

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS

This chapter contains the conclusions and suggestions of this study. Conclusions covers the summary of the findings and discussion in the previous chapter. Suggestions provides details in this study that could be further improved, as well as recommendations for further researches in similar field.

5.1. Conclusions

This study focuses on analyzing the multimodality of Indonesian cigarette advertisements. Specifically, how the visual and verbal modes on the cigarette advertisements are used by the advertisers to convey a range of messages. This study uses three theories, namely Cheong's (2004) generic structure potential of printed advertisements and her framework of bi-directional transaction of meaning, Kress and van Leeuwen's (2006) visual grammar, and Halliday's (2014) systemic functional linguistics. Cheong's (2004) generic structure potential is used to determine which element in the advertisement belongs to linguistic or visual image component. After the elements has been properly categorized, Halliday's (2014) transitivity system is applied to reveal the linguistic elements' ideational meaning, while Kress and van Leeuwen's (2006) visual grammar is applied on the visual image element to reveal its representational meaning. Once the range of meanings of individual elements has been revealed, Cheong's framework of bi-directional transaction of meaning is applied in order to reveal how the linguistic and visual image element interacts, and what range of meanings result from the interaction.

The analysis reveals that the visual and verbal elements works together to convey meanings that can be summarized into three categories. These categories are not mutually exclusive; in other words, one advertisement can have these three meanings in some way or another, or put a focus on just one. The three categories can be summarized as follows:

1. *Representing the brand/cigarette as a trait of a certain a person or groups of people.*

While the advertisement did not explicitly show the product, it still shows the kinds of people that the brand associate itself with. A *Mild* cigarette brand, for example, establishes itself as a down-to-earth and socially conscious brand through the use of informal language and its critique of social trends. All in all, both the linguistic and visual image element of the *A Mild* advertisement creates an image that the brand is close to the audience and is aware of what is currently happening. On the other hand, *Djarum Super* and *LA Bold* paints itself as an exclusive brand, aimed for ‘bold’ and presumably middle to high class audience. *Djarum Super* and *LA Bold* achieves this image of their brand due to the use of linguistic and visual image elements; the linguistic elements are written in English rather than Bahasa Indonesia (which would alienate audiences that are unfamiliar with the language), and the visual image are showing actions, particularly extreme sports, that are unable to be done by the average Indonesian.

2. *Representing the idealized version of the audience/users of the cigarette.*

Aside from using the linguistic and verbal elements to establish the brand’s values, the advertisements also uses it to illustrate the idealized version of their users, or the potential customers among the audience. Advertisements such as *Gudang Garam International*, *Gudang Garam Signature*, and *Dji Sam Soe Magnum Filter* uses various techniques to depict what the audience/potential customer can become once they use their products.

3. *Symbolizing the brand’s quality compared to other items/person.*

Three advertisements in this study, which are *Clas Mild Silver*, *Gudang Garam Merah*, and *Dji Sam Soe Super Premium*, uses linguistic and visual image elements to symbolize their cigarette’s quality. *Clas Mild Silver* uses personification of the LoA and the traits of the announcements to show the cigarette’s light but strong taste, *Gudang Garam Merah* uses batteries and statements from the announcement to symbolize the cigarette’s longer-lasting

qualities, and *Dji Sam Soe Super Premium* uses the LoA and the announcement to symbolically show the premium-level quality of their products.

Furthermore, the study also found that not every linguistic nor visual image elements commonly found on other advertisements are present. Among linguistic elements, primary announcement is always used, but secondary announcement, the slogan part of the emblem, enhancer, and tags are only used occasionally. Call-and-visit information are not present at all, instead replaced by warning label—an element unique among cigarette advertisements. Among visual image elements, lead and emblem are always present, but the display is always implicit: incongruent among all cigarette advertisements. This reveals that among all the elements, lead, primary announcement, and emblem are the most important part of cigarette advertisements.

After analyzing the linguistic elements using transitivity analysis, it is revealed that the advertisements has different processes, but some are more common than others. The transitivity processes that can be found among the advertisements are relational, mental, and material processes, with relational and material process as the most common. Another notable aspect in the linguistic elements is that most of the processes lacks key participants. For example, in *Djarum Super*, the mental process lacks a phenomena. On the other hand, analyzing the visual image elements through visual grammar reveals that the elements have different representational meaning. Narrative process seems to be more commonly used compared to other processes.

After analyzing the linguistic and visual elements in isolation through transitivity and visual grammar, the elements are then analyzed through Cheong's framework of bi-directional transaction of meaning. This framework consists of four steps. First, the framework is started by the most salient element in isolation. For eight out of nine advertisement, this belongs to the lead. This means that whatever meaning the lead contains—such as the representational meaning that has been previously revealed—becomes the advertisement's initial range of meanings. The same goes if the most salient element is the announcement, as can be seen on *Djarum Super* advertisement. Whatever meaning the announcement has, becomes

the advertisement's initial range of meanings. These range of meanings will then be modified in Step 2, where other elements began to be involved.

Step 2 involves the announcement (or the lead, if the announcement is the one involved in the first step), and where the interaction between two different modes began. Step two consists of two sub-steps, where each element contextualize and influence each other. From the findings, it can be said that relational process always happened as a result of this interaction, although material process happens as well. As a result of step two, the lead becomes an illustration of what the announcement are stating, as well as becoming the 'missing key participant' on announcements that has incomplete transitivity process. The meanings that are established in step two becomes the anchor for the entire advertisement; it becomes the range of meanings by which new interpretations is built upon, and it closes off any range of meanings that strays from it.

Following step two is step three, where enhancer is involved in order to give arguments to the audience on why they should buy the product. The enhancer indeed give arguments by stating the price of the product, which gives indication that the product is affordable. However, the enhancer of cigarette advertisements has an additional function; namely in giving hints on what the product actually is. Throughout step 1 and step 2, it is never clear what the product is about. For example, *Gudang Garam International* might as well be an ad about perfumes; *LA Bold* and *Djarum Super* might as well advertise brand new vehicles. It is only through the enhancer that the 'shape' or 'form' of the product is explicitly stated; the product is in the form of sticks and sold per pack. This hint of the product also reveals an additional function of the lead; namely, as implicit:incongruent display. Because of the enhancer, it is now revealed that the lead is meant to represent the product in some way or another. Naturally, this also influence the previously established range of meanings, as all of them has to be related to the product. However, while the enhancer gave hints about the product, ultimately it is still unclear what the product actually is; anything that is in the form of sticks can potentially be the advertised product. Furthermore, enhancer and tag elements is revealed to be an uncommon element among cigarette advertisement, as it can only

be found on two out of nine advertisement. For most of the advertisements, due to the lack of enhancer nor tags, step three is skipped over.

Step four is the final step of Cheong's framework of bi-directional transaction of meaning, and where socio-cultural context is involved. Throughout the current study, the emblem and warning label is considered to be elements involved in step four since they rely on socio-cultural context. It is only through the emblem and the warning label that the audience knows what product the advertisement is promoting, and thus the two elements' involvement heavily influences the range of meanings that has been previously established. For advertisements that lacks enhancer and tag, the lead's additional function as implicit:incongruent display is revealed due to the emblem and warning label.

In summary, this study reveals that cigarette advertisements in Indonesia are able to promote their products in three ways; by representing the brand or cigarette as an identity trait/persona, as a part of the audience that push them to be the best version of themselves, and as a product of quality that could rival luxury items. The advertisements has a unique structure compared to other product advertisement, and the elements are used pretty uniquely by the advertisers. Most notably, the advertisements rely heavily on socio-cultural context, particularly brand knowledge, to make the meanings of the elements related to cigarettes.

5.2. Suggestions

This study has revealed findings regarding the multimodality of Indonesian cigarette advertisements, but it is still far from perfect. There are several aspects in this study that is flawed and still leave something to be desired. There are also aspects that can be improved by further researches. Some of those aspects are as follows:

1. The lack of analysis on the meaning of colors.

Colors can be considered as its own mode since every color can communicate a myriad of meanings (Kress and van Leeuwen, 2002). Throughout this paper, it can be seen that a certain advertisement uses a certain color palette. For example, *Clas Mild Silver* are predominantly blue and white, *Dji Sam Soe Super Premium*

uses black with gold, and *Gudang Garam Merah* as well as *Djarum Super* dominantly uses red. There is a pattern of colors being used by the advertisements, suggesting an intent and meaning behind them. Thus, the use of colors in cigarette advertisements could be further studied.

2. *The surface-level analysis of the meaning of emblems*

This paper revealed that emblem, which is the company logo and icon, plays a big part in helping re-contextualizing the meaning in the advertisement. However, this study only limits the function and meaning of emblem as an identifier of the brand. Simply put, the emblem is considered as a ‘stamp’ or a ‘signature’ that marks an advertisement as belonging to the brand the emblem is representing. This is only one of many functions and meanings of an emblem. Emblems are an important part in establishing identity and brand image, using typography, color, and shapes that are unfortunately outside the scope of this study.

3. *The possible inconsistency of classifying transitivity processes and representational processes.*

In SFL, particularly in transitivity analysis, clauses are categorized into one out of seven processes. While this might sound simple on paper, its application on actual verbal texts are sometimes not as clear cut. Gwilliam and Fontaine (2015) has conducted a study that reveals the problem researchers might face in classifying clauses into transitivity processes, as sometimes the distinction between one process to another is unclear. The issue is also present in this study, as some linguistic elements are relatively vague with the lack of clear participants, and the distinction between which processes it belongs to is rather blurry. Announcements such as “*Berani Coba?*” (Dare to try?) may be considered as mental process by one researcher, but also material process by another. Furthermore, this issue also extends to visual grammar, as it is also a framework inspired by SFL. Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) has acknowledged that it is possible for an image to have multiple processes, but such possibility are not delved deeper in this paper.

4. *The uncertainty of CP, IS, and SE.*

In describing Cheong's (2004) generic structure of printed advertisement in Chapter II, the researcher introduces the concept of Contextualization Propensity (CP), Interpretative Space (IS), and Semantic Effervescence (SE). These concepts are meant to describe the degree of contextualization and the space of audience's interpretation of a printed advertisement. However, there is no specific scale to use as reference, which leads in issues in objectively determining each advertisement's CP, IS, and SE. For example, Cheong (2004) stated that the more element an advertisement have, then the more the advertiser tries to guide the audience's interpretation towards a certain meaning. Therefore, the more elements in an advertisements meant a high CP, which leads to a narrower IS and lower SE. Yet, what is the specific value? How many elements does an advertisement has to have in order to be considered having a high CP? What if the elements present in the advertisement is equally vague and has multiple possible interpretations? These issues are present in this study, and as a result the concept of CP, IS, and SE are mentioned in Chapter II but not explored.