

**Policy, Practice, and Challenges in the Implementation of Bilingual
Education: A Case Study at an Elementary School in Bandung**

A Thesis

**Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for Master's Degree in
English Education**



Euis Yuyun

1707685

**ENGLISH EDUCATION DEPARTMENT
SCHOOL OF POSTGRADUATE STUDIES
INDONESIA UNIVERSITY OF EDUCATION**

2020

**Policy, Practice, and Challenges in the Implementation of Bilingual
Education: A Case Study at an Elementary School in Bandung**

Oleh
Euis Yuyun
UPI, 2020

Sebuah Tesis yang diajukan untuk memenuhi salah satu syarat memperoleh gelar
Magister Pendidikan (M.Pd) pada Sekolah Pascasarjana

© Euis Yuyun 2020
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia
Juni 2020

Hak cipta dilindungi undang-undang.
Tesis ini tidak boleh diperbanyak seluruhnya atau sebagian, dengan dicetak ulang,
di foto kopi, atau cara lainnya tanpa ijin dari penulis.

APPROVAL PAGE

**Policy, Practice, and Challenges in the Implementation of Bilingual
Education: A Case Study at an Elementary School in Bandung**

A Thesis

Euis Yuyun

1707685

Approved by:

Main Supervisor



Iwa Lukmana, M.A. Ph.D

196611271993031002

Co-Supervisor



Yanty Wirza, M.Pd. M.A. Ph.D

NIP. 197701152005012003

Acknowledged by:

Head of English Education Department Program
School of Postgraduate Studies
Indonesia University of Education



Prof. Dr. H. Didi Suherdi, M.Ed.

NIP. 196211011987121001

ABSTRACT

Globalization has brought the world to educational reforms that prompt policy makers to improve and develop educational policies by implementing Bilingual Education. This study seeks to explore the educational policy in a private school which implement Bilingual Education: how the policy is implemented and what challenges are encountered. The study used a qualitative approach and the data were taken from classroom observations, interviews, and document analyses and involved a bilingual classroom and the teacher and the school's policy makers. The findings revealed that to preserve school's existence in private education, Bilingual Education is established as an innovative program offering content instruction through English. All subjects excluding *Bahasa* Indonesia were taught in English starting from first grade to fifth grade even though the school should cope with the challenges. The practice of Bilingual Education showed the teacher's commitment and effort to use English at the Science class despite the challenges regarding the students' diverse language competences and motivation; parental supports; and limited learning resources.

Keywords: bilingual education, language policy and practice

Table of Contents

TITLE	i
COPYRIGHT PAGE.....	ii
APPROVAL PAGE	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
Table of Contents.....	v
CHAPTER I.....	1
INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Research Questions	3
1.3 Objectives of the study	3
1.4 Significance of the Study.....	3
1.5 Scope of the Study.....	4
1.6 Definitions of key terms	4
1.7 Organization of the paper.....	4
CHAPTER II	6
LITERATURE REVIEW.....	6
2.1 Bilingual Education	6
2.2 The Framework for Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) Teacher Education.....	14
2.3 Language Policy in Indonesia	18
2.4 Previous studies related to Bilingual Education.....	20
2.5 The characteristics of young learners	25
2.6 The phenomenon of Integrated Islamic Schools in Indonesia	26
CHAPTER III.....	28
METHODOLOGY	28
3.1 Research Design	28
3.2 Participants.....	28
3.3 Data collection.....	29
3.3.1 Classroom observation.....	29
3.3.2 Interview	29
3.3.3 Document survey.....	30
3.4 Data analysis	30

3.4	Triangulation.....	31
CHAPTER IV		32
FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION.....		32
4.1	Findings	32
4.1.1	Bilingual Education Policy in an Integrated Islamic Elementary School	32
4.1.1.1	Goal.....	32
4.1.1.2	Student selection criteria	35
4.1.1.3	Teacher selection criteria	36
4.1.1.4	Model	38
4.1.1.5	Curriculum	40
4.1.1.6	Evaluation	44
4.1.1.7	Teacher development	46
4.1.2	The Challenges the Policy Makers Encounter in Enacting Bilingual Education.....	47
4.1.3.1	Teachers	47
4.1.3.2	Parents.....	50
4.1.3.3	Community.....	50
4.1.3	The Teacher’s Practice in the Science Classroom	51
4.1.2.1	Content and language awareness	51
4.1.2.1.1	Teacher’s ability to identify the appropriate content to be taught and obstacles to content learning	52
4.1.2.1.2	Teacher’s ability to view content through different cultural perspectives.....	53
4.1.2.1.3	Teacher’s ability to promote learner awareness of language and the language learning process.....	55
4.1.2.1.3.1	Language of learning	55
4.1.2.1.3.2	Language for learning.....	56
4.1.2.1.3.3	Language through learning	60
4.1.2.1.4	Teacher’s ability to link language awareness issues to content learning and cognition	61
4.1.2.1.5	Teacher’s ability to scaffold language learning during content classes	67
4.1.2.2	Methodology and assessment.....	72
4.1.2.1.1	Building learners’ capacity.....	73

4.1.2.1.2 Deploying strategies.....	75
4.1.2.1.3 Building directions and focus	77
4.1.2.1.4. Building safe and meaningful learning experiences	78
4.1.2.1.5 Assessing	79
4.1.2.3 Learning resources.....	81
4.1.2.4 Classroom management	83
4.1.2.4.1 Teacher’s ability to use diverse classroom set ups to promote student communication, cooperative learning, and leadership	83
4.1.2.4.2 Teacher’s ability to use appropriate language for classroom interaction in order to manage classroom proceedings	84
4.1.2.4.3 Teacher’s ability to recognise and make use of opportunities provided by learners’ linguistic and cultural diversity	86
4.1.2.4.4 Teacher’s ability to cater for learners with a wide range of needs	88
4.1.2.4.5 Teacher’s ability to co-create with students a non-threatening environment that is driven by learning and the active participation of all students	89
4.1.4 The Challenges the Teacher Encounter during the Practice	90
4.1.4.1 Students’ diversity	90
4.1.4.2 Parental support.....	91
4.1.4.3 Learning resources.....	91
4.2 Discussion	92
4.2.1 The policy of Bilingual Education	92
4.2.2 Policy makers’ challenges	96
4.2.3 The teacher’s practice of bilingual education.....	97
4.2.4 The teacher’s challenges	98
CHAPTER V.....	99
CONCLUSION, IMPLICATIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	99
5.1 Conclusion	99
5.2 Implications.....	100
5.3 Recommendation.....	101
REFERENCES	x
APPENDICES.....	103
Appendix 1.....	103

Appendix 2.....	108
Appendix 3.....	120
Appendix 4.....	134
Appendix 5.....	135
Appendix 6.....	140

List of Figures

Figure 3.1 Data Triangulation	32
Figure 4.2 The teacher used video clips to scaffold learning	68
Figure 4.3 The teacher used mind mapping to scaffold learning	69
Figure 4.4 the teacher used pictures to scaffold language learning	69
Figure 4.5 The condition of group work	70
Figure 4.6 Students' self-assessment on religious habit	74
Figure 4.7 Two sides classroom set-up	84
Figure 4.8 Students' sitting position	88

List of Appendices

Appendix 1 Classroom-observation Format	114
Appendix 2 Interview to the Policy Makers.....	118
Appendix 3 Interview to the Teacher.....	126
Appendix 4 Example of Psychological Test in Students' Selection.....	139
Appendix 5 Thematic Syllabus	140

REFERENCES

- Aizawa, I., & Rose, H. (2018). An analysis of Japan ' s English as medium of instruction initiatives within higher education : the gap between meso-level policy and micro-level practice. *Higher Education*. doi: 10.1007/s10734-018-0323-5 An
- Amrullah. (2015). *Sekolah islam terpadu: Sebuah tinjauan kritis*. 1(1).
- Ariyana, Yoki , Pudjiastuti, Ari, Bestary, Reisky dan Zamromi, Z. (2018). *Buku Pegangan Keterampilan Berpikir Tingkat Tinggi Berbasis Zonasi*. Kemdikbud.
- Artieda, G., Roquet, H., & Nicolás-Conesa, F. (2017). The impact of age and exposure on EFL achievement in two learning contexts: formal instruction and formal instruction + content and language integrated learning (CLIL). *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 23(4), 449–472. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2017.1373059
- Baker, C. (1996). *Foundation of bilingual education and bilingualism* (2nd ed.). Great Britain: Bath Press.
- Banse, H. W., Palacios, N. A., Merritt, E. G., & Rimm-Kaufman, S. E. (2017). Scaffolding English language learners' mathematical talk in the context of calendar math. *Journal of Educational Research*, 110(2), 199–208. doi: 10.1080/00220671.2015.1075187
- Bascia, N., Cumming, A., Datnow, A., Leithwood, K., & Livingstone, D. (2005). *International handbook of educational policy* (Volume 13; N. Bascia, A. Cumming, A. Datnow, K. Leithwood, & D. Livingstone, eds.). Dordrecht: Springer.
- Belland, B. R. (2017). *Instructional scaffolding in STEM education*. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-02565-0
- Bolton, K., Botha, W., & Bacon-Shone, J. (2017). English-medium instruction in Singapore higher education : policy , realities and challenges. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 1–18. doi: 10.1080/01434632.2017.1304396
- Bruner, J. (1996). *The culture of education*. doi: 10.4135/9781848608252.n6
- Cahyani, H., Courcy, M. De, & Barnett, J. (2016). Teachers ' code-switching in bilingual classrooms : exploring pedagogical and sociocultural functions. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1–16. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2016.1189509
- Cameron, L. (2001). *Teaching languages to young learners*. New York: Cambridge Univerity Press.
- Canagarajah, S. (2011). Translanguaging in the classroom: Emerging issues for research and pedagogy. In L. Wei (Ed.), *Applied Linguistics Review* 2. Retrieved from <http://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=en&btnG=Search&q=intitle:No+Title#>

- Caruso, J. J., & Fawcett, M. T. (2007). *Supervision in early childhood education: A developmental perspective* (3rd ed.; L. R. Williams, ed.). New York and London: Teachers College Press.
- Cenoz, J. (2015). Content-based instruction and content and language integrated learning : the same or different ? *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 28(1), 8–24. doi: 10.1080/07908318.2014.1000922
- Cenoz, J., Genesee, F., & Gorter, D. (2014). Critical analysis of CLIL : Taking stock and looking forward. *Applied Linguistics*, 35(3), 243–262. doi: 10.1093/applin/amt011
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2005). *Research Methods in Education* (5th ed.). Canada: Routledge Falmer.
- Coyle, D., Hood, P., & Marsh, D. (2010). *Content and language integrated learning* (1st ed.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.). California: Sage.
- Dalton-puffer, C. (2011). Content-and-language integrated learning : from practice to principles ? *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 31, 182–204. doi: 10.1017/S0267190511000092
- Dalton-puffer, C., Llinares, A. N. A., Lorenzo, F., & Nikula, T. (2014). ““ You can stand under my umbrella ”” : Immersion, CLIL and bilingual education . A response to Cenoz , Genesee & Gorter (2013). *Applied Linguistics*, 35(2), 213–218. doi: 10.1093/applin/amu010
- Dalton-puffer, C., & Nikula, T. (2014). Content and language integrated learning. *The Language Learning Journal*, 42(2), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/09571736.2014.891370
- Dalton-puffer, C., Smit, U., & Dalton-puffer, C. (2014). Content and language integrated learning : A research agenda. *Language Teaching*, 46(4), 545–559. doi: 10.1017/S0261444813000256
- De Graaff, R., Koopman, G. J., Anikina, Y., & Westhoff, G. (2007). An observation tool for effective L2 pedagogy in content and language integrated learning (CLIL). *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 10(5), 603–624. doi: 10.2167/beb462.0
- Dearden, J. (2014). *English as a medium of instruction (EMI): A growing global phenomenon*. 1–11. doi: 10.1093/elt/ccx017
- Denman, J., Tanner, R., & Graaff, R. De. (2013). CLIL in junior vocational secondary education : challenges and opportunities for teaching and learning. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 16(3), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2013.777386
- Dewi, A. (2017). English as a Medium of instruction in Indonesian higher education : A study of lecturers ’ perceptions. *Multilingual Education*, 21.

doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-51976-0

- Duff, P. A. (2008). *Case study research in applied linguistics*. New York: Taylor & Francis Group.
- Endow, T. (2018). Inferior outcomes: Learning in low-cost English-medium private schools—a survey in Delhi and national capital region. *Indian Journal of Human Development*, 12(1), 1–19. doi: 10.1177/0973703018779725
- Evertson, C. M., & Neal, K. W. (2006). *Looking into learning-centered classrooms implications for classroom management*. Retrieved from National Education Association website: <http://www.nea.org/tools/behavior-contracts-how-to-write-them.htm>
- Farrell, T. S. C. (2019). Professional development through reflective practice for English-medium instruction (EMI) teachers. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 0(0), 1–10. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2019.1612840
- Farrell, T. S. C., Tan, S., & Kun, K. (2007). *Language Policy, language teachers' beliefs, and classroom practices*. 29(3), 381–403. doi: 10.1093/applin/amm050
- Ferguson, G. (2009). What next? Towards an agenda for classroom codeswitching research. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 12(2), 231–241. doi: 10.1080/13670050802153236
- Fitriati, S. W. (2015). *English Bilingual Education in an Indonesian Public School*. 87–102.
- Fitriati, S. W., & Rata, E. (2020). Language, globalisation, and national identity: A study of english-medium policy and practice in Indonesia. *Journal of Language, Identity and Education*, 1–14. doi: 10.1080/15348458.2020.1777865
- Floris, F. D. (2014). Learning subject matter through English as the medium of instruction: students' and teachers' perspectives. *Asian Englishes*, 16(1), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/13488678.2014.884879
- Fontecha, A. F., Naves, T., & Wiesemes, R. (2009). Theoretical and implementation issues of content and language integrated learning. In Y. R. de Zarobe & R. M. J. Catalan (Eds.), *Content and Language Integrated Learning* (pp. 3–41). Bristol: Short Run Press.
- Ford, T. G., Van Sickle, M. E., Clark, L. V., Fazio-Brunson, M., & Schween, D. C. (2015). Teacher self-efficacy, professional commitment, and high-stakes teacher evaluation policy in Louisiana. *Educational Policy*, 31(2), 202–248. doi: 10.1177/0895904815586855
- Garcia, O. (2009). *Bilingual education in the 21st century* (1st ed.). Chichester, West sussex: Wiley-Blackwell Publishing.
- Gibbons, P. (2015). *Scaffolding language, scaffolding learning: Teaching English language learners in the mainstream classroom* (2nd ed.). Portsmouth:

xiii

Euis Yuyun, 2020.

POLICY, PRACTICE, AND CHALLENGES IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF BILINGUAL EDUCATION: A CASE STUDY AT AN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL IN BANDUNG.

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia. | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

Heinemann.

- Gustafsson, H. (2018). Capturing EMI teachers' linguistic needs: a usage-based perspective. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1–12. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2018.1425367
- Hadisantosa, N. (2010). Insight from Indonesia. In R. Johnstone (Ed.), *Learning through English: Policies, challenges and prospects: Insights from East Asia* (pp. 69–95). British Council.
- Hall, G., & Cook, G. (2012). Own-language use in language teaching and learning. *Language Teaching*, 45(3), 271–308. doi: 10.1017/S0261444812000067
- Hamid, M. O., Jahan, I., & Islam, M. M. (2013). Medium of instruction policies and language practices, ideologies and institutional divides : voices of teachers and students in a private university in. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 14(1), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/14664208.2013.771417
- Hamid, M. O., Thi, H., Nguyen, M., & Baldauf, R. B. (2013). Medium of instruction in Asia : context, processes and outcomes. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 14(1), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/14664208.2013.792130
- Hammond, J. (2001). Scaffolding : Teaching and learning in language and literacy education. In *Primary English Teaching Association*. doi: 10.1007/s13398-014-0173-7.2
- Hasan, N. (2009). Islamizing formal education: Integrated islamic school and a new trend in formal education institution in Indonesia. *RSIS Working Paper*.
- Hasan, N. (2012). Education, young islamists and integrated islamic schools in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal for Islamic Studies*, 19(1).
- Hornberger, N. H. (1990). Bilingual education and English-only: A language-planning framework. *Annals*.
- Hsieh, C.-N., Lonescu, M., & Ho, T.-H. (2017). Out of many, one: challenges in teaching multilingual Kenyan primary students in English. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 31(2), 199–213. doi: 10.1080/07908318.2017.1378670
- Inan, B. (2014). Teacher revoicing in a foreign language teaching context: Social and academic functions. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 39(9), 53–75. doi: 10.14221/ajte.2014v39n9.5
- Kaplan, R. B., Jr, R. B. B., & Kamwangamalu, N. (2011). Why educational language plans sometimes fail. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 12(2), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/14664208.2011.591716
- Karakas, A. (2016). Turkish lecturers' views on the place of mother tongue in the teaching of content courses through English medium. *Asian Englishes*, 18(3), 242–257. doi: 10.1080/13488678.2016.1229831
- Kewara, P., & Prabjandee, D. (2018). CLIL teacher professional development for content teachers in Thailand. *Iranian Journal of Language Teaching*

Research, 6(1), 93–108.

- Kirkpatrick, A. (2010). *English in ASEAN: Implications for Regional Multilingualism*. 1–15.
- Kirkpatrick, A. (2011). English as a medium of instruction in Asian education (from primary to tertiary): Implications for local languages and local scholarship. *Applied Linguistics Review*, 2, 99–120. doi: 10.1515/9783110239331.99
- Kirkpatrick, A. (2012). *English as an international language in Asia : Implications for language education* (A. Kirkpatrick, B. Adamson, & D. C. S. Lee, eds.). doi: 10.1007/978-94-007-4578-0
- Kirkpatrick, A., & Adamson, B. (2017). *English medium instruction in higher Education in Asia-Pacific* (B. Fenton-Smith, P. Humphreys, & I. Walkinshaw, eds.). doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-51976-0
- Kuchah, K. (2016). English-medium instruction in an English–French bilingual setting: issues of quality and equity in Cameroon. *Comparative Education*, 52(3), 311–327. doi: 10.1080/03050068.2016.1185257
- Lasagabaster, D., & Sierra, J. M. (2010). Immersion and CLIL in English : more differences than similarities. *ELT Journal Volume*, 64(4), 367–375. doi: 10.1093/elt/ccp082
- Lauder, A. (2008). The status and function of English in Indonesia: A review of key factors. *Sosial Humaniora*, 12(1), 9–20.
- Lauermann, F., Karabenick, S. A., Carpenter, R., & Kuusinen, C. (2017). Teacher motivation and professional commitment in the United States the role of motivations for teaching, teacher self-efficacy and sense of professional responsibility. In *Global Perspectives on Teacher Motivation* (pp. 322–348). doi: 10.1017/9781316225202.011
- Lee, S. K., Lee, W. O., & Low, E. L. (2014). *Educational policy innovations*. Springer.
- Lie, A. (2007). Education policy and EFL curriculum in Indonesia: Between the commitment to competence and the quest for higher test scores. *TEFLIN Journal*, 18(1), 462–469. doi: 10.20533/licej.2040.2589.2011.0064
- Linse, C. T., & Nunan, D. (2005). *Practical English language teaching_ PELT young learners-English as a second language* (D. Nunan, ed.). McGraw-Hill.
- Lo, Y. Y., & Fung, D. (2018). Assessments in CLIL: the interplay between cognitive and linguistic demands and their progression in secondary education. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1–19. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2018.1436519
- Lorenzo, F., Casal, S., & Moore, P. A. T. (2009). *The Effects of content and language integrated learning in European education : Key findings from the Andalusian bilingual sections evaluation project*. 31(3), 418–442. doi: 10.1093/applin/amp041

- Lyster, R., & Ballinger, S. (2011). Content-based language teaching: Convergent concerns across divergent contexts. *Language Teaching Research*, 15(4), 279–288. doi: 10.1177/1362168811401150
- Macaro, E., Curle, S., Pun, J., An, J., & Dearden, J. (2018). A systematic review of English medium instruction in higher education. *Language Teaching*, 51(1), 36–76. doi: 10.1017/S0261444817000350
- Mahan, K. R. (2020). The comprehending teacher: scaffolding in content and language integrated learning (CLIL). *Language Learning Journal*, 1–15. doi: 10.1080/09571736.2019.1705879
- May, S. (2016). Language awareness and multilingualism. In J. Cenoz, D. Gorter, & S. May (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of Language and Education* (Third Edit). doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-02325-0
- Maybin, J., Mercer, N., & Stierer, B. (1992). “Scaffolding” learning in the classroom. In K. Norman (Ed.), *Thinking Voices: Work of the National Oracy Project* (p. 224). London, Hodder & Stoughton.
- Mehisto, P., Wolff, D., Marsh, D., & Martin, M. J. F. (n.d.). *European framework for CLIL teacher education*.
- Morton, T. (2017). Reconceptualizing and describing teachers’ knowledge of language for content and language integrated learning (CLIL). *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 21(3), 275–286. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2017.1383352
- Musthafa, B. (2010). Teaching English to young learners in Indonesia: Essential requirements. *Educationist*, 4(2), 120–125.
- Nababan, P. W. J. (1991). Language in education: the case of indonesia. *International Review of Education*, 37(1), 115–131.
- Naidoo, J. (2016). Language matters! Exploring promise’s use of pedagogic strategies in her mathematics classroom. *Language Matters*, 47(3), 372–392. doi: 10.1080/10228195.2016.1233572
- Ng, P., & Leong, C. (2016). English-medium instruction in Japanese universities : policy implementation and constraints. *Current Issues in Language Planning*. doi: 10.1080/14664208.2016.1204053
- Ni, Y. (2017). Teacher working conditions, teacher commitment, and charter schools. *Teachers College Record*, 119(6), 1–38.
- Ovando, C. J. (2003). Bilingual education in the United States : Historical development and current issues. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 27(1), 1–24.
- Parker, J., Heywood, D., & Jolley, N. (2012). Developing pre-service primary teachers’ perceptions of cross-curricular teaching through reflection on learning. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 18(6), 693–716. doi: 10.1080/13540602.2012.746504
- Pokrivcakova, S. (2015). *CLIL in foreign language education: E-textbook for foreign language teachers*. Constantine the Philosopher University.

- Pritasari, A., Reinaldo, H., & Watson, C. W. (2018). English-medium instruction in Asian business schools : a case study. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 1–13. doi: 10.1080/01434632.2018.1458855
- Pun, J., & Macaro, E. (2018). The effect of first and second language use on question types in English medium instruction science classrooms in Hong Kong. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 22(1), 64–77. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2018.1510368
- Puskás, A. (2016). *The Challenges and Practices of Teaching Young Learners*.
- Rashid, A., Muzaffar, I., Dar, F., & Butt, S. (2016). The issue of English as a medium of instruction in primary schools in Pakistan: Learning English, mathematics or science? *Human Rights in Language and STEM Education: Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics*, 179–204. doi: 10.1007/978-94-6300-405-3_11
- Rich, S. (2014). International Perspectives on teaching English to young learners. In *Appl. Phys. A* (Vol. 73). England: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Richards, J. C. (2017). Teaching English through English: Proficiency, pedagogy and performance. *RELC Journal*, 48(1), 7–30. doi: 10.1177/0033688217690059
- Roberts, C. A. (1995). Bilingual education program models: A framework for understanding. *The Bilingual Research Journal*, 19(3), 369–378.
- Roper, S., Carpenter, D., & Garza, E. (2018). Teacher approaches to writing in science in bilingual elementary classrooms. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1–21. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2018.1548557
- Schall-Leckrone, L. (2018). Coursework to classroom: Learning to scaffold instruction for bilingual learners. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 45(1), 31–56.
- Song, X., & Cheng, L. (2011). Asia-pacific journal of teacher investigating primary English immersion teachers in China : background, instructional contexts, professional development, and perceptions. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 39(2), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/1359866X.2011.560647
- Tanu, D. (2014). *Becoming ' international ' : the cultural reproduction of the local elite at an international school in Indonesia*. 22(4), 579–596. doi: 10.5367/sear.2014.0236
- Taylor, S., Rizvi, F., Lingard, B., & Henry, M. (2005). *Educational policy and the politics of change*. New York: Routledge.
- Tupas, R. (2018). (Un) framing language policy and reform in Southeast Asia. *Relc Journal*, 49(2), 149–163. doi: 10.1177/0033688218772155
- Wang, W., & Curdt-Christiansen, X. L. (2019). Translanguaging in a Chinese–English bilingual education programme: a university-classroom ethnography. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 22(3), 322–

337. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2018.1526254

Wannagat, U. (2008). Learning through l2-content and language integrated learning (CLIL) and English as medium of instruction (EMI). *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 10(5), 37–41. doi: 10.2167/beb465.0

Wei, R., & Feng, J. (2015). Implementing CLIL for young learners in an EFL context beyond Europe. *English Today*, 31(1), 55–60. doi: 10.1017/S0266078414000558

Widodo, H. P. (2016). Language policy in practice: Reframing the English language curriculum in the Indonesian secondary education sector. In R. Kirkpatrick (Ed.), *English language education policy in Asia* (p. 388). doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-22464-0

Wolff, D. (2012). *The European framework for CLIL teacher education*. 105–116.

Xie, W., & Curle, S. (2019). Success in English medium instruction in China: significant indicators and implications. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1–13. doi: 10.1080/13670050.2019.1703898

Zacharias, N. T. (2013). Navigating through the English- medium-of-instruction policy : voices from the field. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 14(1), 37–41. doi: 10.1080/14664208.2013.782797