PRESERVICE ENGLISH TEACHERS' BELIEF IN EMPOWERMENT WITH FIVE DIMENSIONS IN THE TEACHING LANGUAGE EDUCATION PROGRAM

Submitted to fulfill one of the requirements of the Doctoral Degree of English Education Program at Sekolah Pascasarjana

By

MAISA

1707663

ENGLISH LANGUAGE EDUCATION PROGRAM

FACULTY OF LANGUAGE AND LITERATURE EDUCATION

UNIVERSITAS PENDIDIKAN BAHASA INDONESIA

2022

MAISA, 2022
PRESERVICE ENGLISH TEACHERS' BELIEF IN EMPOWERMENT WITH FIVE DIMENSIONS IN THE TEACHING LANGUAGE EDUCATION PROGRAM
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

AUTHOR'S DECLARATION

This dissertation comprises only my original work toward the Doctoral of Education Degree. Due acknowledgment has been made in the text to all other material used. The dissertation does not exceed the word length for this degree. No part of this work has been used for the award of another degree.

APPROVAL SHEET DISSERTATION

PRESERVICE TEACHERS' BELIEF IN THE EMPOWERMENT WITH FIVE DIMENSIONS AT THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING PROGRAM

A case study of English Department Students and Teachers in Higher Education Level

Approved by:

Supervisor

Prof. Dr. H. Didi Suherdi., M.Ed

Co-Supervisor

Prof. Bachrudin Musthafa, Ph.D

Examiner I

Prof. Dr. Nenden Srilengkanawati, M.Pd

Examiner II

Dr. Sri Setyarini, M.A.Ling

Board Examiner

Prof. Dr. Rudi Hartono, S.S., M.Pd

ABSTRACT

Recently, empowerment has been a critical component of transformative value, as higher education is an ongoing process of student transformation. Nevertheless, the conservative teaching practices often disempower students, affecting preservice teachers' learning-unlearn-relearn situation. This study investigates the preservice teachers' belief in the empowerment process and how the preservice teachers perceive the belief in English language teaching. It employed a qualitative case study design. Purposive sampling was used to gain the participants' belief in the holistic empowerment process at an English education program in Indonesia. The results indicate that preservice English teachers believe they could be more confident in knowledge dimension than other dimension, especially in technology knowledge. First, most preservice teachers perceive that their teacher knowledge is good, meanwhile the experiential knowledge is moderate. Second, some participants perceive that they have a good learning interest and habit, but they perceive a moderate level of motivation and commitment to learning. Third, most participants perceive that they have good competence, especially communication, critical thinking, collaboration, and creativity during the program. Fourth, most participants perceive that they have a life-changing experience associated with personal growth, such as self-awareness, self-efficacy, and self-direction. Fifth, most participants share similar concerns about technology limitations but attempt to connect to the learning community through online group discussion. Thus, most participants consider that the empowerment process is dynamic and multifaceted and cannot be limited to a single dimension and time, for it requires a lengthy iterative process across multiple elements.

Keywords: student empowerment, teacher knowledge, personal growth, learning community, learning commitment.

TABLE OF CONTENT

TITLE PAGE i
AUTHOR'S DECLARATION i
APPROVAL SHEET DISSERTATION ii
ABSTRACT iii
TABLE OF CONTENT iv
LIST OF TABLES ix
LIST OF FIGURES x
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.1 Background of the Study 1
1.2 Research Questions 3
1.3 Research Objectives 4
1.4 Scope of the Study 4
1.5 Significance of the Study 4
1.6 Cclarification of the key terms 5
1.7 Organization of the dissertation 5
CHAPTER II LITERATURE REVIEW 7
2.1 The Belief System 7
2.1.1 Definition of Belief System 7
2.1.2 The Nature of Language Teachers; Belief 8
2.1.3 The Bases of Teachers' Belief 9
2.2 English as a Foreign Language Teacher Education 11
2.2.1 Development of EFL Teacher Education 11
2.2.2 Approaches of EFL Teacher Education 13
2.2.3 The Principles of Preservice EFL Teacher Education 14
2.3 Empowerment: Definition and Development 15
2.3.1 Definition of Empowerment 15
2.3.2 Development of Empowerment Concept 18
2.3.3 Empowerment in The EFL Teacher Education Context 23

2.4 Conceptualizing Preservice English Teacher empowerment with Five Dimensions (PETE-FD) 26
2.4.1 Knowledge Dimension of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment (KD-PETE) 28
2.4.1.1 Teacher Knowledge 29
2.4.1.2 Experiential Knowledge 32
2.4.2 Learning Dimension of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment (LD-PETE) 34
2.4.2.1 Interest in Learning English 35
2.4.2.2 Motivation in Learning English 35
2.4.2.3 Habit in Learning English 36
2.4.2.4 Commitment in Learning English 36
2.4.3 Competence Dimension of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment (CD-PETE) 38
2.4.3.1 Communication 39
2.4.3.2 Critical thinking 40
2.4.3.3 Collaboration 40
2.4.3.4 Creativity and Innovation 41
2.4.4 Personal Growth Dimension of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment (PGD-PETE) 42
2.4.4.1 Self-Awareness 42
2.4.4.2 Self-Efficacy 44
2.4.4.3 Flexibility and Adaptability 45
2.4.4.4 Initiative and Self-Direction 46
2.4.4.5 Productivity and Accountability 47
2.4.4.6 Leadership and Responsibility 47
2.4.5 Communal Classroom Dimension of Preservice Teacher Empowerment (CCD-PETE) 49
2.4.5.1 Definition of communal classroom 49
2.4.5.2 Characteristics of the communal classroom in preservice teacher empowerment 50

2.4.5.3 Connectedness 52
2.4.5.4 Cohesion.....52
2.4.5.5 Trust 53
2.5 Conceptual Framework of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment with Five Dimension (PETE-FD).....54
2.6 Summary of Chapter two 56
CHAPTER III RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 57
3.1 The Research Design.....57
3.2 Setting and Participants of the research 57
3.2.1 The setting of the Research 57
3.2.2 Participants of the Research 58
3.3 Data Collection Method 59
3.3.1 The phase of Data Collection Methods 60
3.3.2 Instrumentation and Triangulation 60
3.3.2.1 Questionnaire 61
3.3.2.2 Interviews and Focus Group Discussion.....72
3.3.2.3 Document Evidence 74
3.3.2.4 Observation 74
3.4 The Method of Data Analysis 76
3.5 Summary Chapter Three 86
CHAPTER IV DATA PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION 87
4.1 The Belief of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment 87
4.2 Dimension of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment.....96
4.2.1 Knowledge Dimension of PETE.....96
4.2.2 Learning Dimension of PETE.....104
4.2.3 Competence Dimension of PETE 109
4.2.4 Personal Growth Dimension of PETE 116
4.2.5 Communal Classroom of PETE.....125
4.3 The Nature of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment 130
4.3.1 The nature of KD-PETE.....137
4.3.1.1 Teacher Knowledge and Experiential Knowledge.....130

4.3.2 The Nature of LD-PETE 132
4.3.2.1 Learning Interest 132
4.3.2.2 Learning Habit 132
4.3.2.3 Learning Motivation.....133
4.3.2.4 Learning Commitment 134
4.3.3 The Nature of CD-PETE.....135
4.3.3.1 Critical Thinking.....135
4.3.3.2 Communication.....137
4.3.3.3 Collaboration.....138
4.3.3.4 Creativity 139
4.3.4 The Nature of PGD-PETE 140
4.3.4.1 Self-awareness.....140
4.3.4.2 Self-efficacy 141
4.3.4.3 Flexibility and Adaptability 142
4.3.4.4 Initiative and Self-Direction.....143
4.3.4.5 Productivity and Accountability 144
4.3.4.6 Responsibility and leadership 145
4.3.5 The Nature of CD-PETE.....146
4.3.5.1 Connectedness 146
4.3.5.2 Cohesion.....147
4.3.5.3 Trust 148
4.4 Summary of Chapter Four.....149
CHAPTER V CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION..... 150
5.1 Conclusion 150
5.2 Implication and Recommendation 152
BIBLIOGRAPHY xi

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Teacher Knowledge 30
Table 2. Research Questions and Data Collection Methods 59
Table 3. Learner Empowerment Scale 61
Table 4. Knowledge Dimension of Preservice English Teacher.....64
Table 5. Learning dimension of student empowerment.....66
Table 7. Competence Dimension of PETE 67
Table 8. Personal Growth Dimension of PETE 69
Table 9. Communal Classroom Dimension of PETE 71
Table 10. Schedule of Focus Group Discussion 73
Table 11. The organization of thematic Analysis 76
Table 12. Data Coding 76
Table 13. Data analysis of Preservice English Teacher Empowerment.....77
Table 14. Data Analysis of Knowledge Dimension of PETE.....79
Table 15. Data analysis of Learning Dimension of PETE.....80
Table 16. The Data analysis of Competence Dimension of PETE 82
Table 17. Data Analysis of Personal Growth Dimension of PETE 83
Table 18. Data Analysis of Communal Classroom of PETE.....86
Table 19. Item Distribution of the Dimensions of PETE.....88
Table 20. The average of PETE scale 91
Table 21. Item Distribution of KD-PETE.....97
Table 22. The average of KD-PETE.....100
Table 23. Item Distribution of LD-PETE 104
Table 24. The average of LD-PETE 107
Table 25. Item Distribution of CD-PETE 110
Table 26. The average of CD-PETE 113
Table 27. Item Distribution of PGD-PETE.....117
Table 28. The average of PGD-PETE.....122
Table 29. Item Distribution of CCD-PETE.....125
Table 30. The average of CCD-PETE.....127

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. The broadening scope of EFLTE.....11
Figure 2. The development of Empowerment.....19
Figure 3. The concept of PETE with Five Dimension (PETE-EFD 28
Figure 4. A Different form of experiential knowledge (taken from Fazey,2006)..33
Figure 5. The Concept KD-PETE 34
Figure 6. The Concept of LD-PETE 38
Figure 7. The Concept of CD-PETE 41
Figure 8. The Concept of PGD-PETE.....48
Figure 9. The Concept of CCD-PETE 54
Figure 10. Conceptual Framework of PETE-EFD 55
Figure 11. PETE scale.....92
Figure 12. GPA of Preservice English Teachers.....94
Figure 13. The PETs' worksheets of videos of English teaching performance 95
Figure 14. The Average Level of KD-PETE 100
Figure 15. The Average Level of LD-PETE.....108
Figure 16. The Average Level of CD-PETE.....114
Figure 17. the Screenshoot of PETs' teaching performance.....116
Figure 18. The Average Level of PDG-PETE 122
Figure 19. The Average Level of CCD-PETE 128
Figure 20. The Preservice English Teacher Empowerment Model 151

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix 1 The Development of Student Empowerment Concept.....165
Appendix 2 Questionnaire Preservice English Teacher Empowerment Scale.....172
Appendix 3 The average score of Empowerement scale and its dimensions 189
Appendix 4 Transcription of FGD 190
Appendix 5 Preservice English Teachers' Portopholio (English Materials) 228

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Aboelkhair, K. G., & Under, S. (2018). Towards teacher's empowerment through teacher professional development programs provided by an ngo dvelopment project: an exploratory study. *Journal of Physical Therapy Science*, 1–144. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.neuropsychologia.2015.07.010%0Ahttp://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.visres.2014.07.001%0Ahttps://doi.org/10.1016/j.humov.2018.08.006%0Ahttp://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/24582474%0Ahttps://doi.org/10.1016/j.gaitpost.2018.12.007%0Ahttps:

Ahmad, M., Badusah, J., Mansor, A. Z., Karim, A. A., Khalid, F., Daud, M. Y., Din, R., & Zulkefle, D. F. (2016). The application of 21st century ict literacy model among teacher trainees. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, *15*(3).

Alikhani, M., & Bagheridoust, E. (2017). The Effect of Group Dynamics-Oriented Instruction on Developing Iranian EFL Learners' Speaking Ability and Willingness to Communicate. *English Language Teaching*, *10*(11). https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n11p44

Alwasilah, A. . (2010). *Pokoknya Studi Kasus. Pendekatan Kualitatif*. Kiblat.

Arrington, J. D. (2014). Creating 21st Century Classrooms: What district level instructional leaders know about leading 21st century learning. *Dissertation White Paper*.

Ashcroft. (1987). *Defusing-empowering-: The What and The Why*.

Bahadoran, H. R., & Nazari, M. (2018). Investigating the effect of empowerment aspects on the competence level and success of primary school principals. *Management Science Letters*, *8*(5), 445–454. https://doi.org/10.5267/j.msl.2018.4.001

Bandura, A. (1989). This Week's Citation Classic - Bandura A. Self-efficacy: toward a unifying theory of behavioral change. *Current Contents*, *20*.

Bandura, A. (2002). Social Cognitive Theory in Cultural Context. *Applied Psychology*, *51*(2), 269–290.

Bandura, A. (2019). *Albert Bandura's concept of Self-efficacy*. 1–7.

Barak, M. (2017). Science Teacher Education in the Twenty-First Century: a Pedagogical Framework for Technology-Integrated Social Constructivism. *Research in Science Education*, *47*(2). https://doi.org/10.1007/s11165-015-9501-y

Barnard-Brak, L., & Shiu, W. (2010). Classroom community scale in the blended learning environment: A psychometric review. *International Journal on E-Learning*, *9*(3), 303–311.

Bedir, H. (2019). Pre-service ELT teachers' beliefs and perceptions on 21st century learning and innovation skills (4Cs). *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, *15*(1). https://doi.org/10.17263/jlls.547718

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2019). Thematic analysis revised. *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling*, *53*(9), 1689–1699.

Broom, C. (2015). Empowering students: Pedagogy that benefits educators and learners. *Citizenship, Social and Economics Education*, *14*(2), 79–86. https://doi.org/10.1177/2047173415597142

Brunton, M., & Jeffrey, L. (2014). Identifying factors that influence the learner empowerment of international students. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, *43*(PB), 321–334. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2014.10.003

Brusic, S. A., & Shearer, K. L. (2014). The ABCs of 21st century skills. *Children's Technology and Engineering*.

Burke, A. (2011). Group Work :How to use group Effectively. *The Journal of Effective Teaching*, *11*(2), 87–95.

Burns, A., & Richard, J. C. (2011). *Pedagogy and Practice n Second Language Teaching* (p. 157).

Cattaneo, L. B., & Chapman, A. R. (2010). The Process of Empowerment: A Model for Use in Research and Practice. *American Psychologist*, *65*(7), 646–659. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0018854

Chai, C. S., Hwee Ling Koh, J., & Teo, Y. H. (2019). Enhancing and Modeling Teachers' Design Beliefs and Efficacy of Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge for 21st Century Quality Learning. *Journal of Educational Computing Research*, *57*(2). https://doi.org/10.1177/0735633117752453

Cheng, M., & Cheng, M. (2016). Student Empowerment and Transformative Quality. *Quality in Higher Education*, 11–23. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6300-666-8_2

Chu, S. K. W., Reynolds, R. B., Tavares, N. J., Notari, M., & Lee, C. W. Y. (2016). 21st century skills development through inquiry-based learning: From theory to practice. In *21st Century Skills Development Through Inquiry-Based Learning: From Theory to Practice*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-10-2481-8

Cole, Field, & H. (2010). Student learning motivation and psychological hardiness: interactive effect on students' reaction to a management class. *Academy of Management Learning and Education*, *2*.

Cope, B., Kalantzis, M., Heron-Hruby, A., Wood, K. D., Mraz, M. E., Keefe, E. B., & Copeland, S. R. (2013). "Multiliteracies": New literacies, new learning. *Research and Practice for Persons with Severe Disabilities*, *24*(3–4), 259–263. https://doi.org/10.2511/027494811800824507

Cresswell, John W.; Poth, C. N. (2016). Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing Among 5 Approaches. *Sage Publication*, 778.

Creswell, J. (2014). *Research design : qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches / John W. Creswell. — 4th ed.* SAGE Publications.

Dağgöl, G. D. (2020). Perceived academic motivation and learner empowerment levels of efl students in Turkish context. *Participatory Educational Research*, *7*(3), 21–37. https://doi.org/10.17275/per.20.33.7.3

Darling-Hammond, L. (2006). Constructing SRst century teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *57*(2).

Dewaele, J.-M., & Dewaele, L. (2017). The dynamic interactions in foreign language classroom anxiety and foreign language enjoyment of pupils aged 12 to 18. A pseudo-longitudinal investigation. *Journal of the European Second Language Association*, *1*(1), 12–22. https://doi.org/10.22599/JESLA.6

Dewey, J. (2001). *Democracy and Education*.

Djamahar, R., Ristanto, R. H., Sartono, N., Ichsan, I. Z., Darmawan, E., & Muhlisin, A. (2019). Empowering Student's Metacognitive Skill through Cirsa Learning. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, *1227*(1). https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1227/1/012001

Dornyei, Z. (2003). *Questionnaires in second language research: Construction, administration, and processing*. Lawrence Earlbaum Associates.

Dörnyei, Z. (2009). The 2010s Communicative language teaching in the 21st century: The "principled communicative approach." *Perspectives*.

Dörnyei, Z., & Murphey, T. (2003). *Group Dynamics in the Language Classroom*. Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511667138

Duhon-Haynes, G. M. (1996). Student Empowerment: Definition, Implication and Strategies for Implementation. *Third World Symposium*, 8.

Elahi Shirvan, M., Rahmani, S., & Sorayyaee, L. (2016). On the exploration of the ecology of English language teachers' personal styles in Iran. *Asian-Pacific Journal of Second and Foreign Language Education*, *1*(1), 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40862-016-0016-5

Emilia, E. (2008). *Menulis Tesis dan Disertasi*. Alfabeta.

Erkmen, B. (2012). Ways to Uncover Teachers' Beliefs. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *47*(1996), 141–146.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.06.628

Eurich, T. (2019). What Self-Awareness Really Is (and How to Cultivate It). *Self-Awareness*, 11–35.

Fazey, I., Fazey, J. A., Salisbury, J. G., Lindenmayer, D. B., & Dovers, S. (2006). The nature and role of experiential knowledge for environmental conservation. *Environmental Conservation*, *33*(1), 1–10. https://doi.org/10.1017/S037689290600275X

Fishbach, A., & Dhar, R. (2005). Goals as excuses or guides: The liberating effect of perceived goal progress on choice. *Journal of Consumer Research*, *32*(3), 370–377. https://doi.org/10.1086/497548

Floris, F. D. (2014). Using Information and Communication Technology (ICT) to Enhance Language Teaching & amp; learning. *TEFLIN Journal*, *25*(2), 139–146. https://doi.org/10.15639/TEFLINJOURNAL.V25I2/139-164

Fortier, A. M. (2017). On (Not) Speaking English: Colonial Legacies in Language Requirements for British Citizenship. *Sociology*. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038517742854

Foster-Fishman, P. G., Salem, D. A., Chibnall, S., Legler, R., & Yapchai, C. (1998). Empirical support for the critical assumptions of empowerment theory. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, *26*(4), 507–536. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1022188805083

Freeman, D. L., & Anderson, M. (2015). *Techniques-Principles-Language-Teaching*.

Freire. (2017). *Pedogogy of the oppressed*. Penguin Books Ltd.

Frymier, A. B., Shulman, G. M., & Houser, M. (1996). The development of a learner empowerment measure. *Communication Education*, *45*(3). https://doi.org/10.1080/03634529609379048

Galajda, D. (2012). TEACHER'S ACTION ZONE IN FACILITATING GROUP DYNAMICS. *Lingvarvm Arena-Vol.3*, *3*, 89–101. https://ler.letras.up.pt/uploads/ficheiros/10951.pdf

Gilakjani, A. P., & Sabouri, N. B. (2017). Teachers' Beliefs in English Language Teaching and Learning: A Review of the Literature. *English Language Teaching*, *10*(4), 78. https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n4p78

Guntern, S., Korpershoek, H., & van der Werf, G. (2017). Benefits of personality characteristics and self-efficacy in the perceived academic achievement of medical students. *Educational Psychology*, *37*(6). https://doi.org/10.1080/01443410.2016.1223277

Guo, L. (2014). Preparing Teachers to Educate for 21st Century Global Citizenship: Envisioning and Enacting. *Journal of Global Citizenship &*

Equity Education, *4*(1), 1–23.

Gut, D. M. (2011). Integrating 21st Century Skills into the Curriculum. In *Bringing Schools into the 21st Century*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-007-0268-4_7

Hamied, F. A. (2017). *Research Methods: A Guide for First-Time Researchers* (D. Sukyadi (ed.); 2017th ed.). UPI Press.

Harvey, L., & Green, D. (1993). *Defining Quality. Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education, 18(1), 9-34.e*. *18*(1), 9–34.

Haryati, S. (2013). *PENDIDIKAN KARAKTER DALAM KURIKULUM 2013 Oleh: Sri Haryati (FKIP-UTM)*.

Hayati, N. (2010). Empowering Non-Native English Speaking Teachers. *TEFLIN Journal, Volume 21, Number 1, February 2010*, *21*(1), 78–89.

Heron-Hruby, A., Wood, K. D., & Mraz, M. E. (2008). Introduction: Possibilities for using a multiliteracies approach with struggling readers. *Reading and Writing Quarterly*, *24*(3), 259–263. https://doi.org/10.1080/10573560802004084

Hoang, N. T. (2015). EFL teachers' perceptions and experiences of blended learning in a Vietnamese university. *Office of Education Research; Faculty of Education*.

Hooks, bell. (2003). *[bell_hooks]_Teaching_Community_A_Pedagogy_of_Hop(b-ok.cc)*. http://93.174.95.29/_ads/312CDC44D4FA37EA675974BBFAEE1816

Insa, L., Gonzalez, J., & Inesta, A. (2016). Discussing employability: Current perspectives and key elements from a bioecological model. *Employee Relations*, *38*(6), 961–974. https://doi.org/10.1108/CDI-08-2016-0135

Johnson, D. C., & Ricento, T. (2013). Conceptual and theoretical perspectives in language planning and policy: Situating the ethnography of language policy. *International Journal of the Sociology of Language*. https://doi.org/10.1515/ijsl-2013-0002

Johnson, D. W., & Johnson, R. T. (2011). " COOPERATIVE LEARNING " *The Encyclopedia of Peace Psychology.*, 11.

Johnson, P. (2009). The 21st Century Skills Movement. *Educational Leadership*. https://doi.org/10.2307/2275617

Joram, E., & Gabriele, A. J. (1998). Preservice teachers' prior beliefs: Transforming obstacles into opportunities. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, *14*(2), 175–191. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0742-051X(97)00035-8

Kaman, K. Z., & Othman, Z. (2016). Validity , Reliability and Triangulation in Case Study Method : An Experience. *Proceedings of the 2nd UUM*

International Qualitative Research Conference (QRC) 2016 24-26 May 2016, Penang, Malaysia, May, 350–356.

Kao, Y. S. (2015). Teachers' Belief and Practices in Teacher-Centered Empowerment Reform in Taiwan. *International Journal for Innovation Education and Research*, *3*(2), 1–16. https://doi.org/10.31686/ijier.vol3.iss2.308

Kervin, L., Comber, B., & Woods, A. (2017a). *Toward a Sociomaterial Understanding of Writing Experiences Incorporating Digital Technology in an Early Childhood Classroom*. *66*, 183–197. https://doi.org/10.1177/2381336917718522

Kervin, L., Comber, B., & Woods, A. (2017b). Toward a Sociomaterial Understanding of Writing Experiences Incorporating Digital Technology in an Early Childhood Classroom. *Literacy Research: Theory, Method, and Practice*. https://doi.org/10.1177/2381336917718522

Khalid, F. (2019). Students' identities and its relationships with their engagement in an online learning community. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, *14*(5), 4–19. https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v14i05.8196

Kivunja, C. (2014a). Do You Want Your Students to Be Job-Ready with 21st Century Skills? Change Pedagogies: A Pedagogical Paradigm Shift from Vygotskyian Social Constructivism to Critical Thinking, Problem Solving and Siemens' Digital Connectivism. *International Journal of Higher Education*. https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v3n3p81

Kivunja, C. (2014b). Innovative Pedagogies in Higher Education to Become Effective Teachers of 21st Century Skills: Unpacking the Learning and Innovations Skills Domain of the New Learning Paradigm. *International Journal of Higher Education*, *3*(4), 37–48. https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v3n4p37

Kivunja, C. (2014c). Teaching Students to Learn and to Work Well with 21st Century Skills: Unpacking the Career and Life Skills Domain of the New Learning Paradigm. *International Journal of Higher Education*, *4*(1). https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v4n1p1

Koehler, M.J., Mishra, Punya., and Cain, W. (2013). What Is Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK). *The Journal of Education, 193*(3), 13–19. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24636917

Kusumoto, Y. (2018). Enhancing critical thinking through active learning. In *Language Learning in Higher Education* (Vol. 8, Issue 1). https://doi.org/10.1515/cercles-2018-0003

Langford, P. E. (2005). *Vygotsky ' s Developmental and*.

Lawrence, J. E., & Tar, U. A. (2018). *Educational Media International Factors*

that influence teachers' adoption and integration of ICT in teaching/learning process Factors that influence teachers' adoption and integration of ICT in teaching/learning process. https://doi.org/10.1080/09523987.2018.1439712

Lord, J., & Hutchison, P. (1993). The process of empowerment: Implications for theory and practice. *Canadian Journal of Community Mental Health*, *12*(1), 5–22. https://doi.org/10.7870/cjcmh-1993-0001

Maisa, Musthafa, B., & Suherdi, D. (2020). Preservice-Teachers' Empowerment through Multiliteracy Pedagogy Approach in the EFL Context during the Covid-19 Pandemic and the New Normal Era. *The Asian ESP Journal*, *17*(7.1), 95–116.

Malm, B. (2009). Towards a new professionalism: Enhancing personal and professional development in teacher education. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, *35*(1), 77–91. https://doi.org/10.1080/02607470802587160

Martin, P. (2010). "They have lost their identity but not gained a British one": Non-traditional multilingual students in higher education in the United Kingdom. *Language and Education*. https://doi.org/10.1080/09500780903194028

Martinez; Soleibe K.J.;Mora R. (n.d.). *No Title*. https://ml2secondlanguageliteracies.wordpress.com/2016/09/29/literacies-a-call-for-teaching-and-learning-in-the-21st-century/

Martinsuo, M., & Turkulainen, V. (2011). Personal commitment, support and progress in doctoral studies. *Studies in Higher Education*, *36*(1), 103–120. https://doi.org/10.1080/03075070903469598

McMillan, D. W., & Chavis, D. M. (1986). Sense of community: A definition and theory. *Journal of Community Psychology*, *14*(1), 6–23. https://doi.org/10.1002/1520-6629(198601)14:1<6::AID-JCOP2290140103>3.0.CO;2-I

Misdi, Hartini, N., Aisyah, S., & Tambunan, A. R. (2019). Mobile-assisted English learning in Indonesian high schools in the covid-19 outbreak: Do students feel empowered? *Proceeding AISELT Annual International Seminar on English Language Teaching*, 114–117.

Murray. (2019a). Empowerment in SHE (sustainability in higher education). In *Sustaiability in Higher Education*.

Murray, J. (2019b). Student Empowerment and Sustainability. *Encyclopedia of Sustainability in Higher Education*, 1–8. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63951-2_365-1

Musthafa, B. (2001). *Judging-Qualitative-Educational-Research-Some-Essential-Criteria-Jurnal-Ilmu-Pendidikan-Agustus-2001.pdf*.

Nagel, D. (2011). Common Core Toolkit Aligns Standards with 21st Century

Skills Framework. *THE Journal*.

Nescolarde-Selva, J., & Usó-Doménech, J. L. (2013). Topological structures of complex belief systems. *Complexity*, *19*. https://doi.org/10.1002/cplx.21476

Nichols, J. D. (2006). Empowerment and relationships: A classroom model to enhance student motivation. *Learning Environments Research*, *9*(2), 149–161. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10984-006-9006-8

Nichols, J. D., & Zhang, G. (2011). Classroom environments and student empowerment: An analysis of elementary and secondary teacher beliefs. *Learning Environments Research*, *14*(3), 229–239. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10984-011-9091-1

Nimkulrat, N. (2016). Introduction: Experiential Knowledge. *DRS2016: Future-Focused Thinking*, *8*, 4–7. https://doi.org/10.21606/drs.2016.607

Ortiz, M. C., & Serrano, L. A. S. (2021). English as a key element in the empowerment of undergraduate ELT female students. *Mextesol Journal*, *45*(1), 1–11.

Page, A. G., & Chahboun, S. (2019). Emerging empowerment of international students: how international student literature has shifted to include the students' voices. *Higher Education*, *78*(5), 871–885. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-019-00375-7

Pajares, F. (1993). Preservice Teachers' Beliefs: A Focus for Teacher Education. *Action in Teacher Education*, *15*(2), 45–54. https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.1993.10734409

Partnership for 21St Century. (2008). 21st Century Skills, Education & Competitiveness. *A Resource and Policy Guide*.

Partnership for 21st Century Learning (P21). (2019). *21ST CENTURY LEARNING FOR EARLY CHILDHOOD - Guide*. 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-33263-0

Partnership for 21st Century Learning Skills. (2011). Framework for 21st Century Learning. *P21 Framework Definitions*. https://doi.org/http://www.21stcenturyskills.org/documents/framework_flyer_updated_jan_09_final-1.pdf

Partnership for 21st Century Skills. (2011). P21 Common Core toolkit: A guide to aligning the Common Core State Standards with the Framework for 21st Century Skills. *Framework*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cam.2012.02.038

Partnership For 21st Century Skills. (2009). P21 Framework Definitions. In *Partnership For 21st Century Skills*. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-291X(02)00578-8

Patton, M. Q. (2014a). *Qualitaive Research & Evaluation Methods*. SAGE

Publications.

Patton, M. Q. (2014b). *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Method*. SAGE Publications.

Phu Quy, P. H. (2017). Group Dynamics: Building a Sense of Belonging in the EFL Classroom. *English Teaching Forum*, *55*(1), 14–21. http://ezproxy.lib.uconn.edu/login?url=https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=EJ1137785&site=ehost-live

R.Forsyth, D. (2012). Group Dyanmics Fifth Edition. In *Counselling for Grief and Bereavement Counselling for grief and bereavement*.

Rappaport, J. (1981). In praise of paradox: A social policy of empowerment over prevention. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, *9*(1), 1–25. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00896357

Rappaport, J. (1987). Terms of empowerment/exemplars of prevention: Toward a theory for community psychology. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, *15*(2), 121–148. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00919275

Rappaport, J. (1995). Empowerment meets narrative: Listening to stories and creating settings. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, *23*(5), 795–807. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02506992

Richards, J. C. (2006). Communicative Language Teaching Paradigm. In *Cambridge University Press* (Vol. 1, Issue 1). https://www.professorjackrichards.com/wp-content/uploads/Richards-Communicative-Language.pdf

Richards, J., Gallo, P., & Renandya, W. (2001). Exploring teachers' beliefs and the processes of change. *The PAC Journal*, *1986*, 47–48. http://aaboori.mshdiau.ac.ir/FavouriteSubjects/exploring-teacher-change.pdf

Rivera, G. (2017). EFL Teacher Empowerment in and out of the classrroom. In *academia.com* (Vol. 6). https://www.academia.edu/33990326/Academia_EFL_Teacher_Empowerment_In_and_Out_of_the_Classroom_doc

Rose, P. (2011). Digital (A)literacy. *E-Learning and Digital Media*. https://doi.org/10.2304/elea.2011.8.3.258

Rovai, A. P. (2002). Development of an instrument to measure classroom community. *Internet and Higher Education*, *5*(3), 197–211. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1096-7516(02)00102-1

Rust, F. O. (1994). THE FIRST YEAR OF TEACHING: IT'S NOT WHAT THEY EXPECTED. *Teaching & Teacher Educalion*, *10*(2), 205–217.

Sakhiyya, Z., Agustien, H. I. R., & Pratama, H. (2018). The reconceptualisation of knowledge base in the pre-service teacher education curriculum: Towards

ELF pedagogy. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, *8*(1), 49–56. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v8i1.11464

Sarica, G. N., & Cavus, N. (2009). New trends in 21st Century English learning. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *1*(1), 439–445. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2009.01.079

Shulman, L. S. (1986). Those who understand: Knowledge Growth in Teaching. *Educational Researcher*, *15*(2), 4–14. http://www.jstor.org/stable/1175860

Silva, E. (2014). Measuring Skills for 21st-Century Learning. *Phi Delta Kappan*. https://doi.org/10.1177/003172170909000905

Skills, T. P. F. 21St C. (2015). P21 Framework For 21st Century Learning. *Framework*.

Spratt, M., Alan, D., & Melani, W. (2005). *Teaching Knowledge Test (TKT) Handbook For Teachers*.

Stone, S. J. (1995). Teaching Strategies: Empowering Teachers, Empowering Children . *Childhood Education*, *71*(5), 294–295. https://doi.org/10.1080/00094056.1995.10522625

Suherdi, D. (2019). Teaching English in the industry 4.0 and disruption era: Early lessons from the implementation of SMELT I 4.0 DE in a senior high lab school class. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, *9*(1), 67–75. https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v9i1.16418

Sulistyo, G. H., Rachmajanti, S., Suharyadi, M., & Muniroh, S. (2018). *Empowering Teachers' Professionalism for Students' Better Learning through Reflective Training: A Theoretical Framework for Sustainable EFL Teacher Professional Development*. *January 2018*. https://doi.org/10.2991/icli-17.2018.24

Sullivan, A. M. (1996). The Nature of Student Empowerment. *Self-Concept Research: Driving International Research Agendas The*, *February*, 1–11.

Suwarsih, M. (2007). Empowering EFL teachers to achieve Professional Autonomy. *Proceeding JETA 4th JETA Conference*, *67*(6), 14–21. https://www.rfc-editor.org/rfc/rfc8309.txt%0Ahttp://publicacoes.cardiol.br/portal/ijcs/portugues/2018/v3103/pdf/3103009.pdf%0Ahttp://www.scielo.org.co/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S0121-75772018000200067&lng=en&tlng=en&SID=5BQIj3a2MLaWUV4OizE%0Ahttp:

Tan, J. P. L., Choo, S. S., Kang, T., & Liem, G. A. D. (2017). Educating for twenty-first century competencies and future-ready learners: research perspectives from Singapore. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, *37*(4). https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2017.1405475

Tican, C., & Deniz, S. (2019). Pre-service teachers' opinions about the use of 21st century learner and 21st century teacher skills. *European Journal of Educational Research*, *8*(1). https://doi.org/10.12973/eu-jer.8.1.181

Trilling, B., & Fadel, C. (2009). 21st Century Learning Skills. In *Jossey-Bass*. https://doi.org/10.1145/1719292.1730970

Tsai, C. L., Chaichanasakul, A., Zhao, R., Flores, L. Y., & Lopez, S. J. (2014). Development and Validation of the Strengths Self-Efficacy Scale (SSES). *Journal of Career Assessment*, *22*(2), 221–232. https://doi.org/10.1177/1069072713493761

Van Roekel, D. (2014). Preparing 21st Century Students for a Global Society: An Educator ' s Guide to the " Four Cs ." In *National Education Association*.

Walker, C. (2019). Classroom Dynamics – Kindle Edition. *RELC Journal*, *50*(1), 210–211. https://doi.org/10.1177/0033688217730146

Ward, E. R. (2009). Contributing factors to the learning of altruism and instruction in the classroom: The grounded theory of fourth and fifth grade educators. *Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences*, *70*(6-A), 1927. http://www.redi-bw.de/db/ebsco.php/search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx%3Fdirect%3Dtrue%26db%3Dpsyh%26AN%3D2009-99231-264%26site%3Dehost-live

What, T., Author, W., Source, L. A., Council, N., Url, E. S., & Linked, U. T. C. R. (2016). *Language Arts,*. *64*(2), 142–156.

Wulandari, D., Arifin, S., Cahyono, E., Kusumawardani, S. S., Hertono, G. F., & Wastutiningsih, S. P. (2021). *Program Bantuan Program Studi Menjadi Model Centre of Excellence Meredeka Belajar-Kampus Merdeka*. 17.

Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (Sixth). SAGE Publications. https://doi.org/10.1177/109634809702100108

Zimmerman. (2010). *Empowerment is the enhancement of well-being through support of the natural inclination to strive for positive change*.

Zimmerman, B. J., Bandura, A., & Martinez-Pons, M. (1992). Self-Motivation for Academic Attainment: The Role of Self-Efficacy Beliefs and Personal Goal Setting. *American Educational Research Journal*, *29*(3), 663–676. https://doi.org/10.3102/00028312029003663

Zimmerman, W. A., Knight, S. L., Favre, D. E., & Ikhlef, A. (2017). Effect of professional development on teaching behaviors and efficacy in Qatari educational reforms. *Teacher Development*, *21*(2), 324–345. https://doi.org/10.1080/13664530.2016.1243571