

## **CHAPTER V**

### **CONCLUSION, IMPLICATION, AND RECOMMENDATION**

#### **5.1 Conclusion**

The goal of the present study is exploring digital literacy practices of Indonesian secondary English language teachers. This fills the research gap where the exploration of digital literacy practices from the side of teacher, specifically ELT teachers is scarcely carried out. Two research questions are administered in this study seeking for the secondary English language teachers' engagement towards digital literacy in teaching practices and their perceptions of technology integration and training. There are six themes emerged in the findings of the study: digital literacy conceptualization, purposes of using digital tools, the practices of digital literacy, digital literacy competences, technology integration into English curriculum and materials, and the expected technology training. Plentiful data gained from the field are already presented as well as discussed thoroughly in the previous chapter. Thus, this section presents general overview of key findings of the study based on the emerging themes.

Briefly, first, teachers have fairly good understanding of the digital literacy concept in which digital literacy is conceptualized as knowledge and actions of managing digital tools for particular purposes including education. Second, there are two purposes of using digital tools by the teachers: academic and non-academic purposes. The academic purpose refers to the use of digital tools for teaching and learning activities while the non-academic purpose relates to the employment of digital tools for working, entertainment, and personal communication. Third, the teachers' practices of digital literacy correspond to the five essential competencies of digital literacy (access, analyze and evaluate, create, reflect, and act) and two other frameworks: TPACK and DLT. Fourth, in terms of digital literacy competence, the teachers are in the intermediate level holding scores from 3.3-3.8 out of 5. Fifth, in the teachers' point of view, use of technology can be integrated into some parts of a curriculum document such as core competences and learning activities. Yet, the

teachers cannot find any explicit statements of technology use in the current curriculum. Meanwhile, the integration of technology into materials shows different result between the vocational and senior high school teachers due to different characteristic of language instruction. In the vocational high school, the integration is done by inserting topics about technology relevant to students' major and collaborating with productive teachers in arranging tasks for students. On the other hand, in the senior high school, the insertion of topics about technology is rather difficult to be done. Notwithstanding, the senior high school teachers focus on maximizing technological-based learning activities. Lastly, there are some general needs of the expected technology trainings delivered by the teachers: availability of follow-up activities, practice-oriented training, instructors holding IT expertise as well as background knowledge of ELT, instructors possessing high competence in a specific digital skill/software/application, material delivery – one meeting for one topic/application, having group/peer-sharing, and technology mentors. In terms of training schedule and duration, the teachers have two different wishes: 1) frequent with short duration (e.g. 1-2 times/month with 1-2 hours duration or at least 2 times/semester), and 2) less frequent with long duration (once semester in a complete full day).

Despite some privileges of technology access, facilities, and trainings served by school management, actually, the teachers experience challenges within their digital literacy practices. The challenges relate to students' plagiarism, students' learning disruption, unmotivated students, unsupported students' conditions (e.g. lack of internet quota, poor internet connection), low ability of operating LMS, technical aspect (LMS error server), longer time for material preparation, and limited time of creating video project. Generally, the challenges happen during online teaching practices. One of the interesting challenges is low ability of operating LMS since all of the teachers felt difficult to operate the LMS due to their unfamiliarity. In addition, the LMS is still newly developed, having different user interface from Google Classroom, and having occasional error server. Albeit the teachers face many challenges, they are

still enthusiastic to learn and practice digital literacy. The teachers' awareness of the importance of digital literacy keeps their teaching always updated, lives, and innovative following the development of digital technology. Thus, other English language teachers should take the value of this study by imitating the teachers' spirits in practicing digital literacy.

## **5.2 Implication of the Study**

The findings of the present study offer several implications for ELT teachers, school management, teacher educators, stakeholders, and other researchers underlying the issue of ELT pedagogy, digital literacy, technology integration, and technology trainings.

### **5.2.1 For English Language Teachers**

To improve digital literacy competences, English language teachers may increase the utilization of digital tools in teaching practices. Now, there many e-learning platforms that can be explored for free. Besides, the English language teachers ought to catch the blessing in disguise of the Covid-19 pandemic since during this period of time teaching and learning activities are imposed to be done virtually by optimizing the use of e-learning platforms, internet, online resources, and other digital-based educational tools. In short, the more frequent the English language teachers deal with digital technology, the better improvement of their digital literacy competences will be.

In practicing digital literacy, English language teachers have to consider various aspects/components of it. To ease the process of navigating the practices of digital literacy, the English language teachers may follow the five essential competencies of digital literacy: access, analyze and evaluate, create, reflect, and act. Accessing digital contents in online resources, doing analysis-evaluation process of the contents, creating various digital contents, conducting reflection on the practices, and contributing to online communities become simple yet valuable practices of digital literacy.

Furthermore, English language teachers should attend technology trainings more frequently. This is quite beneficial for updating their knowledge about use of

technology for language teaching practices. However, if their schools were not able to held technology trainings, the English language teachers may attend to technology trainings served by universities/colleges, local government, communities, non-governmental organization, and other schools. Recently, there are many workshops on technology trainings conducted virtually. Likewise, the English language teachers can join the trainings remotely.

### **5.2.2 For School Management**

Looking at the easiness of doing teaching reflection based on web-based feedback system in the present study, other school management may also apply the system. Digital teacher assessment (DITA), a web-based feedback system discussed in the present study, offers a practical way of delivering feedback on teaching performances based on particular assessment items as well as the voices of students, teachers, and headmaster. However, it is reported that some students give too many criticisms to a teacher and this may affect the teacher's career. Besides, personal issues are potentially decreasing the objectivity of the feedback, not only feedback from students but also from the other teachers and the headmaster. Therefore, when adopting a web-based feedback system, it is suggested for the other school management to improve the system by creating a checking and balance system. Also, socializing the appropriate and objective ways of delivering feedback to all parties of schools ought to be organized.

Furthermore, two systems necessarily to be adopted are academic information system and learning management system. The academic information system allows real-time access of information related to students' learning progress, students' achievements, data profiles, and subject lists. This system will be quite beneficial especially for parents to check the learning progress of their children remotely. Meanwhile, the learning management system can assist teachers managing online teaching such as sharing materials, collecting students' work, and providing feedback on students' tasks. Generally, the two systems are widely used in higher education.

However, in secondary education, only few of schools already implement them. Therefore, it is suggested for school management to adopt the systems.

### **5.2.3 For Teacher Educators**

As part of the actors of teacher professional development, teacher educators play an important role in preparing pre-service English language teachers to possess high quality of teaching competence including digital literacy. Thus, there are three strategies suggested for the teacher educators in preparing the digital literacy competence of pre-service English language teachers. Firstly, digital tools should be increasingly utilized during daily instructional process. This aims at making the pre-service teachers to be accustomed with the digital learning environment. Secondly, teacher educators promote digital literacy practices to the pre-service teachers. Various teaching and learning activities should be connected with the essential competencies of digital literacy. This aims at enhancing the pre-service teachers' awareness of digital literacy. Lastly, teacher educators may design courses focusing on the discussion of technology and digital skills required by language teachers. This will deepen the pre-service teachers' knowledge about the recent issues/trends of digital-based language learning.

### **5.2.4 For Stakeholders**

Stakeholders' support is quite important for the improvement of English language teachers' digital literacy competences. Importantly, stakeholders also become the actor of teacher professional development. Thus, there are several ways that can be implemented by stakeholders to improve digital literacy competences of the English language teachers. Firstly, providing more technological facilities has to be done especially for schools with lack of technological access. This aims at balancing the distribution of technology support. Secondly, stakeholders have to organize more accessible technology trainings for all teachers in order to achieve equal competence of digital literacy among the teachers. Thirdly, stakeholders ought to listen as well as consider English language teachers' voices of both general and specific needs of their

expected technology trainings. This helps the stakeholders providing more appropriate technology trainings for the teachers in regards with their own teaching context and curriculum. Lastly, stakeholders especially the ministry of education may explicitly integrate technology into curriculum document in further revision/development of curriculum. This is intended for fostering as well as legitimating the adoption of technology in educational practices.

#### **5.2.5 For Further Researchers**

Due to the presence of study limitation, it is suggested for further researchers to focus on improving particular issues related to digital literacy framework for language teachers, employment of longitudinal study, research participants teaching at remote areas, use of tests for measuring teachers' digital literacy competence, and involvement of wider range of participants (e.g. school principle, parents, and students). Three frameworks used in the present study are not designed specifically for language teacher digital literacy practices. Yet, it is developed for general practices of digital literacy. The researcher is obliged to adopt the frameworks due to the absence of specific digital literacy frameworks for language teachers. Therefore, further researchers are recommended for researching as well as proposing a new pedagogical framework intended for explicating language teachers' practices of digital literacy. Next, longitudinal study which offers a longer-range of time for gathering data has to be employed in order to yield richer data. In terms of research participants, further researchers are suggested to invite teachers teaching at remote areas with limited access of technology. This will be potentially expanding the research findings due to the different conditions of the research participants. Moreover, to know the exact digital literacy competence of English language teachers, it is suggested to apply tests. Also, inter-rater reliability ought to be administered. This enhances data validity and reliability of the teachers' digital literacy competences. Lastly, the involvement of wider range of participants such as school principle, parents, and students may be

considered. This is intended for enhancing the validity of the research participants' responses.

### **5.3 Recommendations for Future Research**

Reflecting on the findings of the present study, the researcher discovers many prospects for future research. Firstly, researching technology integration into English language curriculum may be conducted by exploring the perceptions/voices of English language teachers, curriculum developers, and policymakers. Also, the comparison between technology-based curriculum and non-technology-based curriculum should be thoroughly reviewed. Secondly, the issue of integrating technology into English materials is also interesting to be carried out deeply. In this case, the exploration is not only revealing the perceptions/voices/experiences of English language teachers but also material developers, editors, and students. Besides, review of literature of technological-based teaching materials must be addressed. Lastly, it is suggested to research the development of course design for ELT teacher technology trainings based on needs analysis: necessities, lacks, and wants. A syllabus and course materials are expected to be the results of the research.

### **5.4 Limitation of the Study**

Although the present study is prudently conducted on the basis of strong review of literature and theoretical frameworks, some existing flaws ought to be acknowledged. This section provides the limitation of the present study in the form of several sub-topics comprising generalization of the study, veracity of the participants' responses, bias in digital literacy competence self-assessment questionnaire, bias in the selection and number of participants, and limited time of conducting the study.

#### **5.4.1 Generalization of the Study**

The present study applies qualitative approach in which a case study becomes its specific research method. Consequently, the results of the present study cannot be generalized into universal/wider context of research area. The results are contextually-bounded revealing a specific issue namely digital literacy practices of four ELT secondary teachers in a prominent private school in Bandung, Indonesia. However, the

Aji Budi Rinekso, 2021

*DIGITAL LITERACY OF SECONDARY ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHERS: ITS RELATION TO TECHNOLOGY INTEGRATION AND TRAINING*

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

findings of the present study may provide valuable information for other researchers who are interested in conducting research in the similar context.

#### **5.4.2 Veracity of the Participants' Responses**

Despite the employment of multiple data collection methods for triangulating the data and following the steps of check and balance system of trustworthiness, there is a possibility of participants not to clearly stating some part of information especially related to frailty issues due to their reluctance towards the school management.

#### **5.4.3 Bias in Digital Literacy Competence Self-Assessment Questionnaire**

The self-assessment questionnaire is adopted from the work of (Weerakanto, 2019). Thus, the validity and reliability of the questionnaire are not questionable due to rigorous process applied in her study. However, since the present study relies on the results of participants' responses on the self-assessment questionnaire only, there is a possibility of the participants to either underrating or overrating themselves. Actually, the researcher can add his own measurement on the participants' digital literacy competences yet the researcher is not willing to do so due to maintaining the objectivity. The ultimate goal of the present study is exploring the participants' digital literacy practices rather than measuring their digital literacy competences. Thus, data of the participants' self-assessment are used as the supplementary data only.

#### **5.4.4 The Selection and Number of Participants**

Since the present study employs qualitative approach, the selection of the participants is done purposively rather than randomly in regards with the aim of the study. The selection of the participants is based on their willingness, teaching experiences, class grades being handled, participation in prior technology trainings, and participation in the video project. Likewise, the number of the participants are considered purposively based on the equal number of representative between the vocational and senior high schools. This may be quite subjective in nature yet it is done to yield rich data in correspond to the goal of this study.

#### **5.4.5 Limited Time of Conducting this Study**

A very short duration of collecting data, twelve complete weeks may not perfectly provide deep and rich data of the present study. Therefore, further research is suggested to be conducted in the form of longitudinal study which can take more than 6 months for collecting data.