

CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

This final chapter presents the conclusions and generates implications for future CL teaching and research.

5.1. Conclusions

The study concludes that teacher's questions in CL instructions do not help students to improve their meaning making or general reading proficiency but aid them to move toward critical end of literacy. This only partially confirms previous study by Bui (2016). Bui's CL pedagogies resulted in improved students' English language competency and other skills such as leadership, presentation, and collaboration. In addition, socio-cultural awareness and agentive development were also noticeable. In this study, however, the improvement does not count in the English language competency.

The study also confirms the fluidity of the roles within the FRF but at the same time questions the notion of non-developmental which is attached to the framework. The study concludes that students' immersion into text user and text analyst roles is highly influenced by how they perform in the code breaker and text participant roles. It means that without proper basic comprehension of text, critical assessment is baseless and potentially misleading or off target. While agreeing with Luke and Freebody (1990) who mentions that the four roles can and should be introduced at all levels, teachers need to be cautioned with the presence of a certain level of threshold to surpass.

In addition, the study bares that students at diverging baselines address similar indicators of engagement in the roles but how they perform within each indicators differs. Two major factors that are identified to contribute to the

**Endang Setyaningsih, 2013 Development of Students' Critical Literacy
within the Four Resources Framework: The Use of Questions in a Tertiary
EFL Reading Class**

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu |
perpustakaan.upi.edu

difference is the material and the mode of tasks (individual-group). When the material is readable and relatable, students regardless their baselines or proficiency level, are able to approach texts critically. This conclusion refutes the commonly believed claim that proficiency is the predictor of criticality.

The study also concludes that CL teaching requires ample time to build students' automated CL practice. After 11 weeks of instructions, the students with average and low baselines of CL are still dependent on the provision of questions to cue them address the four roles. When questions are removed, they cease being critical. Unfortunately, however, defining the 'ample time' is still subject for further exploration although it is strongly indicated that the habituation is also associated to frequency instead of time lapse alone.

Finally, it is also worth to note that the FRF works as a framework but it does not provide clear teaching syntax. This may be perceived as both positive and negative. The absence of syntax possibly rises reluctant and resistance from both teacher and students to apply it. Nevertheless, the FRF allows various teaching method or reading strategies to be incorporated. The study has shown that students benefitted the clear syntax of the SQ3R which is infused into the frame of Four Resources.

5.2. Implications

The findings of this present study bring about four major points of implications, addressing the level of policy and pragmatic or practice. First, at the level of policy, the study implies the need to place CL as the orientation of curriculum. As denoted in the findings, this study suggests the presence of threshold and need of habituation. This brings at least another three layers of consequences on the curriculum: the design, the implementation, and the evaluation.

**Endang Setyaningsih, 2013 Development of Students' Critical Literacy
within the Four Resources Framework: The Use of Questions in a Tertiary
EFL Reading Class**

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu |
perpustakaan.upi.edu

Array of planning for addressing the threshold shall be carefully minded, particularly in terms of setting the aim of the instructions, selecting material, and plotting ample time for immersing CL to gain balanced proficiency and criticality which is fostered through FRF. Creating and fostering critical milieu in classes is also essential in the process of teaching CL, either as stand-alone course or as embedded one. This milieu covers the nurture and embracement of multiple perspectives, equity, and collaboration/ cooperation. As such, assessment on students shall move from getting students to find single correct answer to helping students come with various possible answers without getting into “anything goes” answers. More importantly, assessment shall not focus on students providing answer but on students questioning the words and the world. While it may not be simple due to the changing paradigm of education that need to be embraced, shift of curriculum is required to equip students in dealing with changing world.

Second, at the level of practice, the study implies the need for explicit teaching. As denoted by this study, the use of questions directed students toward critical end and the immersion into all roles was acquired when students were aware of the roles. This implies that the introduction of CL requires explicit teaching. In this case, explicit teaching means explicitly awaken students’ awareness on the roles of reader and on the fact that texts are crafted. This awareness, as observed from the study, was well provoked by questions.

Third, on the use of question, the finding suggests that question cannot be used to improve students’ ability to gain basic comprehension. Students’ comprehension are linkable to their schemas which are better improved by giving extensive exposure to texts instead of continuously testing students by means of questions.

Fourth, the study also calls attention to the selection of supporting pillars in the teaching of CL. This refers to the choice of materials, methods and strategy

**Endang Setyaningsih, 2013 Development of Students’ Critical Literacy
within the Four Resources Framework: The Use of Questions in a Tertiary
EFL Reading Class**

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu |
perpustakaan.upi.edu

which opens opportunity for developing the critical milieu. It is not likely that the use of questions alone would result in satisfying development of CL. Questions shall be nested in the context of texts which linguistically and topically invite students' cognitive and affective apprenticeship. In addition, questions shall be presented in appropriate mode of class interaction. As a postmodern education practice, CL teaching shall be conducted in an environment which support equity and collaboration. In this case, questions are better responded and constructed when students shared and took perspectives from members of cooperative groups. Last, the use of questions within the CL framework in the classroom practice shall ensure its sustainability. This means that the questions shall be flexible for incorporation or infusion in existing or familiar strategy. Sustainability is required for the sake of prolonged engagement into CL which leads to mind habituation.

**Endang Setyaningsih, 2013 Development of Students' Critical Literacy
within the Four Resources Framework: The Use of Questions in a Tertiary
EFL Reading Class**

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu |
perpustakaan.upi.edu