physical setting, including the facilities, to see how these affect the teachers in their

teaching of dance. I did not video tape or photograph the teachers' classes, in order to not

creating a discomfort for students or raise possible parental objections. I was, however,

allowed to video tape the students' performances.

Interview

I designed dance teachers' inquires as "structured and unstructured interview[s]"

(Fontana & Frey, 2000, pp. 649-662). Fontana and Frey explain:

> In structured interviewing, the interviewer asks all respondents the same
> series of pre established questions with a limited set of response
> categories. There is generally little room for variation in responses except
> where open-ended questions (which are infrequent) may be used. The
> interviewer records the response…. (p. 649)

The structured interview is formal. An informal interview, like ethnographic research,

involves a natural setting. According to Fontana and Frey, the structured interview

provides an in-depth and open-ended process. I recorded structured interviews with the

main and the secondary participants. For unstructured interviews, I memorized

information I received during informal conversations in the field and wrote it down later.

I conducted two long structured interviews with Robbins on April 21 and May 26,

2007. In the first interview, I asked her questions related to her educational background

and experience in dance, teaching philosophy, curriculum content, pedagogy, and

collaboration with students and other teachers. In the second interview, my questions were related to my observations of her dance classes and performances. I also spoke with her informally before and after classes. With the secondary participants, including the principal, the art teacher, and the classroom- and a substitute teacher at the Indianola Informal Elementary school, I conducted only structured interviews.

I conducted one long structured interview with King-Cavin on August 16, 2007 and several short structured interviews during lunch times at the Arts IMPACT Middle School. As when I interviewed Robbins, I asked King-Cavin questions related to her educational background and experience in dance, teaching philosophy, curriculum content, pedagogy, and collaboration with students and other teachers. In the short interviews, I asked about gender, special needs students' characteristics, and choreography and dance forms. I also conducted structured interviews with the principal and with the two classroom teachers who teach special needs students.

In the structured interviews with the secondary participants in both schools, I asked about their opinions and support of dance classes. The questions were:

-   How do you view dance?

-   How do you work collaboratively with the dance teachers in their school?

-   What kinds of support do you provide for the dance classes?

After interviewing the two main participants and the secondary participants, I transcribed their answers and comments. I then subsequently asked participants to review the transcripts to make sure I had transcribed their comments correctly and to give them opportunities to provide additional input, clarifications, and corrections.

Document Analysis

Document analysis includes both teacher and school documentation. The teachers' documents included teaching materials, the written teaching philosophy, and the students' work. The schools' documents included state and local standards, demographic data of students, history, and school philosophy. I studied the school document, *Informal Education Expansion,* published online in the Indianola Informal Elementary School website. In the course of conducting school document, I also conducted email communications.

Reflective Journaling

In my journal reflections, I position myself as a dance teacher from Indonesia, and a non-permanent alien-resident in the U.S. Throughout the research process, I maintained journals that included field notes from my observations, ideas, problems that arose, reactions, and questions. I also kept track of important issues from my readings and my experiences. Data from the journals were used to triangulate with data from observations and interviews.

Data Analysis and Interpretation

Stake (1995) explains that "analysis is a matter of giving meaning to first impressions as well as to final compilations" (p. 71). From the time that I first collected data, I began to analyze them. The major analysis emerges from a complex combination of data and experiences from observations, interviews, document study, reflective journals, audio recording, and email communications. In a qualitative study,

interpretation is a major part of all phases of the research process, and represents my attempt to make the data more meaningful. Analyzing and interpreting findings are a process that carries great responsibility and the need for integrity and honesty is an imperative, I have taken seriously.

At this time, to check my own subjectivity and ensure the trustworthiness of my findings, I used coding data. According to Schwandt (2001), "coding is a procedure that disaggregates the data, breaks it down into manageable segments, and identifies or names those segments…. [C]oding is often classified as relatively descriptive or analytical and explanatory depending on the degree of interpretation involved" (p. 26). Coding is always used by grounded theorists to begin defining and categorizing their data and developing theory (Charmaz, 2000, p. 515). Stake (2000) suggests that coding can help the researcher manage the complexity of the data. In my research, coding data was used in reading texts, field notes, interviews, and documents. From the data, I categorized codes, such as theory, goal, philosophy, curriculum content, pedagogy, and collaboration.

These categories helped me to answer the following research questions:

- Do the theories, goals, curricula, and pedagogy of multicultural education from educational literature in the U.S. provide useful suggestions for promoting multicultural dance education in the Indonesian context?

- Is the implementation of multicultural education in teaching dance in the U.S. concerning teachers' philosophy, pedagogy, curriculum content, classroom management, commitment, collaboration and the context of the schools useful to multicultural dance education in Indonesia?

The sub questions are as follows:

68

- How and why might the theory of multicultural education and key concepts be appropriate or not appropriate in an Indonesian context?

- How and why is the curriculum content appropriate or not appropriate for the Indonesian context?

- How and why is the pedagogical approach appropriate or not appropriate to the Indonesian context?

I then triangulated my analysis and interpretation of data and intertextually analyzed this case study data with my literature review of theories of multicultural education in the U.S., and dance education.

Writing a Research Report

Richardson (2000) states that "writing is not just a mopping-up activity at the end of a research project. Writing is also a way of 'knowing' – a method of discovery and analysis" (p. 923). In this sense, a written research report is similar to the process of analyzing and interpreting data. Stake (2000) suggests that researchers can lead readers to learn more about the case or the phenomenon. In the writing process, the researchers can engage both their own multiple and complex selves and their audience. Therefore, during the writing process, I simultaneously analyzed and interpreted the data and incorporated them with my experiences as researcher and as dance teacher.

Summary

The purpose of Chapter 3 was to explain the methodology and methods employed in my qualitative research. My research design combined Stake's (1995) ideas about collective case studies and Yin's (2003) formulation an empirical inquiry. Both research

theorists' ideas aim to examine cases that support the researcher's understanding of a contemporary phenomenon or issue. I applied these theories as reviewed the literature on multicultural education and dance in the U.S., and conducted my case studies of two dance teachers in the Columbus public schools in Ohio.

This research aimed to answer the following research question: What aspects of American experience with multicultural education are helpful in promoting multicultural dance education in Indonesia? Data collection employed the following techniques: participant observation, interviews, document analysis, and journal reflections. To establish validity and trustworthiness in the process of data analysis, I triangulated my findings, conducted member checks, and cross analyzed evidence from my multiple forms of data collection.