

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter draws the conclusions, implications and recommendations for textbook writers, publishers, teachers, researchers, and policymakers who concern about English teaching, nation and national narratives, values education particularly in nationalism reflection, representation, transfer, negotiation, reproduction, and speaking skills.

5.1 Conclusions

Nationalism values are the will to unite as a nation as a product of political, social, and past experience, nation creation, national symbolism, national awareness, love, and loyalty toward the motherland. Nationalism as a character is a way of thinking, behavior, and conduct by showing the highest degree of loyalty, concern, and appreciation toward the national space, social, culture, economics, and national history. Both BI and PE embedded the nationalism values by employing banal flaggings and nation and national narratives. Teachers in *SMA Pertiwi* and *SMA Nusantara* employed nation and nationalism narratives to transfer and negotiate these values. Students gave their appreciations toward the nation by traveling to domestic tourism spots, preserving natural environment and wealth of national cultures, and appreciating the national heroes, the local cultures and songs.

Banal nationalism is a method to explore nationalism in a banal way. It exists in Indonesia, as the country is a developed and democratic country with much potential of national flaggings and representations. The educational material is a source of discourse to understand how teachers and students interpret nationalism values. Therefore, this research discusses the content analysis of English textbooks, the transfer and negotiation of nationalism values using the nation and national narratives in English classroom, and the reproduction of nationalism values in students' English vlogs.

Generally, PE and BI are relevant to the current curriculum and syllabus. It supports the 2013 curriculum and school programs. The equilibrium ratio of both 1:1 for global content versus local content is already accomplished in the chosen textbooks. PE has 1:1.06, and BI has 1:1.86 ratio of global content and local content. The texts variety and technology of PE are better than BI. The nationalism values represented in PE are the nation creation of Indonesia, the nationalism awareness, the social and political struggles, and the national symbols using citizens/figures, geographical features (islands, provinces, cities, streets and national weather), culture, architecture, routine deixis, and historical events. On the other hand, the nationalism values promoted in BI are similar to PE in terms of citizens/figures, routine deixis, history, cities, and cultures yet there are nothing less than distinctive in terms of the aspects of nature, influencer, and local performance. With regard to the aspects of material coverage, all the textbooks, in any sort: descriptive, recount, and narrative, are already sufficient. However, the material used in both textbooks is considered rather obsolete, whereas PE is more likely to be advanced in terms of its design by incorporating some kind of mobile augmented reality.

Teachers promoted nationalism values in the classroom by transferring and negotiating those values using nation and national narratives with the students. They employed nation and national narratives to aid the development of students' English skills. Most of the students argued that the use of such narratives could aid the development of their productive skills. The nation and national narrative can scaffold the students learning in vlogging activity. Moreover, they were motivated to create a good text with deeper content and to speak in English. Teacher also embedded nationalism values in their teaching such as buying or shopping from their local neighborhood and preserving national heritage *batik*. Nation and national narratives foster students' nationalism awareness, which correlates to their national pride and identity. Furthermore, such narrations help students to acquire their best performance, English exposure, autonomous learning, and engagement.

For the representation and reproduction of nationalism in students' English vlogs, the vocabulary and grammar mastery are good. However, some vlogs are merely sufficient in those aspects. The representations of nationalism values contain the same elements of nationalism in BI and PE. Furthermore, the nationalism values reproduced and reflected in the students' English vlogs employ the banal nationalism such as routine deixis, architecture, nature, history, citizens/figures, landscape, and cultures. The flaggings represent the Indonesian nation creation, students' sense of belonging as a part of a nation, the historical, geographical and cultural identity, and the agricultural and historical narratives of Indonesia.

5.2 Implications

This research can enrich the theory of nationalism studies in general and banal nationalism in Indonesian context in particular. It contributes to the nationalism values in education particularly in English subject. It reveals that nationalism values (banal nationalism and third principle of *Pancasila*) can be embedded in nation and national narratives. The textbooks represent nationalism values upon that teachers transfer and negotiate the values through the nation and national narratives. Moreover, the students appreciate and reproduce those values through their English vlogs.

Nationalism values can be embedded in English lessons using nation and national narratives as well as national flaggings. Those narratives can scaffold the development of students' speaking skills and foster students' sense of nationalism. As an example, the vlogging activity motivated the students to develop their speaking skills such as describing local tourism spots and retelling the historical or cultural values of the buildings. Furthermore, this activity encouraged the students to speak in English outside of classroom and explored their localized nationalism. The students show their appreciation in banal way such as narrating the historical building, cultural gathering spots, or natural tourism spots, buying the local products, and preserving the local tourism spots.

The analysis of the selected textbooks proves that Indonesia has rich banal nationalism resources and teachers have the power to shape students' localized nationalism. It explains how varied and complex nationalism values are represented, established, reproduced, and negotiated in English textbooks, teaching learning process, and students' English vlogs. Considering the textbooks as inputs, teacher can appropriate, use, modify, add, and omit the teaching material. Teacher as the values agent can guide the students in acquiring their speaking skills and foster students' sense of nationalism by accepting, suggesting, negotiating, and rejecting the students' ideas of nation and national narratives.

Based on the research findings, there are at least two implications. The practical implication urges the teacher to be selective and wise in choosing, delivering, and embedding nationalism values. To develop students' sense of nationalism, teacher can employ many tools such as textbooks, videos, music, and vlogs to create students' localized nationalism. It helps them to reflect and reproduce their unique form of nationalism and enhances their sense of belonging. Furthermore, the use of familiar topic of nation and national narratives encourages them to speak more frequent and develops their speaking skill. As for the balance of local, nation, and global content, teachers can adjust their teaching material from the textbooks and create a bridge with students' surrounding environment by encouraging them to explore their nearby semiotic resources.

The second implication is related to the direction of future research. Future research can explore the authors' biases related to the content of the textbooks. This research is able to shed light the inclination of the authors' background (their occupation, working site, place of birth, etc.) that influences the choices of semiotic resources employed such as cities, islands and provinces. Teachers also play a big role in shaping the students' vlogs' content direction. *SMA Pertiwi* students prefer visiting and narrating the historical sites to nature while *SMA Nusantara* students tend to chose natural tourism sites. Hence, the textbooks contents influence the students' vlogs content. The future research can study this phenomenon more thoroughly.

5.3 Limitation of the Study

There are many problems encountered during the data gathering. First, the time for conducting observation was merely two months and it ended when the COVID 19 pandemic spread in Indonesia. Second, only two books were evaluated and analyzed, which have the same biases related to the authors' background knowledge. In addition, Publishers on Java published both books. It would have different result if the book had been published outside of Java Island. Third, the schools selected as research sites were located on Java. Therefore, the inclination of Java and Javanese could not be avoided.

5.4 Recommendations

Based on this research limitation and many points that are important for future studies, five recommendations are given for textbooks authors, publishers, teachers, researchers, and policymakers.

1. For textbooks authors

Nationalism values need to be embedded in English textbooks. Textbooks authors can provide a balance between local, national, and global narratives. Some semiotic resources are not appropriate for persuading the students to be more nationalist, then, some corrections need to be done. Authors can employ nation and national narratives and Indonesian flaggings, and introduce a variety of representations, products, practices, and perspectives in many contexts. The authors also need to lessen the tendency of their cultural and territorial background. Writers' background knowledge can influence the choice of semiotic resources in representing and reproducing national flaggings.

2. For publishers

Any publisher is highly encouraged to improve their textbooks with the integration of multimodality by taking multimodality into great account. PE already started innovative technology by incorporating mobile augmented reality. The added auditory teaching material can benefit the students in learning English skills particularly listening and speaking skills. In addition, the layout of BI

colorful pictures can be a benchmark of how to organize the teaching and learning activity. It is well organized and giving more space for the students to write their answers and take notes. Related to the material of both textbooks are in need of many revisions to be more up to date such as sport athletes and influencers.

3. For teachers

Teachers can develop their ‘localized’ nationalism teaching material and encourage the students to speak in English with familiar knowledge in their surroundings. Assigning students with vlogging activity can develop their courage, lower their anxiety, and introduce them to their local and national narrative. In addition, selecting teaching material is also worth considering. The teacher can influence students’ understanding of nationalism and their reaction in seeing the national flaggings and reading nation and national narratives by personalizing their experience..

4. For researchers

This research has many limitations that can be investigated deeper for further research. First of all, there are only two schools in Salatiga city involved in this research. The selected schools in this research are located on Java. Therefore, there is a tendency of Java and Javanese culture. Further study can investigate the “localized” nationalism flaggings and nation and national narratives in other contexts and territory. It should explore other cities, regions, or provinces to know how the Indonesian flaggings in a different context are. The observation was done barely for two months before the arrival of the COVID 19 pandemic in Indonesia. As a result, a more comprehensive and deeper research observation can be done in a more conducive and normal day to get a better result.

5. For policymakers

To cater students’ needs and circumstances, policymakers should insert the local cultures and values for teaching and learning English. It is suggested to add success stories of national figures (national heroes and public influencers) in learning materials to motivate the students and foster their sense of nationalism.