

## **CHAPTER V**

### **CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND LIMITATIONS**

This present chapter discusses the conclusion of the present research and suggestion for future research with a similar topic. The conclusion and recommendations are drawn from the findings and discussion that have been explained in the previous chapter. Besides, this chapter also provides limitations of the research that can be used for reflection for another researcher regarding the research implementation.

#### **5.1 Conclusions**

This study intended to investigate the corporation of four resources model of critical literacy and song lyrics to promote critical literacy practice in a secondary school in Pamekasan. Four song lyrics were played in the classroom practice as text. The texts discussions were conducted based on the framework of four resources model proposed by Luke and Freebody (1999), it includes code-breaking practice, meaning-making practice, using text functionally, and critically analyzing text.

The data obtained from classroom observation, focus group interview, students' written responses and students' reflective journals are displayed to answer the research questions, which are about the implementation of four resources model and song lyrics in EFL classroom, as well as about challenges encountered by both teacher and students in implementing critical literacy practice. The findings of data analysis have shown students' efforts in critically analyzing text. The students were guided to be a code breaker, meaning maker, text user, and text analyst. The aforementioned roles have assisted students to have experience in examining song lyrics with a critical lens. To perform the role as a code breaker, students were guided to recognize vocabulary and figurative language used in the song lyrics; as well as breaking the visual and auditory aspects employed in the music videos. Meanwhile, in order to achieve role as meaning maker, the students were guided to activate background knowledge and experience; understand the background of the song; and understand the literal and inferential meaning. The role as text user was gained by the students through understanding the structure of song lyrics; as well as

Njr Ijabah, 2019

***INCORPORATING FOUR RESOURCES MODEL AND SONG LYRICS TO PROMOTE CRITICAL LITERACY PRACTICE IN AN EFL CLASSROOM***

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

understanding social and cultural function of song lyrics. In order to perform the role as text analyst, students were guided to recognize songwriters' intention, take a stance towards the issues presented in the text, and investigate songwriters' opinions and biases.

Through the aforementioned roles, students are able to demonstrate critical capacity during the critical dialogue. They became aware of language power presented by the songwriters in the song lyrics. Through problem posing, they also demonstrated multiple views to challenge the issues presented in the song lyrics. Students were also scaffolded to present alternative views and reflection towards the issues through reflective journal writing. Reflective journal writing also provides opportunities for students to reflect their learning and demonstrate their reflective manner as the response of reading song lyrics critically.

In terms of the challenges of the implementation of critical literacy in this present study, it is revealed that students' perceived political notion and cultural values as the challenge encountered by the students. Initially, students seem to lose their interest in discussing political issues, such as war, government abusive power, and discrimination. This happens because the students think that discussing political issues are the job of matured people. They consider that teenagers do not have a responsibility in discussing that matters. However, to prepare students to be an active citizen in real life, they need to be introduced to real life problems including political issues (Lee, 2017). Besides, students also initially stereotype the image of a terrorist. They believe in the value of judging terrorist based on what people wear. However, during the critical discussion, the students change their mind as the result of critical analyzing text. They more appreciate differences and value people based on what they do instead of what they see.

Meanwhile, the challenges encountered by the teacher during the implementation deal with teacher competence and subjectivity. In terms of teacher competence, students need to pay attention to their role as facilitator, guidance, and prompter in guiding students during the critical discussion. Since critical literacy believes in progressivism

philosophy, teachers need to put in mind that students are the center of the learning, and give them more space to pronounce their voice. Besides, the teacher subjectivity towards the issues being discussed also becomes a challenge of critical literacy implementation. The teacher facilitates a critical dialogue among students without imposing her own views on particular issues. Thus, the teacher needs to manage her personal views in order not to lead the discussion based on her views. Besides, in order to avoid imposing teacher's subjectivity of particular voice, the teacher should open any interpretation from students without leaning toward a single perspective.

## **5.2 Recommendations**

Reflecting on the findings of this present study, critical literacy is worth implemented in EFL classroom to equip students with critical awareness in examining texts. However, the implementation of critical literacy needs intensive implementation in classroom practice. Thus, the teacher needs to embed the principle of critical literacy in their teaching practice because the development of students' critical capacity could not be gained instantly. As mentioned by Setyaningsih (2018), critical literacy is not merely about language, it is more about the mind. Thus, building critical capacity needs habituation of mind. In other words, it needs a longer time to implement critical literacy in EFL classroom.

This present study provides two recommendations for the sake of betterment for the future implementation of critical literacy using song lyrics as text. The first recommendation is addressed to the future researchers who have an interest in critical literacy topic. It is suggested that future researcher let students bring their own favorite song lyrics into the classroom in order to gain more multiple views during the critical discussion (Sanchez, 2007). However, to maintain the focus of discussion, teachers still have their authority to limit the topic of the song lyrics that students would bring into the classroom. This way is also done to make students engage actively during the critical dialogue as they have already had their bounding with the text.

In addition, during the implementation of critical literacy, it is suggested that the teacher pay attention to the critical questions used in scaffolding students to voice their own views. Critical questions are used

to open students' horizon and curiosity towards the social injustice reflected in the text. Thus, the teacher needs to use probing questions that help students to reach the intended role of four resources model namely code breaker, text participant, text user, and text analyst (Setyaningsih 2018). Through probing questions, students are triggered to problematize and investigate writers' intention, hidden agendas, opinions, and biases.

The second recommendation deals with teacher professional development. It has been discussed in earlier chapters that to have a successful implementation of critical literacy, the teacher should be a critical teacher. The teacher should have critical consideration to perform his/her roles in selecting text, material, or media for the critical discussion, posing critical questions to guide students critical capacity, assessing and judging students' language and critical capacity, as well as in reflecting his/her own teaching practice. However, those aforementioned roles are not instantly gained by the teacher. The teacher needs more hands-on professional development or training to have a clear understanding of critical literacy principles and practices.

### **5.3 Limitations**

The researcher realizes that there are several limitations in this present study. The limitations deal with the duration of teaching practice and researcher subjectivity. In terms of duration of teaching practice, this present study employs critical literacy practice for six meetings with allocation time 80 minutes for each meeting. However, the class where the researcher conducted the research has English subjects on Tuesday and Thursday, both of them were conducted at the first learning hours. About fifteen minutes of the time is allocated for character building such as spiritual and nationalism values. Students and teachers are obligated to sing National anthem (Indonesia Raya) and read the holy Quran before starting the lesson. However, this policy is not followed by additional time. As the consequence, the English class is conducted only for sixty-five minutes in each meeting. This duration of teaching practice is considered to be insufficient for students to conduct critical discussion maximally. Since this is the first time for students to

participate actively in critical literacy practice, they need more scaffolding and guidance from the teacher. As a matter of fact, this time limitation could not cover all students' need in learning the language. In conducting this study, the teacher took attention more to building students' critical capacity and omitted to teach explicit grammar to the students.

Meanwhile, in terms of researcher subjectivity, this present study engages the researcher in studying and evaluating her own teaching. Thus, there might be a potential loss of objectivity in research stages, including data collection procedure and data analysis. However, to deal with this limitation, the researcher triangulates the data to validate the research findings. Apart from the aforementioned limitations, this present study has reached its goals to describe the implementation and challenges during the critical literacy practice in secondary school through the incorporation of four resources model and song lyrics.