

CHAPTER III

METHODOLOGY

This chapter presents the research paradigm and approach utilized in the conduct of this study by discussing the methodology and the context in which the study took place. This chapter begins with a discussion of research design, elaboration of the teacher education setting as well as the teaching field setting, justification for the participants' selection, restatement of the research questions, discussion of data collection methods, elaboration of data analysis relative to the instruments used, and trustworthiness issue. This chapter ends with concluding remarks.

3.1 Research Design

This case study provides depth and detail empirical work through a variety of data collection methods which help highlighting the uniqueness of each participant in light of their reflection and reflective teaching practice experiences. This study was designed with regard to EFL pre-service teachers' reflective teaching practices in the real classroom context in a certain period. In the process of conducting each of the case within this study, the focus was primarily on each participant's reflective teaching relative to the elements of reflection, the levels or quality of reflection and concerns or issues being addressed in their reflections. Analysis of the results is based on Dewey's (1933) and Loughran's (1996) elements of reflection, Hatton and Smith's (1995) and Pisova's (2005, as cited in Syslova, 2015) level of reflection connected to Halliday and Mathiessen's (2014) logico-semantic relation, as well as Freeman and Johnson's (1998) and Moradkhani, et al.'s (2013) knowledge base of second/foreign language teacher education in unlocking the practice of reflection and reflective teaching of the pre-service teachers, especially when all the theoretical frameworks emphasized the teacher as part of the constructs of society and the dialectical relation between teachers' knowledge and their world of practice.

3.2 Settings

3.2.1 Teacher Education Setting

This study took place at a private university in the heart of Kendari, the capital of South East Sulawesi. Established in 2001, this university has undergone some accreditation processes by Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan Tinggi (BAN-PT). The research was undertaken during the field teaching practice program of students majoring in English language teaching education of the English Department in this university. The department's program focuses on the preparation of bachelors of English teachers. Founded in 2006, it had gone through its first accreditation assessment in 2010 and second assessment in 2015 and was accredited C and B, respectively, by Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan Tinggi (BAN-PT).

The PPL II or field teaching practice program is a subject in the last year (Year 4) of the bachelor study. Based on the program guidelines provided by the study program, there is no indication that the program is reflective teaching oriented. In other words, teaching reflection is not an integral part of the field teaching practice program. Therefore, as regards the benefits reflective teaching offers, it was the initiative from the Head of Study Program and the previous lecturers of Microteaching (PPL I) subject to introduce the present field teaching program to reflective teaching oriented. In so doing, both the Head of Study Program and the team teaching of Microteaching course hoped to get preliminary data on their PSTs' process on reflective teaching which would be of use for the future consideration on program evaluation.

3.2.2 Teaching Field Setting

Two private schools were nominated as the venue of the field teaching program for about 45 school-days. The nomination of the host schools was decided by the department. Therefore, the researcher was in position of no authority in deciding the venue of the program. The two nominated schools are different in level, i.e. secondary junior high school and secondary senior high school. They were nominated under consideration that both of them have fewer number of students and classrooms which would cover the total 17 PSTs. As a

Sitti Nurfaidah, 2016

EFL PRE-SERVICE TEACHERS' REFLECTION: A CASE STUDY IN AN INDONESIAN INSTRUCTIONAL CONTEXT

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

result, eight students (four women and four men) were assigned to teach at the private secondary junior high school which has only seven classes altogether with two English teachers acting as their mentor teachers. Meanwhile, nine students (eight women and one man) were assigned to teach at the secondary senior high school which has twelve classes altogether with two English teachers as their mentor teachers. The mentor teachers are all graduates of English teacher education. Some of them have bachelor qualifications, while some others have master qualifications.

At the initial days of the program, as the headmasters welcomed the PSTs, they revealed their schools' category both in light of their inputs' economic and academic context. As regards economic aspect, the input of the students at the private secondary junior high school is categorized as coming from low economic background, while the input of those at secondary senior high school as low to medium economic background. On average, the students in both schools come from low to medium level class with higher percentage of low class in the private secondary junior as their parents among others are fishermen, vegetable sellers, fish sellers, merchants, *tukang ojek*, and *becak* drivers. In regard to academic aspect, students in both schools were categorized as having low academic competence as most of the inputs are the "leftovers" from other schools' entrance exam. In other words, the two schools are in the students' last choice in their school list to be entered into. Both headmasters acknowledged that their schools are the place for the "rejected ones"—those who did not pass the entrance exam in the other schools. With regard to the low input, academic results of English language learning in both schools were considered lower than the other schools in the city.

3.3 Participant Selection

During preliminary observation, all the seventeen PSTs, who were registered in the field teaching program, proved to show their ability in communicating their ideas in their assigned journal writing in Microteaching class. In search for the participants of this present study, having consulted about the students' potential in reflective practice with the *gate keeper* (Malik & Hamied, 2014), i.e. the head of

study program who happened to be one of the lecturers in Microteaching (PPL I) course and one of academic supervisors in Field Teaching Program (PPL II), all of them were projected to participate in this study voluntarily. However, when the researcher met them a few days before the field teaching program commenced, some of them responded wholeheartedly by showing their enthusiasm in joining the project and stating their willingness boldly, but some others just responded half-heartedly by signaling their lack enthusiasm such as just keeping silent as a response and turning their attention away.

Realizing the consequences they would face during their field teaching practice once they decided to participate, those who voluntarily participated willingly risked the challenges because they believed, as the researcher found out during some personal talks with them, that doing reflective practices would help them teach better and feel better about themselves as they have experienced during their journal writing in the previous semester. Therefore, the researcher attempted to build trust and mutual respect with the participants right from the start.

Initially, eight PSTs consisting of four males and four females were willing to take part in this study. These PSTs were among the recommended ones by their academic mentors who testified that they had displayed better responses to journal writing assignments during Microteaching (PPL I) course in the preceding semester. This study, however, came with four EFL PSTs who voluntarily participated based on purposeful convenient or opportunity sampling, which in line with Creswell's (1998, 2007) suggestion that in a case study, typically researchers choose no more than four cases. In other words, the participants were chosen under the consideration of who they are and what they know (Malik & Hamied, 2014) relative to reflective practice.

The four participating PSTs, in this case, were of selection because, as testified by their Microteaching lecturer, they displayed the qualities of being reflective during their initial exposures to reflective teaching practice in the previous semester. In addition, through initial talks with them, it was revealed that they knew how to deal with reflecting their teaching practice experiences by means of written accounts and they wanted to have more engaging experiences

with reflective practice. Accordingly, they were willing to assist the researcher in the present study. In order to preserve anonymity pseudonyms were given to all participants—henceforth named Pre-service Teacher (PST) 1, PST 2, PST 3, and PST 4, when referring to them in this study. Regarding teaching experience in a real classroom setting in the school, each participant had no prior teaching experience.

The following is the description of each participant which provides some insight into their personality as well as language learning and teaching motivation. All names presented in this study are pseudonyms.

3.3.1 PST 1

PST 1 was an English Language Education major. She grew up in a sub-urban area. Her family was hardworking and her upbringing involved her participation in many community activities. PST 1's parents were public civil servants. She spent her senior high school in one of the vocational schools in Kendari majoring in Tata Busana or Fashion. Her first encounter with English was when she was in her primary school. She was exposed to English as foreign language in the schools until she graduated from vocational school. Upon graduation, she decided to take English Language Education as her major because she was inspired by her aunt who teaches English. She has a calm personality and does not talk much when hanging around with her friends. She is mature in her age for everything she performed seemed to come from careful thinking. During the field teaching program, she was assigned to teach at the senior high school.

As regards reflective practice, she acknowledged that she preferred reflecting through discussion with colleagues to writing things down as it is not her habit. However, since she was exposed to reflective teaching practice in Microteaching class, she sometimes wrote reflective journals pertinent to things she got from the classroom. Albeit keeping a teaching journal was somewhat of a burden for her, she enjoyed it because she found it helpful in relieving stress. Reflective journals could help her evaluate things she had done as well as identify her strengths and weaknesses in teaching and learning process. By way of reflecting, she realized that one of her strengths in facing students' various problems was personal

approach, which she found helpful in building trust between the teacher and the students and maintaining the students' motivation to learn English. Reflection also raised her awareness that implementing theory into praxis was not without hindrances. Most of the time she found some problems related to instructional material delivery, classroom management, and students' competence, which were out of the books she learned.

3.3.2 PST 2

PST 2 was an English Language Education major. She grew up in a village, on a farm. PST 2's parents were farmers. She spent her school time in the village before coming to the capital of the province to pursue her bachelor degree. Unlike PST 1 who was exposed to English learning earlier in the elementary level, regarding the trend in the elementary schools in the city English was offered as part of local content, PST 2's first encounter with English was when she was in her junior high school as English in the elementary schools in the village was still not considered as important to be offered as local content. She was exposed to English as foreign language in the schools until she graduated from senior high. Initially, she did not take English Language Education as her major because she wanted to or because she was inspired by someone. Rather, she chose the program because there was no other choice for her at the time she enrolled at tertiary level. She thought the program was the most reasonable one than the other offers. She has a very outgoing personality though sometimes she could show her temper and emotional feeling deeper than the other PSTs. In the field teaching program, she was assigned to teach at the senior high school.

As far as reflection is concerned, she preferred reflecting on hardships to good things during teaching experiences because she thought that expressing her irritation, annoyance, and sad feelings in written accounts would help her share her feelings and thoughts with others who would read her teaching journals. She found that reflective journals assisted her in realizing her mistakes during instructional practices, which could be evaluated and not to be repeated in the following classroom interactions. Similar to PST 1, she found herself reflecting on practices in the real classrooms that deviated from the theories she learned. In so

doing, she tried to deal with the real practices of teaching and maintain high spirits in facing her students.

3.3.3 PST 3

PST 3 was an English Language Education major. She grew up in a district. Her upbringing involved her participation in many community activities. PST 3's parents were farmers. Similar to PST 2, she spent her time in the district before coming to the capital of the province to pursue her bachelor degree. Her first encounter with English was when she was in her primary school. She was exposed to English as foreign language in the schools until she graduated from senior high. She sometimes showed initiatives in the classroom. She likes sharing her teaching experience with her friends while enjoying writing reflective journals. In the field teaching program, she was assigned to teach at the senior high school.

In terms of reflective practice, she chose written accounts as means of reflecting her instructional experiences because writing things down could help her express all her thoughts and feelings regarding things she encountered in the classroom, which could not be covered through mere discussion with colleagues. She realized that reflecting on her teaching practices helped her teaching competence improved because, like PST 1, she could identify her strengths and weaknesses, evaluate her teaching methods, select proper teaching media, and identify the students' needs. However, she found it difficult to reflect when she has no mood to write.

3.3.4 PST 4

PST 4 was an English Language Education major. She grew up in the city. PST 4's parents were public civil servants. Her mother is a public civil servant, while his father is a policeman. She spent her senior high school in one of Islamic senior high schools in Kendari. Her first encounter with English was since she was in her primary school. She was exposed to English as foreign language in the schools until she graduated senior high. She has an outgoing personality and really likes to talk when hanging around with her friends. She is also good in communicating with others, both her friends and her lecturers. In the field

teaching program, she was assigned to teach at the junior high school. She chose to study English language education because she was inspired by her aunts who dedicate themselves to teaching. She loves the ideas of learning something new and being able to transfer it to others.

Concerning reflective activities, unlike the other participants, she admitted she had been writing diaries since she was in junior high school. Therefore, writing reflective journals for her has been of necessity as a student-teacher because it is very helpful in reflecting things she had done in the classroom, evaluating the shortcomings and rectifying them. Further, she acknowledged that reflective practices helped her realized that she needed more exposure to teaching practice experiences in order to develop her teaching competence. She stated that she would keep the good practice of keeping reflective teaching journals once she graduates and becomes a real teacher.

3.4 Research Questions

An increased interest on reflective teaching practice in the initial teacher education program has necessitated an awareness of extensive research on the practice of reflective teaching in initial teacher education programs. Reflection on teaching practice experiences during field teaching is one of the methods by which PSTs can foster and develop their professional learning and the literature suggests that reflection could be a way for the PSTs to inform their practice and facilitate their professional capacity.

In an attempt to contribute to the body of knowledge in reflective teaching practices, this case study focused on revealing such questions as the following.

1. What are the elements of reflection being realized by the EFL pre-service teachers in their reflections during the field teaching practice?
2. What are the levels of reflection of the EFL pre-service teachers as revealed in their reflections during the field teaching practice?
3. What are the issues relative to teachers' knowledge which prompt the EFL pre-service teachers to reflect during the field teaching practice?

4. How are the EFL pre-service teachers' issues in reflection, elements of reflection, and levels of reflection interconnected in light of instructional contexts?

3.5 Data Collection

Data collection was begun in the odd semester of 2013/2014 academic year when the field teaching practice was commenced. The study has used multiple data collection techniques in order to obtain an in-depth look into the realm of reflective teaching practice. In order to gain rich description of the participants' practice on reflective teaching, in-depth interviews, observation (field notes and videotaping), and stimulated recall protocol techniques were used (e.g. Duff, 2008; Loughran, 1996; Nunan & Bailey, 2009).

3.5.1 Teaching Journal

Journal was chosen to be the primary research tool in this study regarding its prominent recognition in the study of teacher cognition in pre-service teacher education due to its flexibility to be incorporated into assigned coursework, especially during practicum (see Borg, 2006) as well as a tool to encourage reflection (see Bailey, 1990; Brock, et al., 1992; Farrell, 2012; Jarvis, 1992). The goal of using reflective teaching journal in this study was as the tool to study participants' personal accounts of their reflective thinking capacities and practices during the field teaching practice program took place. Therefore, as Borg (2006, p. 256) argues, this instrument becomes "flexible tool" in relating the purposes of the study.

Preliminary to the journal writing activities, during the briefing on reflective teaching journal writing, all participants (there were seventeen of them) of the field teaching program were informed that their journals would be used as one of the instruments in the researcher's study concerning their reflections and reflective teaching practices. It resulted in only a few of them wanted to be respondents willingly. In order to avoid data contamination which might result from the participants' realization of their entries' utilization, the researcher decided to give them freedom in choosing any issues they wanted to explore in

their accounts. Afterwards, they were provided with a guideline given that participants should be provided with reflection guidelines before they come with the discipline of writing journals (Richards & Ho, 1998). In so doing, Richards and Lockhart's (1996) proposed guideline was utilized considering its appropriateness to this study since they address some aspects of reflection in the second/foreign language classroom to be concerned by the teachers (see Appendix 7 for the guidelines and examples of reflective teaching journal). However, although provided with the guideline, unlike the structured journals (Borg, 2006), the respondents should only address some issues of their concerns in the guideline without having to talk about all the issues.

Afterwards, in this study, the respondents were asked to write teaching journals on once-in-a-week basis regarding that the duration of the field teaching practice program spanned only about 45 school-days. The respondents, who had experienced writing teaching journals during Microteaching class in the previous semester, were asked to write their journals in bahasa Indonesia in order to make the flow of their thoughts not be blocked by the language difficulty (Borg, 2006) as journal writing itself requires a lot of energy and effort, i.e. linguistic, cognitive, and socio-cultural demands. Merely asking teachers to reflect on and document in writing their thinking and beliefs "will often not generate particularly rich data" (Borg, 2006, p. 253) let alone asking them to write in English. In so doing, following Borg's (2006) suggestion, the researcher ascertained that the respondents have the prerequisite skills and attributes necessary for productive journal writing. Therefore, in this study, open-ended reaction (Borg, 2006) was implemented to the degree of each respondent's journal. It is because, as Borg (2006) argues, not all teachers are equally capable of producing written teaching journal productively.

At the beginning of the program, the respondents were encouraged to spend their own time to write their reflection within the same day of their teaching schedule so that they could recall their memories during the teaching time easily. It was intended to help them to have more time in reviewing and proofreading what they had written. Since the entries should be submitted via email, the respondents were given entry's format to be used in their word processors (see

Appendix 8 for word format of reflective teaching journal). Such an electronic format helped the participants submitting neat and tidy entries, while the researcher was also advantaged in her qualitative data analysis in terms of coding the emerging themes (see Miles & Huberman, 1994). However, in terms of entries' submission, only three participants faithfully submitted their entries within the same teaching week while the other one did not send her entries on regular basis. By the end of the field teaching program, as much as 24 respondents' journal entries written in bahasa Indonesia were submitted via email.

3.5.2 Observation

As one of data collection strategies in this study, unstructured observation was utilized as there were no preset categories or non-categorical representations defined in advance (see Evertson & Green, 1986). Preceded the observation, the respondents' willingness to be observed while they were teaching were sought. All of them agreed to be videotaped. Therefore, they were introduced to the research assistant/technician who would be responsible for the videotaping during their classroom sessions. They were informed that the observers would only take part as complete observer, where the researcher and the technician would only take seat at the back of the classroom, eavesdropped and reconnaissance in which the researcher was removed from sustained contact with the informant (Burgess, 1984). In other words, non-participant observation (Borg, 2006) was implemented. As part of unstructured observation (see Bryman, 2001; Evertson & Green, 1986; Robson, 2002), the accounts of the events in the classroom were collected through fieldnotes and videotaping.

Preliminary observation took place when the researcher followed the pre-service teachers' first day to their assigned school. The academic mentor of the pre-service teachers who took them to the schools introduced the researcher to the principal, the administrative staff, the teachers, as well as the students in which the pre-service teachers were going to teach. The researcher then familiarized herself with the school environment and classroom atmosphere. The academic mentor informed the school about the researcher's classroom observation that would take place during the field teaching program.

The videotaping during the classroom observation started since the first week of the program in order to familiarize both the students and the pre-service teachers with its presence. Having familiarized them with the presence of such recording device in their classrooms for about a week, data collection under observation strategy commenced at the second week of the program. Data collection yielded with 18 videotaped lesson episodes with four lessons from PST 1's class, five lessons from PST 2's class, five lessons from PST 3's class, and four lessons from PST 4's class. All data collected from this protocol was then transferred into field notes.

The recorded lessons and the field notes then became the basis for the interview in the stimulated recall session later on. Not all the recorded lessons were used during the stimulated recall protocol. Due to the participants' availability for the stimulated recall session, only one recorded lesson was brought up to each participant's reflection-on-action. The rest of the participants' recorded lessons, however, were reviewed for general characteristic of their instructional activities in the classroom which were useful both for each participant's profiling.

3.5.3 Stimulated Recall

Stimulated recall as an important technique that enhances the retrieval of the particulars of a past event with “its rich source of stimuli” (Shavelson, Webb, & Burstein, 1986, p. 82) has led this study to participants' involvement in viewing their recorded lesson individually. At the outset, this protocol was planned to be conducted on weekly basis. However, with regard to the participants' reluctance in doing this protocol—as they subtly rejected the researchers' invitation to meet—it was decided to be done once, in the middle of the program time span. They tended to avoid the meeting invitation for stimulated recall during their first weeks of teaching because they still dealt with the school atmosphere as well as managing their time and teaching preparation. Their anxiety was revealed in their journal entries and in their replied texts to the researcher.

In this protocol, the selected recorded lesson episode was played on laptop which was placed in front of the researcher and the respondent. The videotaped lesson was stopped whenever the researcher needed to confirm something from

the lesson episode. During this protocol, an audio recorder was put next to the laptop in order to record their session. The recording, therefore, helped the researcher in focusing on what were discussed during this protocol without being afraid of missing the important information that might be needed because she did not take notes while this session took place. The information was then retrieved at the end of the day by playing the audio recording. The gathered data was then transcribed (see Appendix 9 for the stimulated recall guideline).

The response expected from the participants in this protocol varied. They were asked to comment on what they attempted to do at a particular point of the lesson along with the justification. They were also asked to talk about their decision to make use of particular instructional activities and materials in their work. Regarding with the reflective teaching practices, they were asked to elaborate why they did such thing in the classroom the way they did it and what they would do for the betterment in the future. In so doing, this oral strategy in reflection was an attempt to facilitate the participants' reflection-on-action, as talking is also considered as an important catalyst for reflection (Smith, 1999), through some kind of think-aloud technique (Nunan, 1992).

3.5.4 Interview

Interview was chosen as one of ways in gathering data regarding the need to get in-depth information. However, this method is mainly employed due to the fact that it provides the opportunity to include follow-up as well as supplementary questions thought of during the actual interview and used as necessary to illuminate or clarify, thus facilitating depth in responses, as suggested by Duff (2008). Nunan and Bailey (2009) point out that interviewing as a method of data collection has pitfalls, such as sample bias which might lead to difficulty in making a comparison of data collected, unless a rigid structure is adhered to. Besides that, other pitfalls might emerge such as too tightly structured interview schedule, interviewer's or respondent's image, leading questions with the specific aim of confirming a prejudice, and respondents lying, particularly if the truth might show them in a bad light.

In this study, in-depth interviews followed the stimulated recall. It was conducted at the end of the program after all journal entries were collected, lesson episodes were reviewed, and stimulated recalls were performed. Interviews were based on interview guideline (see Appendix 10 for interview guideline) but opened to expanded questions as the researcher needed to explore relative to the participants' reflection and reflective practices. The interviews were recorded on an audio recorder. All data gathered from interviews was then transcribed.

3.6 Data Analysis

The gathered data was analysed qualitatively. Content analysis was used to interpret qualitative data collected through various sources (Malik & Hamied, 2014) such as teaching journal, videotaping, stimulated recall, and in-depth interviews relative to the elements of reflection, the levels of the participants' reflection, and the issues they revealed in their reflection. In the broadest term, the coding method in this study follows Auerbach and Silverstein's (2003) framework and Malik and Hamied's (2014) suggestion in developing categories and themes.

In general, the first step in the data analysis of this study was reading and re-reading through the text with regard the research concerns in mind. The data was processed through qualitative content analysis (Malik & Hamied, 2014). The texts related to this study's research concerns were then considered the relevant text. A unit of analysis was defined as a fragment of text, relating to a certain aspect under investigation. The length of the fragments ranged from one to several sentences (see Table 3.6 for sample of unit analysis). Afterwards, the repeating ideas in the relevant text were sought and located accordingly. Having located the repeating ideas that shed this study's research concerns in the text, the emerging themes were therefore identified. Recurring themes were sought through constant-comparison method (Yin, 2011) in order to produce high-quality analysis. The emerging themes then were reviewed based on the theoretical framework underpinning this study's research concerns.

The last step in the data coding is pulling together all the work in order to address the research concerns in this study, called as 'theoretical narrative' (Auerbach & Silverstein, 2003) which depicts what the research participants

reported in terms of the theoretical construct of this study. The theoretical narrative makes use of the theoretical constructs to organize the PSTs' experience into a coherent experience. It uses PSTs' own language to make their reflection vivid and real. Hence, analysis of data was an ongoing process (Malik & Hamied, 2014) and was commenced along with the digitalization of participants' journal entries, transcribed lesson episodes, and transcription of stimulated recall and interviews.

As regards the unit of analysis within a reflective text, as Hatton and Smith (1995), Smith (1999) and Moon (2006) suggested, unit of analysis from reflective teaching journal entries was decided to be texts within each submitted entry, henceforth referred as reflective thought unit (RTU) pertaining to this study. A reflective thought unit (RTU) in this study is defined as a set of reflective thought as projected in the participants' reflective teaching entries or oral reflection, i.e. during stimulated recall and interview, which may range from a complex sentence to a string of sentences covering reflection within a context as bound by logico-semantic relation. Therefore, a journal entry may account for some RTUs. As for transcripts of interview from stimulated protocol session, the same procedure in coding journal entries was also employed.

3.6.1 Data Analysis regarding Elements of Reflection

At first, Dewey's (1933) framework was employed in search for the indication of elements of reflection throughout the data. However, Dewey's framework is essentially theoretical based and applies to general cognitive process relative to reflective capacities of human being. Meanwhile, rather than studying teachers' reflection in general, this study focused on researching the reflective process of pre-service teachers, those who are still in the process of learning how to teach with no or less experience in real teaching setting. Therefore, along with the collation of data, it was imperative to add more additional elaboration and on how to analyze the data. As a result, Loughran's (1996) framework in analyzing element of reflection was decided to be utilized as complementary to that of Dewey's (1933) given that samples of unit of analysis provided in Dewey's

applied in general area, while Loughran's applied in the context of pre-service teachers' reflection during their field teaching practice at schools.

Moreover, in his study, Loughran (1996) divided process of reflection in a cycle into two phases, i.e. the first phase involved *suggestion*, *problem*, and *hypothesis*, while the second phase considered *reasoning* and *testing*. His study revealed that some of the student teachers' reflection as traced in both their reflective teaching journal entries and transcripts of interview demonstrated the two-phase category but not much.

Following Loughran's framework in analyzing data relative to elements of reflection, this study sought for the indication for similar process of reflection as Loughran's study; however, until all data were collected from various sources and having done reiteration process in data analysis, there was no data found yielded to Loughran's two-phase process of reflection.

3.6.1.1 Steps in Analyzing Elements of Reflection

Regarding the elements of reflection do not necessarily take place in sequence, therefore, identifying them should be in context because the same relevant text has the possibility of being used over and over again in tracing different elements. Therefore, the first stage of data analysis dealt with general identification of the elements of reflection was as illustrated in Table 3.1. This stage demonstrated the way Dewey's (1933) and Loughran's (1996) frameworks were utilized in coding the PSTs' reflective journal writings in search for the elements of reflection existing in their reflective practice during (see Appendix 14 for identifying elements guideline).

After identifying Dewey's (1933) elements of reflection and further elaboration from other sources such as Loughran (1996), the examples of each elements from the PSTs' reflective writing in Loughran's (1996) study were read and re-read in order to ensure that the texts extracted from this study's data were appropriate pertaining to each element of reflection (see Appendix 15 for sample of coding elements).

Specifically, the process of locating elements of reflection in the PSTs journal entries as well as in the transcriptions of the stimulated recall was based on the following steps.

1. Identifying the relevant text and numbering it into matrix.
2. Mapping syntax or language pattern in determining the elements of reflection.
3. Selecting, labeling and colored coding each identified unit of analysis with appropriate level such as [S] (colored light yellow) for *suggestions*, [P] (colored light pink) for *problem*, [H] (colored light blue) for *hypothesis*, [R] (colored light green) for *reasoning*, and [T] (colored light grey) for *testing*.
4. Analyzing reduced data with regard to their pattern found in each PST (within-case analysis).
5. Analyzing the similarities and differences in pattern found among PSTs' data (cross-case analysis).

Table 3.1 Sample of process in identifying the PSTs' elements of reflection using Dewey's (1933) and Loughran's (1996) frameworks

Dewey's element of reflection	Dewey's description of the elements of reflection as cited in Loughran (1996)	Loughran's examples of PSTs' writing	This study's examples of PSTs' writing in bahasa Indonesia
Suggestions	Teachers often do things without stopping to consider why they do them. However, when a situation arises which causes one to stop and think, options for action begin to spring to mind. When pondering two or more ideas, direct action is inhibited. These suggestions need to be examined so that the most appropriate course of action may be followed. In teaching, such situations may be commonplace.	<i>I think I'm structuring my lessons by teaching the content, and then using other activities as a medium to reinforce the content. I should also be using activities to: introduce topics, find out what the kids know/don't know, use them more as an initial learning method rather than a follow up, reinforcing the learning method...</i>	Sesudah menjelaskan lebih jauh, saya memperlihatkan kepada siswa tentang contoh procedure text. Untuk dijadikan contoh saya tidak mengambilnya di dalam buku yang diberikan dari sekolah karena saya merasa bahwa contoh di dalam buku tersebut akan menyusahkan siswa untuk memahaminya terutama dari segi makna. Akhirnya, setelah saya pikir-pikir saya berikan saja mereka contoh yang sering mereka dengar atau mereka lakukan di rumah, seperti bagaimana cara memasak nasi, atau bagaimana cara membuat teh.
Problem	In a setting where action ceases due to a perplexing or worrisome situation, the position may at first be viewed as a difficulty. This may lead one to reinspect the conditions which have led to the occurrence of the situation. When this happens, the situation becomes further defined and intellectualized so that it is viewed as a problem.	<i>Up until now I haven't mentioned the Year 10 USA history classes I took. That is because I would rather forget them. They just didn't work. I am very disappointed that they didn't work out because when I found I was going to teach U.S. history I was pleased because it is so interesting. I think there are several reasons why they didn't work. Firstly I could only observe 2 classes before I had to teach, and both of these consisted of the teacher just talking to the students about the</i>	Pada pengajaran saya yang ketiga ini adalah writing dimana mereka harus bisa menulis text berbentuk report. Saya menggunakan media yang di dalamnya sudah ada contoh teks report. Salah satu dari rencana pengajaranku adalah meminta mereka untuk mengidentifikasi subject dan kata kerja dalam text tersebut kemudian menulis kosakata baru yang belum diketahui artinya. Selagi mengerjakan tugas, tiba-tiba ada siswa yang bicara "Bu, semua kata yang ada dalam teks tidak ada yang kita tahu artinya! Jadi harus kita tulis semuanya kosakatanya?" Saya kaget!

Sitti Nurfaidah, 2016

EFL PRE-SERVICE TEACHERS' REFLECTION: A CASE STUDY IN AN INDONESIAN INSTRUCTIONAL CONTEXT

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

Dewey's element of reflection	Dewey's description of the elements of reflection as cited in Loughran (1996)	Loughran's examples of PSTs' writing	This study's examples of PSTs' writing in bahasa Indonesia
		<i>topic being studied. There were no note-taking or written exercises. Yet they were very interesting lessons. I used these lessons as the model for the ones I took. I had to take 2, and the teacher gave me the material to use, handouts, etc. So my lessons didn't work because of both these things. I couldn't talk to the students and ask the right questions in the interesting and informative manner that the regular teacher did. I also wasn't sure what to do with the handouts she gave me. The information the students needed was condensed in point form in the handouts and all I could think of to do with it was get the students to read it out and ask some questions along the way.</i>	Kemudian saya meminta mereka untuk cari di kamus artinya tapi karena hanya satu orang yang bawa kamus jadi mereka meminta saya mentranslate semua teksnya. Saya merasa sangat marah! Setelah pengajaran saya yang ketiga ini, saya sudah mulai merasa sedikit jengkel karena sepertinya mereka tidak tahu atau mungkin tidak mau menghargai usaha yang sudah saya lakukan mulai dari membuat media, menyiapkan materi dan menjelaskan di depan sampai kering tenggorokanku. Dari permasalahan ini, saya masih bingung untuk pengajaran selanjutnya mengingat kondisi kelasnya tidak memungkinkan kita menggunakan media elektronik karena listriknya rusak.
Hypothesis	In a scientific sense, the data that is brought to bear on the problem helps to modify, adjust and develop the suggestion so that it begins to take shape as a hypothesis. In a real sense what was once a possibility becomes something that may genuinely be tested, validated or negated.	<i>This class is like 10E, very noisy. I refuse to talk over anybody. For 5 minutes I stood in front of the class and did not say a word. The class simply got louder. I finally raised my voice to shut them up. This is not right, I should not have had to raise my voice. These kids haven't been trained. I was constantly stopping the lesson to get quiet. We got through very little. Barbara [supervising teacher] remarked that I should work them harder. I disagree—there's no point in pushing on if there is no progress.</i>	Sesudah menjelaskan lebih jauh, saya memperlihatkan kepada siswa tentang contoh procedure text. Untuk dijadikan contoh saya tidak mengambilnya di dalam buku yang diberikan dari sekolah karena saya merasa bahwa contoh di dalam buku tersebut akan menyusahkan siswa untuk memahaminya terutama dari segi makna. Akhirnya, setelah saya pikir-pikir saya berikan saja mereka contoh yang sering mereka dengar atau mereka lakukan di rumah, seperti bagaimana cara memasak nasi, atau bagaimana cara membuat teh. Tetapi ternyata walaupun saya telah memberikan contoh semacam itu, mereka tetap juga tidak mengerti.
Reasoning	Reasoning draws on the observations and experiences that are used to build an individual's store of knowledge. Reasoning through a situation leads to the linking of ideas and these links are enhanced by the store of knowledge able to be drawn upon. Reasoning may also be a method used to reinforce or better articulate a belief. This may be by comparing one's views to their observations and experiences.	<i>I thought that Bill Rogers' lecture was one of the most interesting things I've attended all year. He has done a lot of thinking about the dynamics between people. He gave examples of how incorrect responses to behaviour can lead to an escalation of problems. He also pointed out where/how a different response can quickly defuse the situation. What I found most interesting was that I could recall/identify instances from my own teaching experience which relates to both kinds of responses.</i>	Tujuan pembelajaran saya kali ini adalah agar siswa memahami struktur teks analytical exposition, mencoba mengidentifikasi kata sulit yang ada di teks bacaan, dan mereka dapat memahami isi dari teks tersebut. Pembelajaran tadi sudah hampir mencapai tujuan pembelajaran karena mereka sudah agak paham dengan isi teks yang saya berikan. Menurut saya tadi proses belajarnya sudah efektif karena lesson plannya tuntas, dan kebetulan controller atau pendamping saya mengajar datang sehingga proses pembelajaran lebih terkontrol.
Testing	Reasoning leads to an understanding of the natural consequences which might	<i>I enjoyed the first exercise of writing a sentence and passing it on. I think this could be used in</i>	Sesudah menjelaskan lebih jauh, saya memperlihatkan kepada siswa tentang contoh procedure text. Untuk

Dewey's element of reflection	Dewey's description of the elements of reflection as cited in Loughran (1996)	Loughran's examples of PSTs' writing	This study's examples of PSTs' writing in bahasa Indonesia
	follow an action. Hence, it is left to direct observation or experimental testing to corroborate the hypothesis. In testing, it may be that the consequences do not always lead to confirmation of the hypothesis being tested. It is through testing that is not successful that the value of reflective thought may be highlighted.	<i>my own classes. Have a bar of music, one composer writes a bar of music and passes it on. Obviously when time is short, then the group size needs to be limited so that the work is finished. This gave us all something to read about our classmates' reactions to our initial statement. We were not asked, at the end, to comment on what was written, but rather on the mechanics of the task itself and whether we liked it or not.</i>	dijadikan contoh saya tidak mengambilnya di dalam buku yang diberikan dari sekolah karena saya merasa bahwa contoh di dalam buku tersebut akan menyusahkan siswa untuk memahaminya terutama dari segi makna. Akhirnya, setelah saya pikir-pikir saya berikan saja mereka contoh yang sering mereka dengar atau mereka lakukan di rumah, seperti bagaimana cara memasak nasi, atau bagaimana cara membuat teh. Tetapi ternyata walaupun saya telah memberikan contoh semacam itu, mereka tetap juga tidak mengerti.

In the end, it was decided that the data were treated in the following manner before being gathered within the same categories.

Table 3.2 Sample of process in categorizing the PSTs' elements of reflection using Dewey's (1933) framework

Sample of Data	Characteristic of data	Category of Element
<p>“At the fourth meeting, as I said before [in the previous journal entry], I just planned to review the teaching material that I have delivered. I didn't prepare any teaching resources because I was confused what kind of resources would be interesting for these students. Therefore, since I just wanted to review, I didn't prepare the lesson plan nor resources. I was a bit stressed just by thinking of the students. I thought I was losing my spirit. But when I was in the classroom, there was still plenty of time left after the review. While checking the students' answers on the task I assigned them for the review, an idea crossed my mind. It was playing a game which related to the review. I asked each student to write one sentence out of their task's answer on the whiteboard then we checked the grammar. Those who wrote wrong sentences were punished to compete in a spelling game. Those who could spell faster and without mistakes were given extra marks and the rest who did mistakes were given another punishment to write another sentence and having other students who had correct answers checked them. <u>Thank God... With some games the class was alive today.</u> However, I realized that a teacher should not go teaching without a lesson plan or resources. But at least I happened to know that they like games while moments before I thought that they might not suit to games (because they are shy and a bit passive) but they're not. The worst thing from today's class was when some of the students were being punished by doing the task I gave them, the other students didn't pay attention at all. Even worse, a student was busily chattered with his friend from the adjoining classroom in front of the classroom door while his friends were busy doing the task. For the next meeting, first, I plan to give them game which requires all of them to be active because I'm afraid if not so, the passive ones will just wander around without paying attention. Second, I plan to ask my partner to observe me teaching so that she could give positive contribution to my classroom</p>	<p>In this data the flow of elements of reflection is not in sequence. The reflection process was begun with suggestion from the previous meeting of what the PST would do in her classroom. The suggestion became a problem for her as she further intellectualized that the situation worsened her spirit to teach. However, while in the classroom, as the suggestion had been executed, another suggestion occurred to her as the idea of filling the rest of the remaining time with playing games pertaining to the previous task came to her mind. The activity could solve her problem which in this case she found that the overt testing to the idea was the negation of her hypothesis that games would not suit the students due to their shyness and passivity. After that she came with another intellectualization about some students who paid less respect to the teaching activities. She ended up with imaginatively testing game requiring all students to be active as the justification for countering such less respectful students and testing peer observation to justify better input for her teaching</p>	<p>Suggestion #1</p>
		<p>Problem #1</p> <p>Suggestion #2</p> <p><i>This could be the answer to both the suggestion and the problem</i></p> <p>Testing #1</p> <p>Hypothesis #1</p> <p>Reasoning #1</p> <p>Problem #2</p> <p>Testing #2</p> <p>Hypothesis #2</p> <p>Testing #3</p> <p>Reasoning #2</p>

Table 3.2 demonstrates that the sequence of five phases of reflection (*suggestions, problem, hypothesis, reasoning, and testing*) do not occur in a set order yet they are the indispensable trait of reflective process. In terms of deciding the texts that satisfy the categories of *problem, hypothesis, reasoning, and testing*, most of the time overlapping during the coding process took place because in order to identify *hypothesis*, for example, the context of *problem, reasoning* and *testing* could not be taken for granted.

3.6.2 Data Analysis regarding Levels of Reflection

In search for the level of reflection in each PST's data, Hatton and Smith's (1995) framework developed based on their research and development study for almost ten years was utilized as the main guideline in data analysis. Among other frameworks developed by many researchers in various settings of studies around levels or quality of reflection, Hatton and Smith's (1995) framework was decided to apply for this study regarding that their framework set the criteria for recognition of evidence for different types of writing – that this study needed in analyzing the journal entries; and the framework also serves as the tool to analyze pre-service teachers' level of reflection – that this study also focused on.

While conducting reiteration process of data analysis, both during data collection and after all data were gathered, and having applied constant comparison method in data analysis, it was realized the need to adapt and modify certain criteria relative to reflective practices within field teaching practice context as revealed by pre-service teachers with no prior teaching experience beforehand. Such a decision to modify some categories in Hatton and Smith's (1995) was based on the consideration that the issue of level of reflection is highly based on the context and the purpose of reflection (Moon, 2006; Smith, 1999; Zeichner, 1993) (see Appendix 4 for the modified version of Hatton and Smith's (1995) and Pisova's (2005) level of reflection as generated from this study's data).

3.6.2.1 Steps in Analyzing Levels of Reflection

Sitti Nurfaidah, 2016

EFL PRE-SERVICE TEACHERS' REFLECTION: A CASE STUDY IN AN INDONESIAN INSTRUCTIONAL CONTEXT

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

First, Hatton and Smith's (1995) framework was used for identification on text level within a journal entry or a transcript of stimulated recall interview. In general, the text identification was closely guided by Hatton and Smith's framework as demonstrated in Table 3.3. In so doing, the categorization of identified text was sought through locating some indicative syntax and lexical pattern as suggested by Hatton and Smith (1995) such as simple reasoning in a sentence within a context which satisfied the category of descriptive reflection. For example, the following vignette was decided to be placed under *descriptive reflection* category because it contains simple reasoning.

"Ini yang pertama kalinya saya mengajar di kelas XI IPA2 pada hari Selasa. Saya merasa sangat gugup karena tadinya saya berangkat dari rumah pagi-pagi untuk menemani partnerku di kelas XI IPS2 karena kebetulan dia mengajar di jam pertama yaitu jam 07.00-08.30 dan saya mengajar di jam kedua di IPA2. Tetapi karena anak kelas IPA2 tidak masuk di jam pertama jadi guru bahasa Inggris meminta saya masuk di kelas mereka. Sebenarnya saya sangat gugup bahkan sejak hari penerimaan." (Extract from PST 2's journal entry)

Table 3.3 Sample of process in identifying the PSTs' level of reflection using Hatton and Smith's (1995) framework

Hatton & Smith's types of reflective writing	Hatton & Smith's description of the writing	Hatton & Smith's examples of PSTs' writing	This study's examples of PSTs' writing in bahasa Indonesia
Descriptive writing	Not reflective	NA, but mainly the writing only describes the events occurred without further justification	Pada pertemuan ketiga, saya mengajar mata pelajaran reading. Pertama saya masuk, sekitar 5 menit saya mereview pelajaran sebelumnya dan mereka sudah mulai mengerti tentang itu. Setelah itu, saya mulai pada topik baru hari itu tentang procedure text. Tetapi sebelum saya mengulasnya lebih jauh, saya <i>membrainstorming</i> dengan bertanya kepada mereka terlebih dahulu bahwa apakah mereka sudah pernah belajar tentang jenis-jenis text sebelumnya, dan ternyata sudah ada sebagian text yang mereka sudah tahu, diantaranya narrative text, recount text, dan descriptive text.
Descriptive reflection	Reflective, not only a description of events but some attempt to provide reason/justification for events or actions but in a reportive or descriptive way.	<i>I chose this problem solving activity because I believe that students should be active rather than passive learners.</i>	Sesudah menjelaskan lebih jauh, saya memperlihatkan kepada siswa tentang contoh procedure text. Untuk dijadikan contoh saya tidak mengambilnya di dalam buku yang diberikan dari sekolah karena saya merasa bahwa contoh di dalam buku tersebut akan menyusahkan siswa untuk memahaminya terutama dari segi makna. Akhirnya, setelah saya pikir-pikir saya berikan saja mereka contoh yang sering mereka dengar atau mereka lakukan di rumah, seperti bagaimana cara memasak nasi, atau bagaimana cara membuat teh. Tetapi ternyata walaupun saya telah memberikan contoh semacam itu, mereka tetap juga tidak mengerti.

Hatton & Smith's types of reflective writing	Hatton & Smith's description of the writing	Hatton & Smith's examples of PSTs' writing	This study's examples of PSTs' writing in bahasa Indonesia
Dialogic reflection	Demonstrates a 'stepping back' from the events/actions leading to a different level of mulling about, discourse with self and exploring the experience, events and actions using qualities of judgement and possible alternatives for explaining and hypothesising. Such reflection is analytical or/and integrative of factors and perspectives and may recognise inconsistencies in attempting to provide rationales and critique	<i>While I had planned to use mainly written text materials I became aware very quickly that a number of students did not respond to these. Thinking about this now there may have been several reasons for this. A number of the students, while reasonably proficient in English, even though they had been NESB learners, may still have lacked some confidence in handling the level of language in the text. Alternatively a number of students may have been visual and tactile learners. In any case I found that I had to employ more concrete activities in my teaching.</i>	Kemudian saya membagikan mereka contoh lain tentang procedure text, dan dari contoh tersebut pada bagian generic structure yang ketiga dari procedure text (langkah-langkahnya) saya sudah mengacaknya. Saya memberi mereka waktu sekitar 20 menit. Ketika waktunya selesai saya meminta kepada setiap kelompok untuk menuliskannya di papan tulis. Dan ternyata semua pekerjaan mereka betul semua. Saya merasa bahwa mereka sudah mulai mengerti. Tetapi walaupun mereka mulai mengerti, saya merasa bahwa saya masih belum memberikan mereka inti dari membaca (reading) pada waktu itu, karena saya lebih banyak menjelaskan daripada memberikan mereka latihan membaca. Saya sadar bahwa itu adalah salah satu kekurangan saya sehingga dari sebagian tujuan pembelajaran saya belum tercapai.
Critical reflection	Demonstrates an awareness that actions and events are not only located in, and explicable by, reference to multiple perspectives but are located in, and influenced by, multiple historical, and socio-political contexts.	<i>What must be recognised, however, is that the issues of student management experienced with this class can only be understood within the wider structural locations of power relationships established between teachers and students in schools as social institutions based upon the principle of control.</i>	NA

After reading all data and identifying the categories in general, the next step was re-read the whole data, but this time more attention was paid to those identified texts from the first attempt of categorization. In this stage, the data were re-read more than one time in search for phases of dominant logico-semantic type 'temporal/causal' enhancement as indicative of *descriptive reflection* and phases of favored 'mental causal' giving angles of assessment, viz. mental reaction, judgement, and evaluation as indicative of *dialogic reflection* which satisfy a reflective thought unit (RTU).

In order to see the relational structure indicating the interdependency within a reflective thought unit (RTU), the smallest breakdown was started from the complex clauses in a sentence. Following Halliday and Mathiessen's (2004, 2014) suggestion in text analysis using functional grammar, each entry was divided into each sentence in order to locate the two fundamental relationships of logico-

Sitti Nurfaidah, 2016

EFL PRE-SERVICE TEACHERS' REFLECTION: A CASE STUDY IN AN INDONESIAN INSTRUCTIONAL CONTEXT

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

semantic relation, i.e. expansion (elaboration, extension, and enhancement) and projection (locution and idea). Expansion indicates the relation of phenomena as being of the same order of experience, whereas projection indicates the relation of phenomena of one order of experience (the processes of saying and thinking) to phenomena of a higher order (semiotic phenomena – what people say and think) (Halliday & Mathiessen, 2014, p. 443). The subtypes in these categories along with their definition are presented in Table 3.4.

**Table 3.4 Categories of logico-semantic relation
(source Halliday & Mathiessen, 2014, p. 444)**

Categories and subtypes	Definition
1. Expansion	The relation of phenomena as being of the same order of experience.
(1a) Elaborating: ‘i.e., e.g., viz.’	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One clause expands another by elaborating on it (or some portion of it): restating in other words, specifying in greater detail, commenting, or exemplifying.
(1b) Extending: ‘and, or’	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One clause expands another by extending beyond it: adding some new element, giving an exception to it, or offering an alternative.
(1c) Enhancing: ‘so, yet, then’	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One clause expands another by embellishing around it: qualifying it with some circumstantial feature of time, place, cause or condition.
2. Projecting	The relation of phenomena of one order of experience (the processes of saying and thinking) to phenomena of a higher order (semiotic phenomena – what people say and think)
(2a) Locution: ‘says’	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One clause is projected through another, which presents it as a locution, a construction of wording.
(2b) Locution: ‘says’	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> One clause is projected through another, which presents it as an idea, a construction of meaning.

Next, having located the various conjunctive resources realising the logical structure of the reflective thought on sentence level, then the logical connection was sought within the sub context, viz. the logical connection between sentences (the major context is the context of teaching process within a whole journal entry) as demonstrated in Table 3.6. The following annotation as illustrated in Table 3.5 serves the coding and categorization process throughout data analysis pertaining to level of reflection.

Table 3.5 Key to text-analysis annotations in identifying level of reflection

Annotation	Meaning
<u>dark purple bold underlined type</u>	= mental clause indicating the PST’s realization
green bold type	= conjunctive: elaboration

Annotation	Meaning
red bold type	= conjunctive: enhancement
blue bold type	= conjunctive: extension
black bold type	= modal judgement indicating the polarity in PST's way of expressing opinion
<u>(black underlined bracketed type)</u>	= key pattern of the occurrence of reflection and reflective analysis (mental reaction, judgement, evaluation, appreciation)
CAPITAL TYPE	= heading which binds the context in a reflective thought unit (RTU), decided after tracing the logical cohesion within smaller context in each entry, indicating the PST's main concern identified in each RTU
grey colored column	= descriptive writing
pink colored column	= descriptive reflection level
light green colored column	= dialogic reflection level
yellow colored column	= critical reflection (if available in PST's data)

Table 3.6 Process of coding and categorizing PST's level of reflection

No	Entry Breakdown per Sentence	General Pattern of Logical Cohesion	Context of Reflective Thought Unit	Notes
1	Dalam tulisan ini, saya akan mengulas kembali pengajaran saya di kelas yang baru saja selesai.			This is considered as <i>descriptive writing (non-reflective)</i> because it only contains description of phenomenon.
2	Ini yang pertama kalinya saya mengajar di kelas XI IPA2 pada hari Selasa.		First time teaching	This is <i>descriptive writing</i> but considered as part of <i>descriptive reflection</i> as it introduces the sub-context within this entry which considers about PST 2's emotional reaction towards her first assignment of teaching the real classroom.
3	Saya merasa sangat gugup karena tadinya saya berangkat dari rumah pagi-pagi untuk menemani partnerku di kelas XI IPS2 karena kebetulan dia mengajar di jam pertama yaitu jam 07.00-08.30 dan saya mengajar di jam kedua di IPA2.	realization (<u>reaction</u>) + enhancement (phenomenon) + enhancement (phenomenon) + extension (phenomenon)	DEALING WITH ANXIETY (first time teaching)	This is considered as <i>descriptive reflection</i> because it contains justification in simple way.
4	Tetapi karena anak kelas IPA2 tidak masuk di jam pertama jadi guru bahasa Inggris meminta saya masuk di kelas mereka.	enhancement (phenomenon) + enhancement (phenomenon)	Reason why teaching	<i>Reflective</i> : the continuation of the previous text (within the same context), also contains simple justification.
5	Sebenarnya saya sangat gugup bahkan sejak hari penerimaan.	elaboration (mental state)	Anxiety: verification of the state of being anxious	<i>Reflective</i> : overall verification of the context.
<i>NOTE: This context is categorized as one RTU in descriptive reflection level because reflection occurred in simple fashion as the PST realized about her anxiety through the flow of reasoning behind her mental reaction towards her first assignment of real classroom teaching. She was anxious because there was an unexpected change of teaching time. She further attempted to verify her state of anxiousness but not that much. [It serves the first form of Hatton & Smith's type of descriptive reflection as it is based generally on one perspective/factor as rationale]</i>				
6	Tetapi saat saya masuk kelas, saya menarik napas panjang.	enhancement (phenomenon)	WAYS OF DEALING WITH ANXIETY (dealing with anxiety in the class)	Descriptive: the initiation of another context (ways of dealing with anxiety in the classroom).
7	Setelah saya mengucapkan salam saya coba menjalankan rencana pengajaran seperti yang saya sudah siapkan.	enhancement (phenomenon)	anxiety: class activity: initiation	Descriptive: the continuation of the previous text.
8	Awalnya berjalan lancar.	enhancement (phenomenon)	anxiety: class activity: evaluation	Descriptive: the continuation of the previous text.
9	Mereka cukup tenang mendengarkan penjelasan materi, saking tenangnya saya jadi bicara sendiri karena mereka tidak merespon sama sekali.	(evaluation: appreciation) (phenomenon) enhancement (judgement)	anxiety: class activity: evaluation	<i>Descriptive reflection</i> : the continuation of the previous text, containing simple evaluation and judgement.

No	Entry Breakdown per Sentence	General Pattern of Logical Cohesion	Context of Reflective Thought Unit	Notes
10	Akhirnya untuk mengurangi ketegangan, saya mulai bercanda dan mereka mulai berani tersenyum bahkan ada yang tertawa keras dan mereka juga mulai berani bertanya.	enhancement (phenomenon: series of extension and enhancement)	anxiety: lessened	<i>Reflective</i> : the continuation of the previous text, the concession of the aforementioned judgement as way of lessening her anxiety.
		<i>NOTE: This context is also categorized as one RTU under descriptive reflection level. Reflection occurred in simple manner when PST, while finding ways in dealing with her anxiety, evaluated the classroom's situation as she delivered the material, judged the situation and wrapped up with her attempt to lessen her anxiety in descriptive way. [It also serves the first form of Hatton & Smith's type of descriptive reflection as it is based generally on one perspective/factor as rationale]</i>		
11	Tapi RPP yang saya siapkan tidak berjalan lancar dimana setiap kali saya meminta siswa mengerjakan sesuatu seperti memahami isi bacaan, menulis, atau berbicara mereka hanya diam padahal sebelum saya meminta mereka menulis atau berbicara saya menjelaskan dan memberikan contoh berulang kali menggunakan media.	enhancement (judgement : series of enhancement, elaboration and extension)	LESSON PLAN: not smooth	<i>Dialogic reflection</i> : the introduction to another context (the implementation of lesson plan during her first time teaching), containing judgement followed by series of expansion as an attempt to justify her judgement.
12	Mereka sangat bermasalah dengan grammar karena contohnya hanya dua kalimat mereka tulis tidak ada yang benar.	(judgement) enhancement (phenomena)	Reason why not smooth (problem)	<i>Dialogic reflection</i> : the continuation of the previous text, containing simple hypothesis to the problem faced. Here PST indicates her state of considering the problem and the alternative way in solving it.
13	Akhirnya saya menjelaskan grammar.	enhancement (phenomenon)	Solution to the problem	<i>Description</i> : the continuation of the previous text, containing the attempt to test the hypothesis.
14	Itupun mereka belum bisa juga.	enhancement (judgement)	Result (negative)	<i>Reflective</i> : the continuation of the previous text, contains judgement of the given phenomenon.
15	Jadi lesson plan benar-benar macet.	enhancement (evaluation)	Evaluation of lesson plan implementation	<i>Reflective</i> : the continuation of the previous text, overall evaluation of the context.
		<i>NOTE: This context satisfies the criteria of dialogic reflection type because the line of reasoning provided is in more analytical way than the previous RTU. Here PST initiated this RTU by attempting to judge the implementation of lesson plan through series of reasoning. Some judgements, hypothesis and attempt to test the hypothesis followed the reasoning and then ended up with an overall evaluation of the implementation of lesson plan. [It serves the first form of Hatton & Smith's type of dialogic reflection as it is based generally on one perspective/factor as rationale, in this context problem rooted in the students' difficulty with grammar]</i>		
16	Saya ingin sekali melihat guru bahasa Inggrisnya mengajar di kelas sebelum saya menggantikannya mengajar tapi sayangnya gurunya tidak mau diobservasi jadi pada pengajaran saya yang pertama ini, tidak ada yang bisa saya banggakan dan yang paling membuat saya merasa buruk adalah hasil tulisan saya di papan tulis sangat jelek dan berantakan.	realization (phenomena) + enhancement (phenomena) + enhancement (phenomena) + enhancement (phenomena) + realization (appreciation)	SELF-EVALUATION (inclination + self-evaluation of first teaching)	<i>Dialogic reflection</i> : the introduction to another context (self-evaluation of her first teaching), containing her inclination to get teaching model from her mentor teacher but not granted, followed by her negative appreciation towards her own board skill.
17	Saya juga tidak yakin apa mereka mengerti dengan materi yang saya bawakan atau tidak.	realization (evaluation)	self-evaluation: doubt on students' comprehension towards delivered material	<i>Dialogic reflection</i> : the continuation of the previous text, containing discourse with self on her doubt on students' level of comprehension towards her instructional material.
		<i>NOTE: This context is also put under dialogic reflection category because it demonstrates a discourse with self in evaluating the experience. Here the reflection was initiated by PST's inclination on teaching model but turned out not granted which justifies her self-evaluation. Some self-evaluation then expanded the reflection. [It serves the second form of Hatton & Smith's type of dialogic reflection as it is based generally on multiple analytical perspectives/factors]</i>		
18	Saya jadi benar-benar sadar ternyata jadi guru yang bisa membuat siswanya mengerti adalah hal yang paling sulit dilakukan.	realization (judgement)	AWARENESS (awareness of hardship in teaching)	<i>Dialogic reflection</i> : the introduction to another context (awareness of hardship in teaching), containing her realization of difficulties faced by the teacher.
19	Yah... paling tidak saya sudah ada keberanian untuk mengajar dan saya bersyukur siswanya cukup tenang.	elaboration + realization (appreciation) + elaboration + realization	awareness: self-appreciation	<i>Dialogic reflection</i> : the continuation of the previous text, containing discourse with self on appraising her own

Sitti Nurfaidah, 2016

EFL PRE-SERVICE TEACHERS' REFLECTION: A CASE STUDY IN AN INDONESIAN INSTRUCTIONAL CONTEXT

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

No	Entry Breakdown per Sentence	General Pattern of Logical Cohesion	Context of Reflective Thought Unit	Notes
20	Mungkin karena semua perempuan dan hanya satu laki-laki dan juga jumlahnya hanya 13 orang.	(phenomenon) presumption + enhancement (phenomenon) + elaboration (phenomenon)	Indication on mentioned appreciation	courage to teach and the classroom situation that helped her. <i>Reflective</i> : the continuation of the previous text, containing her assumption for such classroom situation which helped her deal with her first time teaching.
		NOTE: This context satisfies dialogic reflection level because it provides self-realization in evaluating the experience. Here, PST 2 reflected her raised awareness in teaching profession. Following reflection demonstrates her appreciation to herself of being able to have courage to teach. [It serves the first form of Hatton & Smith's type of dialogic reflection as it is based generally on one analytical perspective/factor]		

As illustrated in Table 3.6, the stages in coding and categorization phase in data analysis relative to level of reflection followed recurring reading process. After breaking down, in this case, each journal entry into sentences, then lexical devices in each sentence indicating logico-semantic relation were identified (based on key annotation in Table 3.5). Next, the general pattern of logical cohesion in each sentence was established based on the sub-types in logico-semantic relation categories. In so doing, the context of each sentence could be coded leading to categorization of context in a reflective thought unit (RTU). As a result of these three phases of coding and categorization, each RTU and its level of reflection could be identified and highlighted.

Furthermore, in search for evidences satisfying the criteria of *descriptive reflection* and *dialogic reflection* as well as *critical reflection*, where available, within a reflective thought unit (RTU), Pisova's (2005, as cited in Syslova, 2015) repeating stages of reflection was used to guide the appropriate identification of each level where mental operation was relevant. Pisova's stages of reflection as expressed by mental operations such as *description*, *analysis*, *evaluation*, *alternative*, *generalisation*, and *metacognition* were related to the results of the aforementioned three-phase coding and categorization. Table 3.7 depicts the process of further categorization using the modified version of Hatton and Smith's (1995) and Pisova's (2005) level of reflection as generated from this study's data. The sample of PSTs' reflection was taken randomly in order to illustrate the categorization of level of reflection from the lowest level to the highest one.

Table 3.7 Further process of coding and categorizing PST's level of reflection

PSTs' Sample of RTU	Context of RTU	Mental Operation Pattern in RTU	Level
Kalau kejadian lain di kelas tadi yaitu, saya biasa mengajar pake <i>infocus</i> <u>tapi</u> tiba-tiba <i>infocus</i> ada gangguan <u>jadi</u> saya tidak bisa memaparkan materi secara jelas tadi <u>karena</u> terkendala <i>infocus</i> .	PROBLEM WITH TECHNOLOGICAL DEVICE	analysis	DesR-L1
Saya malas <u>karena</u> stress hadapi siswa. <u>Jadi</u> , saya tidak semangat.	T's reaction to Ss' behaviour (result from previous meeting)	analysis ^ analysis	DesR-L1
<u>Tapi</u> ketika di kelas, setelah saya <i>mereview</i> saya masih punya banyak waktu. Sambil memeriksa tugas yang saya berikan <u>tiba-tiba</u> saya ada ide untuk main <i>game</i> dari tugas yang saya berikan. Setiap siswa saya minta menuliskan satu kalimat dari tugas mereka di papan tulis kemudian saya periksa grammarnya. Yang salah kalimatnya diberi hukuman untuk berlomba mengeja beberapa kata yang sudah saya siapkan dan yang paling cepat mengeja dengan benar saya beri nilai " <i>plus</i> " dan yang masih salah saya berikan lagi hukuman untuk menuliskan kalimat di papan tulis kemudian saya minta temannya yang sudah benar kalimatnya untuk memeriksa kalimat yang ditulis temannya.	CLASSROOM ACTIVITY (after review, sudden idea, game)	analysis ^ analysis ^ description ^ description	DesR-L1
PSTs' Sample of RTU	Context of RTU	Mental Operation Pattern in RTU	Level
Di awal pengajaran saya menjelaskan <i>simple present tense</i> . <u>Ketika</u> saya bertanya kepada mereka rumus dari <i>simple present</i> itu apa mereka sangat tahu, <u>tapi</u> ketika saya memberikan contoh kalimat mereka bingung sekali. Ada beberapa siswa sudah bisa <u>hanya</u> belum tepat secara <i>grammar</i> . Dalam hal ini, mereka <u>tidak dapat</u> membedakan yang seperti apa verbal sentences dan nominal sentences. Sebagai contoh mereka menuliskan " <i>She is buy shoes</i> ". Mereka juga masih salah dalam mencocokkan <i>personal pronoun</i> dengan <i>to be (am, is, are)</i> , <u>sehingga</u> tadi saya langsung banyak memberikan contoh kalimat verbal dan nominal seperti apa.	STUDENTS' PROBLEM (grammar)	description ^ analysis ^ analysis ^ analysis ^ description ^ analysis	DesR-L2
Pada pertemuan kedelapan ini saya masih melanjutkan materi sebelumnya (pertemuan ke-7), <u>karena</u> belum tuntas. Seperti biasanya pula, pertama-tama saya <i>mereview</i> kembali materi kemarin, kemudian saya membimbing mereka lagi untuk mengucapkan bersama-sama tentang " <i>expression of sympathy and showing affection</i> ". Dalam mengucapkan masing-masing dari ekspresi tersebut cukup <u>mengabiskan waktu</u> yang lama sampai mereka bisa mengucapkannya. Setelah mereka mengerti, saya memberikan mereka tugas per individu, dengan memberikan mereka percakapan, namun masing-masing kalimat dalam percakapan tersebut sudah teracak. Kemudian, sehubungan dengan percakapan yang teracak tersebut, saya memberi instruksi bahwa saya yang akan membacakan kalimat yang benarnya dan mereka memberikan nomor atau angka secara terurut, <u>sehingga</u> dengan begitu mereka dengan mudah menuliskannya kembali dengan benar.	TEACHING PROCESS (continue previous material, assuring Ss' pronunciation, dialogue)	analysis ^ description ^ analysis ^ description ^ analysis	DesR-L2
Pada pengajaran saya kali ini, saya sudah menyiapkan <i>worksheet</i> yang <u>saya yakini bisa membantu</u> siswa dalam menulis sebuah teks <i>analytical exposition</i> .	TEACHING PREPARATION (worksheet, for writing)	evaluation	DesR-TL
Saya mulai membuka kelas dengan menanyakan pelajaran apa saja yang telah mereka pelajari minggu lalu <u>namun</u> mereka tidak ada satupun yang menjawab pertanyaan saya. Kemudian saya melakukan <i>brainstorming</i> . Kelas itu sangat mengecewakan <u>sebab</u> tidak ada sama sekali interaksi timbal-balik antara saya dengan mereka. Kemudian saya mencoba untuk membuat suasana lebih nyaman <u>agar</u> mereka tidak merasa tegang <u>namun</u> usaha saya tetap saja gagal.	TEACHING PROCESS (Opening by reviewing but no response)	analysis ^ description ^ evaluation ^ analysis	DialR-L3
Tetapi saat saya masuk kelas, saya menarik napas panjang. Setelah saya mengucapkan salam saya coba menjalankan rencana pengajaran seperti yang saya sudah siapkan. Awalnya berjalan lancar. Mereka cukup tenang mendengarkan penjelasan materi, saking tenangnya saya <u>jadi</u> bicara sendiri <u>karena</u> mereka tidak merespon sama sekali. Akhirnya <u>untuk</u> mengurangi ketegangan, saya mulai bercanda <u>dan</u> mereka mulai berani tersenyum <u>bahkan</u> ada yang tertawa keras <u>dan</u> mereka juga mulai berani bertanya.	DEALING WITH ANXIETY (dealing with in class, tried to relax, lessened)	description ^ description ^ description ^ evaluation ^ analysis	DialR-L3
<u>Tapi</u> RPP yang saya siapkan tidak berjalan lancar dimana setiap kali saya meminta siswa mengerjakan sesuatu seperti memahami isi bacaan, menulis, atau berbicara mereka <u>hanya</u> diam <u>padahal</u> sebelum saya meminta mereka menulis atau berbicara, saya menjelaskan dan memberikan contoh berulang- menggunakan media. Mereka sangat bermasalah dengan <i>grammar</i> <u>karena</u> contohnya hanya dua kalimat mereka tulis tidak ada yang benar. <u>Akhirnya</u> saya menjelaskan <i>grammar</i> . Itupun mereka belum bisa juga. <u>Jadi</u> lesson plan benar-benar macet.	LESSON PLAN (not smooth, Ss' problem with grammar)	evaluation ^ analysis ^ analysis ^ analysis ^ evaluation	DialR-L4
Setelah saya mengamati mereka satu persatu, tumbuh dalam benak saya bahwa yang paling mereka tidak suka adalah ketika disuruh membaca satu persatu. Kenapa? Ada dua alasan kenapa saya mengatakan demikian. Yang pertama, ketika saya menyuruh mereka untuk membaca satu persatu ada saja tingkah yang mereka lakukan atau respon dan juga mimik wajah mereka yang tidak biasanya. Ada yang kelihatan bosan, ada yang keluar sebentar, dan lain-lain. Yang kedua, lain halnya ketika saya membacakan di depan dan saya menyuruh mereka untuk mengikuti, mereka sangat semangat dan antusias. Selain itu juga, saya berfikir bahwa mereka kayaknya	EVALUATION on STUDENTS' INDIFFERENCE (reasons for Ss' indifference towards reading aloud, lack of reading practice)	evaluation ^ evaluation ^ evaluation ^ evaluation ^ evaluation	DialR-L4

kurang sekali diberikan latihan untuk membaca.			
Saya mengusahakan siswa mengisi latihan yang saya berikan pada mereka yaitu menentukan mana termasuk <i>expression of satisfaction and dissatisfaction</i> . Mereka sangat merespon dan mengisinya. Dan setelah saya memeriksa jawaban mereka hampir semuanya benar. Tapi setelah itu saya pikir pengajaran saya harus lebih ditingkatkan lagi dan membuat siswa saya lebih antusias dalam belajar karena empat kali pertemuan sebelumnya saya hanya monoton mengajarkan mereka bagaimana cara menulis kalimat dengan baik dan benar padahal banyak hal-hal yang perlu ditingkatkan selain penulisan kalimat. Mereka juga kurang dalam kosakata serta <i>speaking</i> dan <i>readingnya</i> serta pengucapan dalam bahasa Inggris sangat hancur.	EVALUATION on STUDENTS' ACTIVITY & PERFORMANCE (Ss' activity, Ss' response, alternative activity, Ss' weakness)	description ^ evaluation ^ analysis ^ alternative ^ evaluation	DialR-L5
Secara keseluruhan kesan saya pada proses pembelajaran ini cukup menyenangkan. Anak-anak masih ada yang ribut tapi mereka mau mengikuti pelajaran. Anak-anak lebih tenang ketika datang Ibu Ririn yang melakukan <i>take video</i> sehingga saya berfikir memang sangat penting jika kita bekerja secara tim sehingga ada yang sebagai <i>teacher</i> dan ada yang sebagai <i>controller</i> karena dengan itu anak-anak dapat membatasi dirinya dengan tidak ribut, jalan kesan kemari, keluar masuk, bercerita, dan lain sebagainya. Setelah berakhirnya pelajaran, saya merefleksikan perasaan saya bahwa menjadi seorang guru itu sangat capek dan tidak mudah.	TEACHING & LEARNING PROCESS EVALUATION (fun, yet demanding: tiring and not easy)	evaluation ^ evaluation ^ alternative ^ metacognition	DialR-L5

Therefore, the overall process in identifying level of reflection in this study followed this procedure: Data of PSTs' reflection (e.g. reflective journal) → entry breakdown per sentence → General pattern of logical cohesion → Deciding RTU → Context and sub-context of RTU → Mental operation pattern in RTU → Modified level of reflection framework (Descriptive Reflection: *Low Level (L1)*, *High Level (L2)*, *Transition Level (TL)*; Dialogic Reflection: *Low Level (L3)*, *Moderate Level (L4)*, *High Level (L5)*; Critical Reflection (*L6*)) → Deciding level of reflection of each RTU.

3.6.3 Data Analysis regarding Issues/Concerns in Reflection

In analysing what becomes the PSTs' concerns in their reflection and reflective practice, framework in identifying the teachers' knowledge is used. Based on the consideration that this study is rooted on the educational philosophy of constructivism that knowledge is actively constructed and not passively received, the constructive view of teaching that involves the PSTs in making sense of their own classroom were taken into account and the way they took their role as reflective practitioners was also sought. Besides using Freeman and Johnson's (1998) criteria in defining second language teacher knowledge, the knowledge-base of second language teacher defined by Moradkhani, et al.'s (2013) is also used as the analytical framework in revealing the pre-service teachers' concerns in their reflection (see Appendix 18 for guideline for identifying issues in reflection).

3.6.3.1 Steps in Analyzing Issues/Concerns in PSTs' Reflection

Sitti Nurfaidah, 2016

EFL PRE-SERVICE TEACHERS' REFLECTION: A CASE STUDY IN AN INDONESIAN INSTRUCTIONAL CONTEXT

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

Taking advantage from process of categorization of context in the analysis of level of reflection, this process made use the identified category within each RTU as the point of coding and categorization (see Appendix 18 for guideline for identifying issues in reflection and Appendix 19 for sample of process coding).

Overall, the process in identifying issues in PSTs' reflection in this study followed this procedure: Data of PSTs' reflection (e.g. reflective journal) → entry breakdown per sentence in each decided RTU → Micro categories of each sub-context → Macro categories.

3.6.4 Interview

The semi-structured interview attempted to seek for further information such as the realization of reflective practice in the participants' teaching, in their journals, and during the video review. The transcribed data from interview procedure was compared constantly with the other data (see Appendix 10 for transcript of interviews). Emerging and recurrent themes were also sought from this data. Themes such as Dewey's element of reflection such as *suggestion, problem, hypothesis, reasoning* and *testing*, Hatton and Smith's (1995) level of reflection as well as Moradkhani, et al.'s (2013) language teacher knowledge-base were confirmed and disconfirmed. The analysed data was used to enrich participants' profile and findings in each research question.

3.7 Trustworthiness

Regarding that the PSTs' thought could not be directly accessed, data analysis was inescapably based on inference, which in this study was made mostly from the pre-service teachers' verbal behaviors. As a consequence, the research design attempted to include measures to ensure trustworthiness of research results.

Firstly, data triangulation was made possible through multiple data sources. The researcher strived to maintain rather extensive contact with the participants throughout the odd semester when data collection was ongoing. The PSTs' consent was sought for her to stay in touch with them when she was working on the findings of the study. Afterwards, member checks were performed at the

end of the data gathering. Lastly, the researcher asked two colleagues to engage in peer debriefing and comment on findings as they emerged.

3.8 Concluding Remarks

Chapter II has marked the theoretical and analytical framework of the present study. In this chapter, the research methodology underpinning the conduct of the case study has been discussed. Case study was of relevance because the present study only covered four individuals' reflective development, i.e. elements and levels of reflection as well as issues being concerned in their reflections, during their field teaching practice within a certain instructional context. The research questions that guided the design of the study have been illustrated and were sought to be answered through analytical frameworks which best fit the present study. The elements of reflection were analyzed using Dewey's (1933) and Loughran's (1996) suggestions in order the phases in the participants' reflection process. Hatton and Smith's (1995) analytical framework pertinent to the pre-service teachers' reflective teaching experiences during their field teaching practice with the help of Pisova's (2005, as cited in Syslova, 2015) stages of reflection and Halliday and Mathiessen's (2004, 2014) logico-semantic relation managed to identify their levels of reflection, even more established a modification in such identification. Meanwhile, data on the issues being concerned by the teachers in their reflections were explored using Moradkhani, et al.'s (2013) language teacher knowledge-base in order to confirm and disconfirm relevant studies. This following chapter presents the findings of the study followed by the discussion of the findings with regard to the relevant theoretical and empirical literary works.