

## **CHAPTER FIVE**

### **CONCLUSIONS, LIMITATION OF THE STUDY, AND SUGGESTIONS**

This chapter presents conclusions of the entire teaching program which took eight meetings and involved 34 tenth graders of a public senior high school in Bandung. This study was conducted to investigate how critical literacy is implemented in the teaching of writing Hortatory Exposition text based on Genre Pedagogy Approach in senior high school. This chapter also addresses the limitation of this study and suggestions for future research directions in the following sections.

#### **5.1. Conclusions**

According to classroom observation, students' reflective learning journals, students' works, and interview, the obtained data indicates that the integration of critical literacy to Genre-based Approach (GBA) led students to realize that there is no valued free in this world and to be critically literate. Moreover, the data also indicated several findings.

Based on the result of the analysis, the integration of critical literacy to the GBA was implemented in contextualized students' performance at all stages of GBA except the third one, Joint Construction. This stage was lack of students' exposure of critical literacy due more to the enactment of teacher's control over students' activities. Following Derewianka's suggestion (1990) that in Joint Construction a teacher may act as a scribe in front of classroom, the teacher in the present research still provided guidance and strong scaffolding to the students when they designed mind mapping and constructed an outline of Hortatory Exposition text in groups. Moreover, due to the time constraint and the demand of the task, the activities at this stage made the students very busy. They are then busy with their groups to contribute in the process of designing ideas in mind mapping and in constructing an outline of Hortatory Exposition text. This condition where the students 'buzz' or generate ideas

and opinions quickly and informally is common situation at Joint Construction stage (Harmer, 2004). This buzz situation made the interaction among students could not be analyzed in dept. However, if this stage was conducted in different way, critical literacy may occur at this stage (see Emilia, 2005).

At the first and second stages of GBA, Building Knowledge of the Field and Modeling, the students were invited to activate their prior knowledge through discussing everyday phenomena with critical lenses. Moreover, at the last stage of GBA, Independent Construction, the students were invited to communicate their new lines of thinking of related topics to be discussed in form of written texts. In addition, the result of the analysis reveals that the integration of critical literacy to the teaching program resulted some benefits and challenges. In terms of its benefits, the integration of critical literacy to GBA encouraged the students to realize that no text is ideologically neutral. This practice helped the students to recognize social inequalities represented in discourse and to be more responsible citizens. It also became a tool to guide the students to realize the existence of any ideological contents behind each text they read. The teaching program also prompted the students to write critically. This practice promoted students' critical literacy capacities that influenced students' higher awareness of diverse ways of thinking.

Based on the students' works, teaching program led the students to communicate their critical perspectives in a textual form. The data show that the students were able to assess the various ideas and information that they read and to decide which position that they stood for. Moreover, in constructing a text, the students were able to compose a text with a clear line of arguments. The integration of critical literacy to GBA also influenced students' linguistics comprehension and English proficiency. The students were able to use English as a tool for interpretation, analysis, and evaluation. English teaching, critical English teaching in this case, provided an opportunity for the students to explore sophisticated writing skills. Students' writing skills were more contextualized and coherent and students were

more fluent in expressing their ideas while at the same time becoming more critical. Moreover, the students also were able to construct authentic, communicative and meaningful language. Nevertheless, there are several benefits faced in this teaching program, involving time constraint, teacher demand and the variety of students' English proficiency.

In conclusion, in terms of Genre-based Approach, the GBA that was conducted in the present research falls the way in which the teacher put more control or scaffolding at the first three stages of this approach, Building Knowledge of the Field, Modelling, and Joint Construction. The teacher then hand-over some of her responsibilities in constructing a text to the students at the last stage of GBA, Independent Construction. It is stated "some" because at this stage the teacher actually still provided scaffolding over students when the teacher gave corrective feedback on students' first drafts.

In terms of critical literacy, critical literacy practices influence the students to be critically literate and to have critical multiple perspectives in seeing daily phenomena. In this practice, the students are invited to articulate their critical arguments and new lines of thinking. Meanwhile, Genre-based Approach in the present research plays its role as a tool to help them realize that every text has its own particular purposes and linguistics feature to convey its meanings. Therefore, the integration of critical literacy to Genre-based Approach has helped the students not only to be able to convey their critical multiple views and to expand their horizons but also to be able to organize their views or arguments in systematic and standard organization with specific purpose in form of Hortatory Exposition text.

## **5.2. Limitation of the Study**

There are some limitations of the study. Firstly, it deals with the length of the teaching process. Critical literacy is a lifelong process which should be embedded in every teaching. Eight meetings with 90 minutes for each were not sufficient to

comprehend all criteria of critical literacy deeply. However, this teaching program could be helpful to introduce the students with this concept of critical literacy. Secondly, this study engaged the researcher in studying and evaluating her own teaching. Accordingly, there might be a potential loss of objectivity in every stage of the research, including data collection and analysis.

### **5.3. Suggestions**

Based on the findings of the study, it is suggested that critical literacy is intensively embedded in the English language teaching in ESL/ EFL classroom, especially in the teaching of writing.

This research was carried out in short period of time, that is eight meetings. Due to the short length of time in conducting this case study, it is suggested that a longer study be carried out to gain richer findings and more in-depth analysis of a phenomenon. In addition, research on critical literacy should be broadened to other types of texts, to other contexts with regard to the recently curriculum. This practice will give reflexive implications of SFL pedagogy that it is applicable for teachers who are new to Systemic Functional Linguistics and who assume that SFL and GBA consist of many jargons that teachers cannot understand or use in the classroom (Gebhard, Chen, Graham, Gunawan, 2013). Besides, it is suggested that the amount of types of text thought in classroom should be appropriate to the students' capacity. For senior high school, it is suggested that one type of text is sufficient for one semester. Thus, all the aspects, such as linguistic feature and generic structure of the text can be delivered to the students properly. Moreover, in terms of analyzing students' writings, it is suggested that the analysis should involve many concepts proposed by SFL/GBA to yield more findings and more in-depth investigation.