

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

This chapter provides information regarding research question and the methodology used in the present research. The methodology covers the object of analysis, data collection method, as well as method of data analysis.

3.1. Research Question

The present study attempts to answer the following research questions:

- How do the subtitles and the non-verbal modes collaborate in conveying the meanings in the movie scenes?
- What are issues found in the analysis which are related to the practice of amateur subtitling?

3.2. Research Method

The present research is descriptive-qualitative in nature, for the research tries to give interpretation of the analysis. Qualitative method provides a detailed description and analysis of the quality, or the substance, of the human experience (Marvasti, 2002). It relies on linguistics rather than numerical data, and employs meaning-based rather than statistical data analysis form (Polkinghorne, 1983, in Elliott & Timulak, 2005). Meanwhile, research studies of descriptive design aim at examining situation and providing accurate factors relevant to the topic, relying on observation as means of data collection (van Wyk, 2012; Walliman, 2011). Such research involves collecting data describing event (situation) and organizing, tabulating, depicting, and describing the data collection, and often uses visual aids to help readers understand distribution of the data (Glass & Hopkins, 1984, in Alipio, 2013; Knupfer & McLellan, 1996).

The present study attempts to answer the research questions by taking into account the following procedure:

1. Transcribing verbal elements (ST dialogue, TT subtitles, back-translation), visual elements (vector, gaze, frame size, shot angle, layout composition), and acoustic elements (voice, background music, sound effects), and presenting the transcription in form of multimodal transcription table.
2. Interpreting meanings rendered in visual elements and determining the relation of modes (verbal, visual, and audio), whether the verbal mode (dialogue and/or subtitles) elaborates or extends the meanings in the moving images, or vice versa (Barthes, 1977, in Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006), or whether the scene illustrates redundancy in the relationship (see Marleau, 1982, in Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2014).
3. Making overall assumption based on the relationship between the verbal and the non-verbal modes in the scenes (for instance, the role of subtitles based on the text-image relationship in the scenes, or the influence of moving images on the process of subtitling).

In the present research, the analysis of the subtitle produced by amateur subtitle producers employed social semiotics multimodality (Kress, 2010; Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006; van Leeuwen, 2005). Multimodality focuses on how modes (audio, visual, and verbal) are put together in designing a semiotic product (Kress & van Leeuwen, 1996, p. 39, in Chuang, 2006). As an approach, multimodality views text of a film as a meaningful whole integrating meanings from all semiotic modes represented (Chuang, 2006). In line with this, Jewitt (2005) stated that the approach enables represented semiotic modes (represented in the text) to be taken into account and moves beyond considering the modes as ‘decoration.’ Drawing on Chuang (2009), the present research used multimodal transcription in the analysis. The transcription is presented in form of table, consisting of columns which contain temporal elements (duration in second), stills (visual frames), dialogue and subtitles transcription (as well as backtranslation), acoustic elements (voice, music, and sound effects), and interpretation of metafunctions. Multimodal transcription is useful to identify elements in a film and suggest how the elements

integrate to make meaning (Baldry & Thibault, 2006). It provides method of tracking down the meaning-making resources, as well as a basis for a coherent approach to subtitling (Taylor, 2003). The present research integrated transcription made by Chuang (2009) and cognitive frame analysis from Multimodal Pragmatic Analysis proposed by Mubenga (2009). The integration is expected to generate detailed multimodal transcription of the scenes. Among aspects in the transcription, visual grammar items such as gaze, shot size and shot angle were items to analyze (see Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006).

3.3. Data Source and Data Collection

The data source for the present research was Indonesian action-comedy film *Comic 8* (2014). The selection of the movie is based on the movie's popularity in Ganool.com. Within the category of Indonesian movie, *Comic 8* is one of the most viewed and downloaded movies. In addition to this, the movie has good rating, reaching 7.3 out of 10 on IMDb. Furthermore, in action-comedy movies, there is a great chance of the occurrence of fights or gunshooting scenes which are expected to illustrate the consideration of non-verbal modes in the subtitling of the scenes. *Comic 8* is an action-comedy film directed by Anggy Umbara, starring former Indonesian trio comedy group 'DKI', Indro, Nirina Zubir, Candil, and all StandUp Comedy Indonesia Kompas TV stars for third season as protagonists, and Pandji Pragiwaksono and Nikita Mirzani as antagonists. The plot goes around secret agents' trial to thwart bank robbery. The film combines aspects of action movie (e.g., gun shootings, bomb detonating, and fights) with comical elements, such as jokes, silly acts, and funny skits.

Since the topic highlights phenomenon related to practice of amateur subtitling, the film was obtained by downloading it from a website providing free film download service, Ganool.com. Ganool.com is chosen as the website providing the source of data due to its popularity as a website providing free movie-download service. Despite the piracy issue, such websites gain great popularity for their free download service, allowing people to download and

watch films without having to pay a significant price as those buying original DVDs or Blu-ray discs. The download package consists of one single file—the film file which has been synchronized with closed caption (subtitles) that can be shown or hidden to audience's liking by enabling/disabling the captions option in the media player used. However, as Manchón (2013) noted that amateur subtitle producers (including fansubbers) usually do not have access to the original script, it should be taken into account that when producing the subtitles, the amateur subtitle producers are more likely to translate the dialogue directly from the film, without the original scripts as the guide. Thus, chances are the amateur subtitle producers translate the dialogue in the scenes directly while watching the film and, possibly, considering the non-verbal modes constituting the scene in the translation.

Data for the research were 15 scenes collected through screening process. In the process of screening, the film was watched thoroughly from the beginning to the end and situation depicted in the scenes are examined (for instance, what happens in a certain place or what the character does) to determine which scenes are the key scenes in the film and how many key scenes the film has. The researcher uses the term 'key scene' to refer to scenes which illustrate important and/or unique events which build the story plot. However, it has to be taken into account that the determination of key scenes is subjective. In addition to this, most of scenes selected illustrate the action of fighting which is central to the genre (action comedy), although the rest of the scenes do not illustrate the fights. After the film was counted in terms of key scenes, only half of the total number of key scenes were selected; therefore, only 15 key scenes from a total of 30 key scenes were selected. This selection is due to the consideration of time. The analysis for each scene is quite long, which means that for each scene, the analysis done is quite time-consuming. Thus, by selecting only half of the key scenes, it is expected that the research can be conducted in shorter time, which would be very helpful for the researcher. After the scenes are selected, the dialogue and the subtitles, as well as visual and acoustic aspects or elements in the scene are transcribed and presented in the form of multimodal transcription table.

3.4. Data Analysis

The analysis of the present research involves the following steps:

- For the multimodal transcription table, the present research integrates Chuang's transcription table (2009) and Mubenga's cognitive frame analysis table (2009). Chuang's transcription table covers transcription of ST dialogue, TL subtitles, and the description of images and sound effects. Meanwhile, Mubenga's cognitive analysis table covers more elements including visual frames (stills), interpretation of metafunctions realized through visual elements, characteristics of speakers' voice, and the explication of speech-image-text relations (the relationship between the verbal and the non-verbal modes). The transcription can be presented as follows:

Table 3.1. Transcription table

Time	Moving images	Indonesian dialogue	English subtitle	Sound and sound effect (sfx)
00:00 – 00:00	Sequence of frames (each frame may differ in terms of duration per second)	SL dialogue	TL subtitle	Speakers' voice characteristics and intonation
Moving-images description Speakers' position, gaze, shot size and shot angle, actions, facial expression etc.		Back-translation Translation of SL dialogue		Background music and sound effects
Speech-Text-Image relation		Functions of each mode and the way all modes are related to each other and integrated to create complex meaning.		



- Elaborating the potential meanings carried by visual elements (vector, gaze, frame size, shot angle, and layout composition) and determining the relationship between the verbal and the non-verbal mode, whether the non-

verbal modes elaborate or extend the meanings in verbal mode, and vice versa (see Barthes, 1977, in Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006). In this step, the determination of the image-text relation is done in two levels. In the first level, the relationship determined is one between the dialogue and the image. In the second level, the relationship determined is one between the subtitles and the image.

- Determining the influence of the text-image relationship into subtitling process (for instance, the relationship between the dialogue and the image triggers the use of text reduction, which further affects the subtitles).

In addition to these steps, other issues found in the analysis (for instance, translation issues) will be further discussed in the discussion section (chapter 4). To give a clearer procedure of the data analysis, an example of multimodal transcription is presented as follows:

Table 3.2. Example of Data Analysis

Scene 2: Junior high school student extorted money by a big guy					
Time	Moving images	Indonesian dialogue	English subtitles	Sound and sound effect (sfx)	
04:26 – 04:28		Iqbal: <i>Wei, wei, wei, wei, wei!</i> <i>Gue barusan dipalak, gue malah untung goceng.</i> Student 2: <i>Ha? Di mana?</i>	[04:26 – 04:27] <i>Someone just tried to extort money from me, yet I ended up making profit from him.</i> [04:27 – 04:28] <i>Where?</i>	Voice: Iqbal uses high intonation, expressing his excitement. SFX: (no SFX)	
04:29 – 04:31		Iqbal: <i>Noh, noh, noh, noh, sama gajah Afrika. noh!</i> Student 2, 3, 4: <i>Ayo! Ayo! Ayo!</i>	[04:29 – 04:32] <i>There. The big guy over there.</i> [04:32 – 04:33] <i>Come on. Let's go!</i>	Iqbal points at a big guy, shouting. Student 2, 3, and 4 yell excitedly. SFX: (no SFX)	
Vector shift: Student 2, 3, 4 → Iqbal → A big guy (pointed by student 1)		Back-translation:			
Shot size and angle: Medium shot represents regular social relationship between the students and audience, implying that the scene is a representation of common daily life. The angle is oblique and eye-level, putting audience in the equal position to the students, yet detaching audience from them.		Student 1: Seseorang mencoba merampas uang saya, tapi saya justru dapat untung dari orang tersebut. Student 2: Di mana?			

<p>Gaze: No direct gaze at audience, implying that audience only observe the situation portrayed in the scene.</p> <p>Composition: Given (students) – New (big guy)</p>	<p>Student 1: Di sana. Pria besar itu.</p> <p>Students 2, 3, 4: Ayo pergi!</p>
<p>Speech-Text-Image Relation</p>	<p>The scene illustrates a junior high school student (Iqbal) who is extorted by a big guy (Fico), yet eventually gets money from him. The student tells his friends about what happened to him and, since he told them that he got money instead of losing one, his friends become excited and want to get money as well.</p> <p>Based on the analysis of visual aspects, the vector shifts from Iqbal's friends to him (Iqbal's friends look at him), and then from Iqbal and his friends to the big guy (Iqbal points at the big guy). The junior high school students become the actor, while the big guy pointed by Iqbal becomes the goal, the person Iqbal talks about.</p> <p>The situation in the scene is presented in medium shot, implying that the relationship between audience and participants (junior high school students) in the scene is social. Furthermore, participants do not show direct gaze at audience, implying that audience only observes the situation. The scene was also shot in oblique, eye-level angle, putting audience in the equal position to the participants, yet detaching them from the participants. Those aspects (frame size, gaze, and angle) presents the situation in the scene as a representation of common daily life; the situation may happen in real life and it is common, yet audience is not involved in the situation, merely observing it.</p> <p>The scene employs left to right layout composition, represented by junior high school students and the big guy (who is absent in the scene, but represented by Iqbal's gesture pointing at the guy's place). According to Kress and van Leeuwen (2006:181), elements positioned in the left is a <i>given</i> information and elements positioned in the right is a <i>new</i> information. Based on the situation, junior high school students represent a given information, implying that what is encountered by the students (extortion) is something common which audience may already know. In other hand, the big guy represents a new information, implying that an extorter who surprisingly gives money instead of extorting money is something new or unusual. The positioning of the big guy as a new information may be due to the nature of the film as action-comedy. The big guy is supposedly a bad guy, yet he behaves in a weird way which does not show his 'evil' side and makes him an</p>

	<p>awkward character instead. Thus, the big guy represents a new, unique 'stereotype' and becomes a comical character significant to comedy film.</p> <p>Regarding the relationship between visual mode and verbal mode, subtitles as verbal mode functions as an elaboration to the visual mode. According to Barthes (1977, in Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006:18), verbal text may function to elaborate the image, and vice versa, restating the same meaning in different way. The subtitles serves as the target language transcription of the source language dialogue. In other hand, the image also elaborates the subtitles, providing illustration of the situation based on the subtitles.</p>
--	--

The transcription table used includes information of visual elements in the scene, which are significant for the analysis. The involvement of visual elements such as vector, frame size, shot angle, gaze, and layout composition is expected to make the analysis more comprehensive. Moreover, by using this transcription table, it is expected that the relationship between verbal elements (dialogue and subtitles) and non-verbal elements (moving image and sound) can be observed more clearly. Furthermore, the transcription table is also helpful in illustrating any other issues or findings in the analysis, such as the use of translation strategy which may affect the shift of text-image relationship, which will be further discussed in chapter 4.

titling of Comic 8 from a Multimodal Perspective.

