

## **CHAPTER V**

### **DISCUSSION OF ANALYSES OF STUDENTS' TEXTS, INTERVIEW AND OBSERVATION**

#### **5.1 Introduction**

This chapter presents three sections of discussions related to the students' Report texts, the result of observation and the result of interview with the students. The first section presents the detailed analyses of sample texts collected as part of the teaching program in the three teaching cycles. The second section presents the data from interview with the students. The third section presents the data from observation.

In the following discussions of texts, the elements of schematic structure of the texts are shown first. The discussion about linguistic features and grammatical analyses will also be revealed as Emilia (2005, p. 164, cited from Creighton 1997, p. 442) suggests that the objects of the grammatical analyses are among others: (i) to demonstrate the grammatical resources in which the genre is realized, (ii) to reveal the extent to which the text is a successful instance of the genre, and (iii) to evaluate the evidence of any Critical Thinking or "higher level thinking skills" and Critical Literacy capacities. A complete analysis of Theme and Transitivity of all texts mentioned in this chapter can be found in Appendixes 2 and 3.

#### **5.2 Analyses of the Students' Report Texts**

##### **5.2.1 Analyses of Texts 5.1-5.3**

This section discusses the analysis of Students' Report texts. The texts (Text 5.1-5.3) were written by three junior high school students – Adi, Ani and Ela (all pseudonyms) – from the same class. Text 5.1 was written by Adi, a student categorized as a high achiever. Through the text, he describes and classifies about an entire class of Dolphins. Text 5.2 was composed by Ani, a student categorized as a high achiever. She presents information by classifying and describing the

characteristics of African Catfish. Text 5.3 was provided by Ela, a student categorized as a high achiever. Through the text, she talks about a whole class of Lizards by giving generalized information and characteristics of Lizards.

### 5.2.1.1 The schematic structure and the purpose of Texts 5.1-5.3

Text 5.1, written by a high achiever student, will be presented in Table 5.1.

Text 5.2 and Text 5.3 can be seen in Appendix 14.

**Table 5.1 A sample of Report text at the stage Independent Construction of the Text (Text 5.1)**

<b>Schematic Structure</b>	<b>Title: DOLPHINS</b>
<b>General Classification</b>	Dolphins are sea mammals.
<b>Description of behavior</b>	They breathe air like whales. Some species of dolphins can swim so fast.
<b>Description of habitat</b>	They live in colony. Dolphins are (the) smartest animal in the sea, (.)
<b>Description of behavior</b>	they (They) usually help some people, if they loose (get lost) their way at sea. Dolphins are so friendly. Dolphins usually jump to water surface or to air for breathing.
<b>Description of physical appearance</b>	Dolphin's body is so smooth,(.) it (It) has a tail like a whale and a single nostril. They have some little teeth, their mouth is like "Baseball Stick", and they have a fin on their body like a shark.
<b>Description of food</b>	Dolphins eat a small fish.

Texts 5.1 - 5.3 are examples of Report texts that describe and classify about an entire class of things. The writers introduce the topic and give some general identifying information. The writers then divide the information into categories in order of importance. The five main categories have then been subdivided. From the three texts above, it can be seen that the texts have the obligatory elements of a Report

text as suggested by Butt et al (2000), Callaghan & Rothery (1988), Derewianka (2004), Emilia (2012), Gerot & Wignell (1994, p. 54), Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), Joyze and Feez (2004). The obligatory elements of a Report are:

√ **General classification:** In this stage the writers introduce the topic and give some general identifying information to the reader about the characteristics of the animals. The general classification of the texts are among others:

- a. *Dolphins are sea mammals* (Text 5.1).
- b. *African Catfish can live in fresh water that contain(s) microorganism (plankton) such as river, lake and swamp with a height of 0-500 m above sea level* (Text 5.2).
- c. *Lizards are reptiles* (Text 5.3).

√ **Description:** In this stage the writers then divide the information into categories in order of importance. The four main categories have then been subdivided. The four main categories of texts 5.1-5.3 are among others:

- a. Description of habitat
- b. Description of behavior
- c. Description of food
- d. Description of physical appearance

The existence of the elements of the texts can be summed up in the following table.

**Table 5.2 Schematic Structure of Texts 5.1-5.3**

	General Classification	Description
Text 5.1	√	√
Text 5.2	√	√
Text 5.3	√	√

The texts above indicate that the writers had a good control of the schematic structure of a Report text which should have **General Classification** and **Description**.

### 5.2.1.2 Grammatical Analyses of Texts 5.1-5.3

As findings in this chapter, there is some evidence that the students did succeed in mastering the target report genre, although as will be shown later, the texts still have grammatical mistakes (the correction to the grammatical mistakes in the texts is provided in brackets). The students' successions in mastering the target Report genre are among others:

- √ **Participants**, as stated by Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), are people or things that involve in the process of doing, sensing, being and saying or carry out the actions and behaviours. Participants can be identified in a clause by first finding the process, and then asking the probe question '*who or what?*' in relation to that process. The most common grammatical form of participants is the *noun group*. As Report text uses generalized participants, the noun group used in Report is also general nouns. In this Report text, the writer of Text 5.1 has chosen *Dolphins* to refer to all dolphins, the writer of Text 5.2 has chosen *African Catfish* to refer to all African Catfish, and the writer of Text 5.3 has chosen *Lizards* to refer to all lizards. The three writers keep using the same general nouns throughout the whole Report. It indicates that the writers have awareness of the importance of using the same general nouns throughout the whole Report as suggested by Joyce and Feez (2004, p. 127).
- √ **Present Tense**: The Report texts above tell us things about animals (*Dolphins, African Catfish and Lizards*) which are always true. Therefore the writer uses the universal or timeless present tense. The writer of Text 5.1 has chosen to refer to all dolphins with the plural noun group, so most of the verbs are plural. Text 5.2 The writer of Text 5.2 has chosen to refer to all African catfish with the singular noun group, so most of the verbs are singular. The writer of Text 5.3 has chosen

plural noun group for all the verbs in her text. The present tense verbs used in the text are among others:

Text 5.1 : *Dolphins are sea mammals; They breathe air like whales; Some species of dolphins can swim so fast; They live in colony; Dolphins are (the) smartest animal in the sea;*

Text 5.2 : *African Catfish can live in fresh water that contain(s) microorganism...; His skin is smooth and it has scales; It has "patil" in the pectoral (pectoral) fin and (a) wide mouth around it; etc.*

Text 5.3 : *Lizards are reptiles; They live on land; They catch mosquitos by using their long tongue; They have a special identity; etc.*

√ **Linking verbs or Relational process or 'being' and 'having'**

**processes:** Linking verbs or Relational process link different things in clauses or relate one part of the clause to another. In Report, according to Butt et al (2000), Callaghan & Rothery (1988), Derewianka (2004), Emilia (2012), Gerot & Wignell (1994, p. 54), Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), relational processes are often found because they are particularly important for building definitions and descriptions and also for classifying and evaluating phenomena. In the three Report texts above, the writers are successful in using many linking verbs or Relational processes because they know that they try to form a link between bits of information. The writers of Texts 5.1 and 5.3 begin the Report by using a single clause with a linking verb to join two noun groups: *Dolphins are sea mammals; Lizards are reptiles.* There are some other examples of clauses with linking verbs, among others:

Text 5.1 : *Dolphins are (the) smartest animal in the sea; Dolphins are so friendly; Dolphin' s body is so smooth; It has a tail like a whale and a single nostril; They have some little teeth, their mouth is like "Baseball Stick", and they have a fin on their body like a shark.*

Text 5.2 : *His skin is smooth and it has scales; His food is zooplankton and etc; It has “patil” in the pectoral (pectoral) fin and (a) wide mouth around it.*

Text 5.3 : *Lizards are reptiles; And there are some lizards (that) can walk on water; That lizards are well-known as scaly lizards; They have a special identity; Lizards have two bulgy eyes.*

- √ **Possessive pronouns** : The writer successfully use possessive pronouns in appropriate places, such as:

Text 5.1 : *Dolphin’s body is so smooth.*

Text 5.2 : *His skin is smooth and it has scales; His food is zooplankton and etc.*

Text 5.3 : *The lizards can still alive although their tail is broken, because they can cut their tail to protect from enemies.*

- √ **Lexical cohesion through the use of Reference:** This can be seen in some expressions below:

Text 5.1 : *Dolphins are sea mammals. They breathe air like whales.*

Text 5.2 : *African Catfish can live in fresh water.... It has “patil” in the pectoral (pectoral) fin and a wide mouth around it.*

Text 5.3 : *Lizards are reptiles. They live on land. They catch mosquitos by using their long tongue.*

- √ **Modality:** The use of modality, although it does not occur frequently, can be “indicative of acknowledgement of interpersonal relationship and the social structures governing appropriacy of language” (Amstrong, 2009, p. 148, cited in Emilia, 2010, p. 119). The examples of modality can be seen below.

Text 5.1 : *Some species of dolphins can swim so fast.*

Text 5.2 : *African Catfish can live in fresh water...; ...that can be used to search food.*

Text 5.3 : *...that they can walk on the roof...; (that) can walk on water; The lizards can still alive although their tail is broken, because they can cut their tail to protect from enemies.*

- √ **Technical vocabularies/participants:** The text above includes a number of technical terms in order to make the text as clear and precise as possible and to

refer concisely and unambiguously to some phenomenon (Derewianka, 2004, p. 56; Humphrey, Droga & Feez, 2012). The technical terms found in the text above are among others:

Text 5.1 : *dolphins, mammals, species, colony, fin.*

Text 5.2 : *African Catfish, microorganism (plankton), sea level, scales, pectoral fin, zooplankton.*

Text 5.3 : *lizards, reptiles, bulgy eyes, scaly lizards.*

√ **Compound sentence:** Compound sentence consists of two or more independent clauses, each having equal status. It also usually uses one or more coordinating conjunctions (*and, but, or, so*) to combine the clauses into compound sentences (Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012). The sentences are as follows:

Text 5.1 : *They have some little teeth, their mouth is like “Baseball Stick”, and they have a fin on their body like a shark.*

Text 5.2 : *His skin is smooth and it has scales.*

√ **Complex sentence:** Complex sentence uses one or more subordinating conjunctions (*when, after, because, if, although*) to combine the clauses. The sentences can be seen below.

Text 5.1 : *They usually help some people, if they loose (get lost) their way at sea.*

Text 5.3 : *...they can walk on the wall or on the roof of a house Because (because) they have a kind of glue on their feet; The lizards can still alive although their tail is broken, because they can cut their tail to protect from enemies.*

From the analysis of language features, in general the three writers had already a good control of language features to write a Report text. They showed successful use of different linguistic resources.

Textually, the writers begin the clause by giving information about the topic of the clause. The information in the first element in the clause is called a Theme which

is the point of departure or the starting point of the message: what the clause is going to be about. The writers of Texts 5.1-5.3 uses several unmarked Topical Theme realized in participants. The Topical Theme in the texts is called unmarked Topical Theme if the first topical element of a declarative clause is also the Subject of the clause (Eggins, 2004; Emilia, 2010) such as:

Text 5.1 : *Dolphins are sea mammal.*

Text 5.2 : *African Catfish can live...*

Text 5.3 : *Lizards are reptiles.*

The thematic progression found in the students' texts are *theme reiteration*.

The theme reiteration enters into relation in which the same element occurs regularly as Themes. The theme reiteration of the students' texts can be observed as follow:

Theme reiteration in Text 5.1:

*Dolphins are sea mammals.*



*They breathe air like whales. Some species of dolphins can swim so fast.*



*They live in colony.*

Theme reiteration in Text 5.2:

*African Catfish can live in fresh water...*



*It has "patil" in the pectoral (pectoral) fin and (a) wide mouth around it.*

Theme reiteration in Text 5.3:

*Lizards are reptiles.*



*They live on land.*



*They catch mosquitos by using their long tongue.*

Experientially, as can be shown in Table 5.5, four types of processes are used in the element: material, mental, existential and relational (this time and henceforth categorized and presented in two columns: Intensive and Circ, Cause, and Possessive). Material processes, to build aspects of the field, can be seen in *some species of dolphins can swim so fast* (Text 5.1); *African catfish swims actively for searching*



*food at night* (Text 5.2); *they catch mosquitos by using their long tongue*(Text 5.3). Relational processes are realized in attributive processes: *dolphins are sea mammals* (Text 5.1); *his skin is smooth* (Text 5.2); *lizards are reptiles* (Text 5.3). Another relational processes are realized in identifying process: *dolphins are the smartest animal* (Text 5.1). Another relational processes are realized in possessive processes: *they have some little teeth* (Text 5.1); *it has scales* (Text 5.2); *they have special identity* (Text 5.3). The element uses behavioural processes, occurring in *they breathe air like whales* (Text 5.1); *African catfish can live in fresh water* (Text 5.2); *they live on land* (Text 5.3). Finally, the existential processes are realized in *there are four pairs of long hairs* (Text 5.2); *and there are some lizards* (Text 5.3).

**Table 5.3 Process Types Employed in the Texts 5.1-5.3**

Process types	Material	Mental	Verbal	Intensive	Circumstance, Cause, and Possessive	Behavioral	Existential
Text 5.1	4			6	3	2	
Text 5.2	3			2	3	1	1
Text 5.3	5			4	3	3	1
Total	12			12	9	6	2

Interpersonally, the element uses some modality: *some species of dolphins can swim so fast*(Text 5.1); *African catfish can live in fresh water*(Text 5.2); *because they can cut their tail* (Text 5.3).

### 5.2.2 Analyses of Texts 5.4-5.6

This section discusses the analysis of Students' Report texts. The texts (Texts 5.4-5.6) are provided by three junior high school students – Ina, Nur and Anti (all pseudonyms) – from the same class. They are all categorized as middle achievers. Text 5.4 written by Ina describes and classifies about an entire class of fish. Text 5.5 was composed by Ani, presenting information by classifying and describing the characteristics of bats. Text 5.6 provided by Ela describes a whole class of rabbits.

### 5.2.2.1 The schematic structure and the purpose of Texts 5.4-5.6

Text 5.4, written by a middle achiever student, will be presented below in Table 5.4. Text 5.5 and Text 5.6 can be seen in Appendix 15.

**Table 5.4 A sample of Report text at the stage Independent Construction of the Text (Text 5.4)**

<b>Schematic Structure</b>	<b>Title: FISH</b>
<b>General Classification</b>	Fishes (Fish/Fishes) is (are) invertebrates, (.) (Their) body consists of head, body and tail.
<b>Description of habitat</b>	They live in the water and swim by using fins.
<b>Description of physical appearance</b>	They have scales to cover their bodies, (.) they (They) also have some fins, (: ) fins side (side fins) to balance and rear fins to push in order to swim fast. Their (They have) oval shape and has (have) a tail like a pair of oars.
<b>Description of food</b>	They feed on plankton, algae and bentos.
<b>Description of behavior</b>	they (They) like the deep and always be in the dark.

The writers of Texts 5.4-5.6 introduce the topic and give some general identifying information about animals. The writers then divide the information into categories in order of importance. The five main categories have then been subdivided. The three texts above suggest that the texts have the essential elements of a Report text as suggested by Butt et al (2000), Callaghan & Rothery (1988), Derewianka (2004), Emilia (2012), Gerot & Wignell (1994, p. 54), Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), Joyze and Feez (2004). The essential elements of a Report are:

- √ **General classification:** In this stage the writers introduce the topic and give some general identifying information to the reader about the characteristics of the animals. The general classification of the texts are among others:

- a. *Fishes (Fish/Fishes) is (are) invertebrates* (Text 5.4).
- b. *Bats are mammals that can fly* (Text 5.5).
- c. *Rabbits are small mammals* (Text 5.3).

√ **Description:** the information is divided into categories in order of importance.

The four main categories have then been subdivided. The four main categories of texts 5.4-5.6 are among others:

- a. Description of habitat
- b. Description of behavior
- c. Description of food
- d. Description of physical appearance

The existence of the elements of the texts can be summed up in the following table.

**Table 5.5 Schematic Structure of Texts 5.4-5.6**

	General Classification	Description
Text 5.4	√	√
Text 5.5	√	√
Text 5.6	√	√

The table above shows that the writers had a good control of the schematic structure of a Report text which should have **General Classification** and **Description**. Meanwhile, in the next session the linguistic features of Texts 5.4-5.6 will be analyzed to show how the writers effectively use the linguistic features of Report text. The three metafunctions then will be analyzed to see how the writers successfully convey their message.

### 5.2.1.2 Grammatical Analyses of Texts 5.4-5.6

In terms of language features, there are still some grammatical mistakes in the texts (the correction to the grammatical mistakes in the texts is provided in brackets).

However, as findings in this chapter, there is some evidence that the students did succeed in mastering the target report genre. These are among others:

√ **Participants:**In Report text, participants that involve in the process of doing, sensing, being and saying or carry out the actions and behaviours are generalized participants. Generalized participants refer to a whole class of things rather than specific participants. The writer of Text 5.4 has chosen *Fishes* to refer to all fishes, the writer of Text 5.5 has chosen *Bats* to refer to allbats, and the writer of Text 5.6 has chosen *Rabbits* to refer to all rabbits. The three writers keep using the same general nouns throughout the whole Report text. It indicates that the writers have successfully used generalized participants in their text as suggested by Joyce and Feez (2004: 127).

√ **Present Tense:** The writers use the universal or timeless present tense to tell us about animals (*Fishes, Bats, Rabbits*) which are always true. The writers of Texts 5.4-5.6 have chosen plural noun group, so most of the verbs are plural. The writers have successfully used present tense as well as subject-verb agreement. The present tense verbs used in the text are among others:

Text 5.4 : *Fishes (Fish/Fishes) is (are) invertebrates; Their body consists of head, body and tail; They live in water and swim by using fins; etc.*

Text 5.5 : *Bats are mammals that can fly; Bats belong to hot blooded animals; Bats are used to sleep during the day.*

Text 5.6 : *Rabbits are small mammals; They are herbivores; They eat grass, leaves and carrots; They have two long ears; etc.*

√ **Linking verbs/Relational process/‘being’ and ‘having’ processes:**

In Report, according to Butt et al (2000), Callaghan & Rothery (1988), Derewianka (2004), Emilia (2012), Gerot & Wignell (1994, p. 54), Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), relational processes are often found because they are

particularly important for building definitions and descriptions and also for classifying and evaluating phenomena. In the three Report texts above, the writers are successful in using many linking verbs or Relational processes because they know that they try to form a link between bits of information. The writers of Texts 5.4-5.6 begin the Report by using a single clause with a linking verb to join two noun groups: There are some other examples of clauses with linking verbs, among others:

Text 5.4 : *Fishes (Fish/Fishes) is (are) invertebrates; They have scales to cover their bodies.*

Text 5.5 : *Bats are mammals that can fly.*

Text 5.6 : *Rabbits are small mammals; They are herbivores; Most of them have two red eyes; They have two long ears; Rabbits have a variety of color (colors).*

√ **Possessive pronouns** : The writer unsuccessfully use possessive pronouns in appropriate places, such as:

Text 5.4 : *(Their) body consists of head, body and tail.*

Text 5.6 : *They have a habit (Their habits are) jumping and running.*

√ **Lexical cohesion through the use of Reference**: This can be seen in some expressions below:

Text 5.4 : *Fishes (Fish/Fishes) is (are) invertebrates,(.) They live in the water and swim by using fins.*

Text 5.5 : *Bats are mammals that can fly. Bats belong to hot blooded animals.*

Text 5.6 : *Rabbits are small mammals. They are herbivores.*

√ **Modality**: The use of modality, although it only occurs in Text 5.5, can be “indicative of acknowledgement of interpersonal relationship and the social structures governing appropriacy of language” (Amstrong, 2009: 148, cited in Emilia, 2010, p. 119). The examples of modality can be seen below.

Text 5.5 : *Bats wings consist of thin membranes that can expand; Bats are mammals that can fly.*

- √ **Technical vocabularies/participants:** The text above includes a number of technical terms in order to make the text as clear and precise as possible and to refer concisely and unambiguously to some phenomenon (Derewianka, 2004, p. 56; Humphrey, Droga & Feez, 2012). The technical terms found in the text above are among others:

Text 5.4 : *fish/fishes, invertebrates, fins, oars, plankton, algae, bentos.*

Text 5.5 : *bats, mammals, hot blooded animals, thin membranes, expand.*

Text 5.6 : *rabbits, mammals, herbivores.*

- √ **Compound sentence:** Compound sentence consists of two or more independent clauses, each having equal status. It also usually uses one or more coordinating conjunctions (*and, but, or, so*) to combine the clauses into compound sentences (Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012). The sentences are as follows:

Text 5.4 : *They live in the water and swim by using fins.*

In general the three writers demonstrated a good control of language features to write a Report text even though the texts only consisted of one paragraph. From the analysis of language features, the texts still have some grammatical mistakes, but if the writers had been given more time to write, to revise, to edit and to proofread the text, these mistakes could probably have been corrected as suggested by Emilia (2010, p. 122). All these suggest that explicit teaching is still needed by the students in terms of grammar and linguistic features relevant to the text in focus.

To show how the writers effectively convey their message and to what extent they are successful in conveying it, the texts will be analyzed by taking into account the three metafunctions of the text: textual, experiential and interpersonal (Eggin, 2004; Emilia, 2010; Halliday, 1994).

Textually, the writers use unmarked topical Theme to help identify the field under discussion, as in:

Text 5.4 : *Fishes (Fish/Fishes) is (are) invertebrates; They have scales to cover their bodies.*

Text 5.5 : *Bats are mammals that can fly.*

Text 5.6 : *Rabbits are small mammals; They are herbivores*

A reference *They* in Text 5.4 and Text 5.6 are then assigned as unmarked topical Theme, to carry the discourse forward and “to build cohesion of the text” (Eggin, 2004)

The thematic progression found in the students’ texts are *theme reiteration*. The theme reiteration enters into relation in which the same element occurs regularly as Themes. The theme reiteration of the students’ texts can be observed as follow:

Theme reiteration in Text 5.4:

*Fishes (Fish/Fishes) is (are) invertebrates.*



*(Their) body consists of head, body and tail.*



*They live in the water and swim by using fins.*



*They have scales to cover their bodies.*

Theme reiteration in Text 5.6:

*Rabbits are small mammals.*



*They are herbivores.*



*They eat grass, leaves and carrots.*

Experientially, four types of processes are used in the element: material, mental, existential and relational (this time and henceforth categorized and presented

in two columns: Intensive and Circ, Cause, and Possessive). The types of processes used in the text can be seen in Table 5.9 below.

**Table 5.6 Process Types Employed in the Texts 5.4-5.6**

Process types	Material	Mental	Verbal	Intensive	Circumstance, Cause, and Possessive	Behavioral	Existential
Text 5.4	6	1		2	5	1	
Text 5.5	3			3		1	
Text 5.6	1			2	4	2	1
Total	10	1		7	9	4	1

Material processes, to build aspects of the field, can be seen in *swim by using fins* (Text 5.4); *bats are actively looking for food at night* (Text 5.5); *they eat grass, leaves and carrots* (Text 5.6). Relational processes are realized in attributive processes: *fishes are invertebrates* (Text 5.4); *bats are mammals* (Text 5.5); *Rabbits are small mammals* (Text 5.6). Another relational processes are realized in possessive processes: *they have scales* (Text 5.4); *they hav two red eyes* (Text 5.6) The element uses behavioural processes, occurring in *they live in the water* (Text 5.4); *bats are used to sleep during the day* (Text 5.5); *they live in the forest* (Text 5.6). Finally, the existential processes are realized in *there are brown, black and white* (Text 5.6).

Interpersonally, the element uses only one modality: *thin membranes that can expand*(Text 5.4).

### 5.2.3 Analyses of Texts 5.7-5.9

This section discusses the analysis of Students' Report texts (Texts 5.7-5.9) which are provided by three junior high school students – Arul, Hendra, Aji (all pseudonyms) – from the same class. They are all categorized as low achievers. Text 5.7 written by Arul describes about an entire class of goat. Text 5.8 composed by Hendra presents information by classifying and describing the characteristics of rabbits. Text 5.9 written by Aji describes about a whole class of rabbits.



### 5.2.3.1 The schematic structure and the purpose of Text 5.7-5.9

Text 5.7, written by a low achiever student, will be presented below in Table 5.7. Text 5.8 and Text 5.9 can be seen in Appendix 16.

**Table 5.7 A sample of Report text at the stage Independent Construction of the Text (Text 5.7)**

<b>Schematic Structure</b>	<b>Title: GOAT</b>
<b>General Classification</b>	Goat is a mamal (mammal).
<b>Description of food</b>	It likes to eat grass.
<b>Description of habitat</b>	It can live on land.
<b>Description of physical appearance</b>	It (Its) colour is white and it's (its) body is big.
<b>Description of behavior</b>	It can make bleating noise.
<b>Description of physical appearance</b>	It has four legs and two small eyes.

The writers of Texts 5.7-5.9 introduce the topic and give some general identifying information about animals. The three texts above suggest that the texts have the essential elements of a Report text as suggested by Butt et al (2000), Callaghan & Rothery (1988), Derewianka (2004), Emilia (2012), Gerot & Wignell (1994, p. 54), Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), Joyze and Feez (2004). The essential elements of a Report are:

√ **General classification:** In this stage the writers introduce the topic and give some general identifying information to the reader about the characteristics of the animals. The general classification of the texts are among others:

- a. *Goat is a mamal (mammal) (Text 5.7).*
- b. *Rabbit is (a) mammal (Text 5.8).*
- c. *Rabbits is (a) mammal that life (lives) on land(Text 5.9).*

√ **Description:** the information is divided into categories in order of importance.

The four main categories have then been subdivided. The four main categories of texts 5.7-5.9 are among others:

- a. Description of habitat
- b. Description of behavior
- c. Description of food
- d. Description of physical appearance

The following table sums up the existence of the elements of the texts.

**Table 5.8 Schematic Structure of Texts 5.7-5.9**

	General Classification	Description
Text 5.7	√	√
Text 5.8	√	√
Text 5.9	√	√

The table above shows that the writers had a good control of the schematic structure of a Report text which should have **General Classification** and **Description**. Text 5.7-5.9 will be analyzed in the next session to show how the writers effectively use the linguistic features of Report text. The three metafunctions then will be analyzed to see how the writers successfully convey their message.

### 5.2.3.2 Grammatical Analyses of Texts 5.7-5.9

In terms of language features, there are still some grammatical mistakes in the texts (the correction to the grammatical mistakes in the texts is provided in brackets). However, as findings in this chapter, there is some evidence that the students did succeed in mastering the target report genre. These are among others:

√ **Participants:** Participants are people or things that involve in the process of doing, sensing, being and saying or carry out the actions and behaviors (Humphrey, Droga & Feez, 2012). The most common grammatical participants used in a Report text are generalized participants. In this Report text, the writer of Text 5.7

has chosen *Goat* to refer to all goat, the writer of Text 5.8 and Text 5.9 have chosen *Rabbit* to refer to all rabbit. The three writers keep using the same generalized participants throughout the whole Report. It indicates that the writers have awareness of the importance of using the same general nouns throughout the whole Report as suggested by Joyce and Feez (2004, p. 127).

- √ **Present Tense:** The writers of Texts 5.7-5.9 use the universal or timeless present tense because they tell us things about animals which are always true. These writers have chosen to refer to all animals (*Goat, Rabbit*) with the singular noun group, so most of the verbs are singular. The present tense verbs used in the text are among others:

Text 5.7 : *Goatis a mamal (mammal); Itlikes to eat grass; Itcanlive on land; It (Its) colouris white and it's (its) bodyis big; Itcan make bleating noise; Ithas four legs and two small eyes.*

Text 5.8 : *Rabbitis (a) mammal; it (It) lives on land; Itlikes to eat carrot and vegetables; Its bodyis small; it (It) has four legs and two circle eyes; Itcan jump high.*

Text 5.9 : *Rabbitis (a) mammal that life (lives) on land; Itlikes to eat carrot; Itlikes to jump; Ithas four legs and two long ears, two circle eyes and (a) short tail; Itlives on land.*

- √ **Linking verbs or Relational process or 'being' and 'having' processes:**

In Report, according to Butt et al (2000), Callaghan & Rothery (1988), Derewianka (2004), Emilia (2012), Gerot & Wignell (1994, p. 54), Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), relational processes are often found because they are particularly important for building definitions and descriptions and also for classifying and evaluating phenomena. In the three Report texts above, the writers are successful in using many linking verbs or Relational processes because they know that they try to link different things in clauses or relate one part of the clause

to another. The writers of Texts 5.7-5.9 begin the Report by using a single clause with a linking verb to join two noun groups: *Goat is a mamal (mammal)* (text 5.7); *Rabbit is (a) mammal* (Text 5.8); *Rabbit is (a) mammal that life (lives) on land* (Text 5.9). There are some other examples of clauses with linking verbs, among others:

Text 5.7 : *It (Its) colour is white and it's (its) body is big; It has four legs and two small eyes.*

Text 5.8 : *Its body is small; it (It) has four legs and two circle eyes.*

Text 5.9 : *It has four legs and two long ears, two circle eyes and (a) short tail.*

- √ **Possessive pronouns** : The writer of Text 5.7 unsuccessfully uses possessive pronouns in appropriate places: *It (Its) colour is white and it's (its) body is big..* The writer of Text 5.8 successfully uses one possessive pronoun: *Its body is small.* The writer of Text 5.9 uses no possessive pronouns at all. They suggest the need for explicit teaching in terms of linguistic features of a Report text more than once for the students (Callaghan and Rothery, 1988; Emilia, 2010, p. 117).

- √ **Lexical cohesion through the use of Reference**: This can be seen in some expressions below:

Text 5.7 : *Goat is a mamal (mammal); It likes to eat grass.*

Text 5.8 : *Rabbit is (a) mammal. it (It) lives on land.*

Text 5.9 : *Rabbit is (a) mammal that life (lives) on land; It likes to eat carrot.*

- √ **Modality**: The use of modality, although it does not occur frequently, can be “indicative of acknowledgement of interpersonal relationship and the social structures governing appropriacy of language” (Amstrong, 2009, p. 148, cited in Emilia, 2010, p. 119). The examples of modality can be seen below.

Text 5.7 : *It can live on land; It can make bleating noise.*

Text 5.8 : *It can jump high.*

- √ **Technical vocabularies/participants:** The text above includes a small number of technical terms. Meanwhile, a Report text needs technical terms in order to make the text as clear and precise as possible and to refer concisely and unambiguously to some phenomenon (Derewianka, 2004, p. 56; Humphrey, Droga & Feez, 2012).

The technical terms found in the text above are among others:

Text 5.7 : *mammal, bleating noise.*

Text 5.8 : *mammal.*

- √ **Compound sentence:** Compound sentence consists of two or more independent clauses, each having equal status. It also usually uses one or more coordinating conjunctions (*and, but, or, so*) to combine the clauses into compound sentences (Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012). From the three texts above, there is only one sentence using compound sentence:

Text 5.7 : *It (Its) colour is white and it's (its) body is big.*

From the analysis of language features, in general the three writers had already a control of language features to write a Report text but they still need more time to write, to revise, to edit and to proofread the text as suggested by Emilia (2010: 122).

Having discussed the schematic structure and linguistic features, the following discussion will now deal with how each of the various metafunctions is realized in each of the element.

Textually, the writers begin the clause by giving information about the topic of the clause. The writers of Texts 5.7-5.9 use several unmarked Topical Theme realized in participants. The Topical Theme in the texts is called unmarked Topical Theme if the first topical element of a declarative clause is also the Subject of the clause (Egins, 2004; Emilia, 2010) such as:

Text 5.7 : *Goat is a mamal (mammal); It likes to eat grass.*

Text 5.8 : *Rabbit is (a) mammal. it (It) lives on land.*

Text 5.9 : *Rabbit is (a) mammal that life (lives) on land; It likes to eat carrot.*

The thematic progression found in the students' texts are *theme reiteration*.

The theme reiteration enters into relation in which the same element occurs regularly as Themes. The theme reiteration of the students' texts can be observed as follow:

Theme reiteration in Text 5.7:

*Goat is a mamal (mammal).*



*It likes to eat grass.*



*It can live on land.*

Theme reiteration in Text 5.8:

*Rabbit is (a) mammal.*



*it (It) lives on land.*



*It likes to eat carrot and vegetables.*

Theme reiteration in Text 5.9:

*Rabbit is (a) mammal that life (lives) on land.*



*It likes to eat carrot.*



*It likes to jump.*

Experientially, as can be shown in Table 5.14, four types of processes are used in the element: material, mental, existential and relational. The following table sums up the existence of the processes of the texts.

**Table 5.9 Process Types Employed in the Texts 5.7-5.9**

Process	Material	Mental	Verbal	Intensive	Circumstance,	Behavioral	Existential
---------	----------	--------	--------	-----------	---------------	------------	-------------

types					Cause, and Possessive		
Text 5.7	2			3	1	1	
Text 5.8	2			2	1	1	
Text 5.9	2			1	1	2	
Total	6			6	3	4	

Material processes, to build aspects of the field, can be seen in *it likes to eat grass* (Text 5.7); *it likes to eat carrot and vegetables* (Text 5.8); *it likes to jump* (Text 5.9). Relational processes are realized in attributive processes: *goat is a mammal (mammal)*; (Text 5.7); *rabbit is (a) mammal* (Text 5.8); *rabbit is (a) mammal that life (lives) on land* (Text 5.9). Another relational processes are realized in possessive processes: *it has four legs and two small eyes* (Text 5.7); *it has four legs and two circle eyes* (Text 5.8); *it has four legs and two long ears, two circle eyes and (a) short tail* (Text 5.9). The element uses behavioral processes, occurring in *it can live on land* (Text 5.7); *it lives on land*(Text 5.8); *it lives on land* (Text 5.3). Finally, the texts have no existential processes.

### 5.3. Conclusion of Texts Analyses

The data from texts analyses show the improvement in writing skills in terms of the schematic structure and linguistic features. It is found that the schematic structure of the texts suggests the students' improvement in constructing a successfully organized text. It is also found that the students could demonstrate their ability to use various linguistic resources to communicate effectively through the texts.

The grammatical analyses of each element of the texts show the students' development in composing the targeted text. Textually, the writers use unmarked topical Theme to help identify the field under discussion and to build cohesion of the text (Eggins, 2004; Emilia, 2010). The thematic progression found in the students' texts are *theme reiteration*. Experientially the texts use four types of processes, which

show the writers' capacity to create a more written-like, more intertextual and multivoiced text (Emilia, 2005, p. 241). Interpersonally the texts 5.1-5.4 use *modality can*. It helps the writer to communicate effectively with the reader.

#### 5.4 Discussion of Interview Data

This section will discuss data from interview which is recognized as a mean to obtain descriptions of the life world of the interviewee with respect to interpreting the meaning of the described phenomena (Kvale, 1996, p. 5). The interview aimed to find out more about students' responses toward the teaching of writing using the Genre Based Approach and its application in improving students' writing ability. The interview was conducted in *bahasa Indonesia*.

Nine students were interviewed after the teaching cycles or at the end of the teaching program. They were all pseudonyms. Three of them, Adi, Ani and Ela (categorized as high achievers) were respectively the writers of Text 5.1, Text 5.2 and Text 5.3. The three students, Ina, Nur and Anti (categorized as middle achievers) were respectively the writers of Text 5.4, Text 5.5 and Text 5.6. The three other students, Arul, Hendra and Aji (categorized as low achievers) were respectively the writers of Text 5.7, Text 5.8 and Text 5.9.

In this study the researcher used a handphone in order to ease the researcher in doing the interview as suggested by Burns (2009, in Heigham & Croker, 2009, p. 120) that the researcher can use handheld audio-recorder to record the responses. In addition, Richards (2003, p. 175) also suggests that this handheld recorder is the right equipment to record individuals or small groups around a table or desk, most people own or have access to one of these and it varies greatly in quality.

The data from the interview were analyzed in steps. The interview questions that can be seen in Appendix 5 were categorized based on the themes in line with the



purposes of the interviews. The data were then classified in line with the central themes and sub theme and presented in a condensed body of information (Kvale, 1996, p. 193) as described in Appendix 6. The interpretation of the interview data will be presented in Section 5.3.1 and Section 5.3.2.

#### **5.4.1 Application of the Genre Based Approach in improving the students' writing ability**

The interview data as can be seen in Appendix 6 indicate that the teaching of writing using the Genre Based Approach has been successful in improving the students' writing ability. All interviewees appeared to get benefit from the program. They said that their writing skills have improved, as represented by Adi's comment (the writer of Text 5.1):

The program has improved my writing skills. It can be seen from my text. My text is long enough. I got a lot of knowledge in terms of grammar and vocabularies. Even though I had written texts when I was in the seventh and eighth grades but I think my writing skill is getting better now.

This comment indicates that the student got benefit from the program. It can be seen from the length of the text in which Adi, as the writer of the text, seemed to succeed in writing a long enough text.

Regarding the length of the text, Arul (the writer of Text 5.7) appeared to be aware that his text was simple and short, but he seemed to succeed in conveying the meaning of the text to the readers, as represented by Arul's comment:

I got a lot of knowledge after joining the program. I can write my own text – a simple text.

The comment suggests that the teaching program can improve the students' ability to write a text. This confirms previous study conducted by Emilia, Hermawan & Tati (2008) which demonstrate that the Genre Based Approach improves the students' ability in writing and it also helps the students to learn English not only in writing but also in other subjects.

The interviewees appeared to succeed in mastering the target Report genre, as represented by Adi's comment:

I've got a lot of knowledge after joining the program, especially about the generic structure and the language features of the text. The teacher explained them well. Whenever I try to write a text, I always consider the generic structure and language features of the text. It helps me to write the text easily.

The comment indicates the student's awareness that the generic structure is an obligatory element of Report text which are suggested by Butt et al (2000), Callaghan & Rothery (1988), Derewianka (2004), Emilia (2012), Gerot & Wignell (1994, p. 54), Christie & Misson (1998, p. 8), Humphrey, Droga & Feez (2012), and Joyce & Feez (2004).

Regarding the language feature, in general all interviewees had already a good control of language features to write a Report text. They showed successful use of different linguistic resources, as represented by Ela (the writer of Text 5.3):

Usually I just wrote a text without considering the structure of the text and the elements of the text. But now with the help of the generic structure and the language feature I can write a text better.

This comment indicates that the program has achieved the goals of the Genre Based Approach as stated by Emilia (2010) that the goals of the GBA are basically to help students become more successful writers (and readers) of academic and workplace texts (Hyon, 1996, p. 700); and to help students make sense of not only the structure of texts but also a wide range of compositional concerns (Brooks, 2002).

Regarding the proofreading and revising the text, it seemed that the teacher and the students could take advantage of a cooperative activity. One student, Ina, seemed to be aware of the importance of the cooperative activity. She said:

The teacher gave advice how to make my text better and then I revised it twice. I also asked my friend to check my text. I needed more time to check and revise my text.

This comment is in line with the suggestion that teachers can encourage students to give feedback to each other or peer review. This peer review or peer feedback is potentially extremely beneficial. The more teachers encourage them to be involved in giving feedback to each other, or to evaluate their own work successfully, the better they will be able to develop as successful writers (see Emilia, 2010, p. 189; Harmer, 2007, p. 150).

In addition, this comment also relates to the basic principles of genre pedagogy as suggested by Halliday (1985, p. 5) and Feez & Joyce (1998) that “language learning is a social activity or a social process, and knowledge is transmitted in social contexts through relationships or collaboration, like those of parent and child, or teacher and pupil, or classmates, that are defined in the value systems and ideology of the culture.” Furthermore, Feez and Joyce (1998, p. 26) propose that learning is a collaboration between teacher and student with the teacher taking on an authoritative role similar to that of an expert supporting an apprentice.

Likewise, Ela (the writer of Text 5.3), shared her process of writing:

The teacher checked my text and then I revised it. I also asked my friend and my sister to check my text. I am afraid I have typed the letter by mistake. I revised my text repeatedly.

Regarding this, it cannot be denied that writing process takes time. The writing process is done in a *recursive* way: we loop backwards and move forwards between the various stages of drafting, reviewing, re-drafting and writing, etc. (Tribble 1996, p. 37-39, cited in Harmer, 2007: 326). This comment is in line with Emilia’s suggestion (2010, p. 122) that although the texts still have some grammatical mistakes, but these mistakes could probably have been corrected if they had been given more time to write, to revise, to edit and to proofread the text.

With regard to the process of producing the texts, all interviewees seemed to have certain problems. Their problem was to do with the time management. They had to cope with tasks from other subjects. They suggested that if the teacher gave them more time to revise and edit their texts, they would have better texts. Arul (a low achiever), for example, said:

Due to the time constraint, I downloaded my first text from the internet. The teacher suggested me to write my own text. Then I wrote my own text. The teacher and one of my friends checked my text. I revised my text twice.

This comment indicates that the student needed more time to the process of writing and would rather finish a piece of writing straight away (Harmer, 2007, p. 326-327). It is suggested that the teacher should be careful in giving the task. The students should write their text at school, they did not allow to take home their tasks.

#### **5.4.2 Students' responses toward the teaching of writing using the Genre Based Approach**

The interview data as can be seen in Appendix 6 indicate that the teaching of writing using the Genre Based Approach was beneficial and enjoyable. All interviewees commented that they could do all the activities at every stage such as Building Knowledge of the Field, Modelling of the Text, Joint Construction of the Text, and Independent Construction of the Text. They also enjoyed the program especially when the teacher played music while they were making a draft and writing a Report text. Ani (a high achiever) said:

The program was enjoyable. Learning English with you was so excited. I like when you played the music. The method was so good. I could write a text, especially a Report text. I have never been good enough in writing, especially when I was in the seventh and eighth grades.

This comment indicates that enjoyable learning is important for students to do the activities as suggested by Harmer (2007, p. 111) that teachers have to organize students to do various activities that are enjoyable, interesting or beneficial. Freire

(1998, p. 88-92, cited in Emilia, 2005) suggests that students' appreciation of the necessity of the acts of teaching, of learning, of studying, which is not only a serious and demanding task but also pleasurable and generates satisfaction in the teacher and students.

In terms of classroom teaching equipment used by the teacher, five students (Adi, Ani, Ela, Ina and Nur) seemed to enjoy PowerPoint as a mean of learning. By contrast, four students (Anti, Arul, Aji and Hendra) seemed to enjoy a whiteboard as a mean of learning.

Regarding the use of PowerPoint, Ani (a high achiever) noted:

I think it will be better if the teacher uses PowerPoint in teaching English. I liked the program because the teacher used PowerPoint. It was more cheerful and more colorful. I was not bored. I liked the moment when the teacher played music.

This relates to Harmer's suggestion (2007, p. 187) that presentation software, such as, PowerPoint, increases our capacity to present visual material (words, graphics and pictures) in a dynamic and interesting way. PowerPoint also offers a more interesting option where we can mix text and visuals with audio/video tracks so that pictures can dissolve or fly onto and off the screen, and music, speech and film can be integrated into the presentation (Harmer, 2007, p. 187). Furthermore he suggests that teachers must be aware that PowerPoint can pose some problems too, it needs electricity and some people may find this kind of animated presentation irksome in its own way.

Regarding the use of a whiteboard, Arul, for example, said:

I think I like a whiteboard better than PowerPoint when the teacher explains the material. The teacher wrote the words up what she said directly. It helped me to understand the material.

This comment is relevant to Harmer's suggestion (2007, p. 183-185) that the most versatile piece of classroom teaching equipment is the board- whether this is of the more traditional chalk-dust variety, a whiteboard written on with marker pens. When teachers write up a word on a board, teachers can show how that word is stressed so that students can see and 'hear' the word at the same time. Furthermore he suggests that a board can also be used for explanation, drawing pictures, writing up fill-in sentences, games, and displaying things.

Regarding the use of *bahasa Indonesia*, all interviewees seemed to agree that *bahasa Indonesia* was important and beneficial in explicit teaching. They suggested that the teacher should combine both *bahasa Indonesia* and English in explaining the material. Ela (a high achiever), for example, said:

I think it's better to explain both in *bahasa Indonesia* and English. I could understand the material because the teacher explained the material both in *bahasa Indonesia* and English.

This comment is relevant to Emilia's suggestion (2005) in her study that the use of L1 in teaching English plays an important role in developing students' language and critical thinking. Furthermore, in her study, Emilia (2005, 2008) said that the use of L1 is very crucial in explicit teaching in which students are able to comprehend the materials and how both languages, Indonesian and English, operate each other to make meaning. The teacher could use Indonesian to help students' understand what was being explained about (Emilia, 2010). Dailey-O'Cain and Liebscher (2009), Harmer (2007), Macaro (2009), and Wigglesworth (2005, as cited by Emilia, 2010) likewise advise that using the students' L1 in the classroom has obvious advantages and can be beneficial.

## 5.5 Discussion of Observation

This section will focus on classroom observation which is recognized as a mean to obtain the descriptions of the detailed examination of students' behavior in a naturalistic setting (Cowie, 2009, p. 166, cited in Heigham and Croker, 2009). The observation in this study included handwritten brief notes and photographs. The observation was conducted in the classroom, the multi media room and in the library. The data from the handwritten brief notes were analyzed based on the themes in line with the purpose of the observation and presented in a condensed body of information as can be seen in Appendix 4. The data from the photographs of the learning activity can be seen in Appendix 9.

The data from the handwritten brief notes and the photograph show that the students enjoy the teaching program and participate in every task actively. At the first time of the teaching program, the students seemed to sit quietly when the teacher gave explanation, but later on they had courage to participate actively in the teaching program. The data show that the teacher made improvement in the teaching program. The teacher could find what to focus on for the next teaching program.

## 5.6 Conclusion

This chapter has discussed samples of texts produced by the students in the stage of Independent Construction of the text in the teaching cycle. The students categorized low, mid and high achievers seemed to have benefit from the program. They show considerable improvement in writing skills in terms of the schematic structure and linguistic features. It is found that the schematic structure of the texts suggests the students' improvement in constructing a successfully organized text. It is also found that the students could demonstrate their ability to use various linguistic resources to communicate effectively through the texts.

The grammatical analyses of each element of the texts show the students' development in composing the targeted text. This suggests that the application of the teaching cycle in this study seemed to be effective in improving the students' ability in writing Report genre. The data from interviews indicate that the teaching program has improved the students' writing skills. Students' responses seem to support the findings of Chapter 5. From individual interview, there are several areas that need to be considered in designing similar programs. They, among others, are to do with the material, the timing, the classroom teaching equipment, teacher's correction, and the use of the students' native language. The data from classroom observation indicate that the students enjoy the teaching program and participate in every task actively.

Thus, the teaching cycle with the implementation of the GBA, supported by classroom observation and interview data regarding the students' responses about the teaching cycle, was effective in improving the students' ability in writing Report genre.



