

CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Research

In a world where the global pandemic feels long over and life has returned to normal, we will still feel its imprint all too clearly. The educational sector, especially, was hit hard, with schools shut down overnight and teachers and students forced into longer periods of isolation. According to UNESCO (2020), 1.5 billion students, about 91.3 percent of the global student population, had to transition to learning from home at the peak of the pandemic. Worldwide, approximately 1.5 billion students had been impacted by it. This unprecedented disruption exposed an important challenge: many teachers were neither prepared nor equipped to pivot quickly from traditional face-to-face instruction to remote teaching. Most of the teachers were not well-versed in the virtual platforms and strategies for delivery and struggled to deliver lessons remotely, especially considering the physical separation from students. Ensuring students' active participation, motivation to learn, and quality of the learning process became serious problems.

The challenge was particularly pronounced in Indonesian education, where remote learning was still relatively novel, especially in primary and secondary schools. Several studies (Anugrahana, 2020; Asmuni, 2020; Churiyah et al., 2020; Febrianto, Mas'udah, and Megasari, 2020; Lestyanawati, 2020; Azzahra, 2020; Rigianti, 2021; Widodo & Nursaptini, 2020) have documented that teachers' unpreparedness stemmed from various factors, including inadequate digital infrastructure, geographical challenges, limitations in technological tools (such as gadgets and internet quotas), and insufficient digital literacy. These challenges made the shift to online learning a daunting task for many educators.

Even if Indonesia has mostly resumed its life before the pandemic, the pedagogical need for virtual and distance learning persists due to long-lasting

structural and contextual reasons. An additional challenge is that Indonesia's geography as an archipelagic country, and its exposure to natural calamities such as earthquakes, floods, or volcanic eruptions, have also disrupted regular schooling and equitable access to qualified teachers. Remote teaching approaches can thus play a critical role in trying to maintain the continuity of education. As Warsihna et al. (2023) put it, "Distance education does not only represent an emergency measure; it can also constitute a sustainable strategy in areas prone to disasters...its flexible and resilient character is appropriate where disruptions are unpredictable".

In addition to being reliant on geographic contingencies, the use of digital technologies as a pedagogical response is no longer a stopgap measure. Even teachers and learners who were previously non-users of technology were forced to become digitally literate and to adopt and apply technology for teaching and learning during the COVID-19 pandemic, thereby initiating a process of hybridization and technologization of teaching and learning. This shift is in accordance with international trends toward autonomy, inclusiveness, and future readiness. Digital platforms auto-skills and motivates, while supporting at the level of, and with reference to, the specific context, increasing engagement (Yunus and Bachtiar, 2025). In addition, Akbar (2023) argues, "it is a must for Indonesian distance education to be institutionalized so that it will create resilience in the education system amid health crises, economic limitations, and changes in the world of education in the future". In this sense, it does not mean that teaching presence strategies for the virtual environment come from a time of disaster, but rather that they are part of the foundation of a new, integrative, and prospective educational atmosphere.

In contrast, teachers who challenged themselves and practiced new pedagogical strategies became adept at using online learning platforms — they perfected apps that captured brainstorming and embraced call-and-response techniques to keep students engaged — during the pandemic, when many students suddenly switched to remote learning platforms. Distance learning, enabled by a

multitude of educational platforms, has been an essential tool in overcoming this crisis. But because teachers weren't prepared to use these tools, they struggled to make the most of what they can offer. This was pronounced among English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teachers in Indonesia (Atmojo & Nugroho, 2020). Many Indonesian English teachers face various obstacles to online instruction due to low acquaintance with digital instruction or digital learning (Hermansyah & Aridah, 2021). Some research regarding pre-service teachers indicates uncertainty regarding their ability to effectively teach online, citing a lack of experience and confidence in pedagogy (Dewi, 2021). Moreover, Son (2018) conducted an online teaching survey and reported that major issues faced in online teaching included designing interactive activities, engaging students and peering through technological barriers, and Hassan (2021) specified that challenges such as an unsuccessful transition of face-to-face instructions to online mode, limited interaction opportunities and minimal engagement affected teachers when online courses transitioned.

One key to successful online learning, however, is not merely the technology itself but how it is used to build a sense of teaching presence. Teaching presence is defined as the design, facilitation, and direction of cognitive and social processes to achieve meaningful and educationally worthwhile learning outcomes (Anderson et al., 2001). It refers to the "visibility" of the teacher in a virtual learning environment (Baker, 2010), and encompasses the methods used by instructors to foster quality learning experiences that encourage productive communities of inquiry (Bangert, 2008). Research has consistently shown that teaching presence is crucial in fostering student-instructor connections in online learning, enhancing student satisfaction, and improving academic outcomes (Celik, 2021).

Despite its importance for learning and teaching processes in the online environment, the elements of teaching presence have been poorly researched in primary and secondary education, especially outside their native countries, the West. Garrison et al. (2001) initially proposed a framework for teaching presence

for application to higher education, though most of the research on remote pedagogy has examined tertiary-level instruction. There has been less conversation about how remote pedagogy translates to primary and secondary education (Morgado et.al, 2024). In Indonesia, Zein et al. According to (2020), "ICT integration" has driven national narratives on educational technology but has offered limited insight into how to deliver content online effectively. Remarkably, most research has focused on various aspects of teachers' preparedness, difficulties encountered, and attitudes towards online learning. In summary, teaching presence in primary and secondary education in Indonesia still remains significantly under-researched and should be addressed in future studies.

The proliferation of technology in our lives has enabled us to overcome the limitations of time and space in education. Nevertheless, the ability to connect virtually is simply not enough from a teaching and learning perspective. And in the context of remote learning, students and teachers must show up psychologically, emotionally, and behaviorally to be able to interact meaningfully with one another. The defining difference between traditional classrooms and virtual classrooms is the physical distance between the students and the instructors. It is this separation that ultimately can result in disconnection and disengagement, particularly among students as well as a key reason people dislike online (Palloff & Pratt, 2007). As such, teachers need to have both corresponding technical skills as well as a thorough knowledge of establishing (and keeping) teaching presence through online modalities. According to Denniston (2025), teaching presence, which belongs to the wider online learning pedagogy, is one of the most critical aspects of teachers' professional development, which is especially significant in the scope of distance learning. Although ICT integration has been incorporated into teacher training curricula, teachers require much more than just basic skills to facilitate remote learning effectively. They also need pedagogical strategies to engage and support students in virtual classrooms (Azzahra, 2020).

1.2 Statement of the Problem

The effectiveness of teaching presence is essential for the success of remote teaching and learning; however, research on this critical aspect remains limited and often overlooked. To ensure the success of online education, teachers must have a solid understanding of teaching presence and possess the necessary skills to implement it effectively. Teaching presence encompasses several key components, including instructional design, facilitating meaningful discourse, and delivering direct instruction. Mastery of these elements is crucial for fostering an engaging and productive learning environment in remote settings.

For teachers to succeed in remote teaching, they must not only be familiar with these components but also employ effective strategies to incorporate them into their practice. Without a strong teaching presence, students may struggle to remain engaged, and learning outcomes may be compromised. In the context of Indonesian EFL (English as a Foreign Language) education, this issue is particularly pressing given the challenges faced by teachers during emergency remote teaching. The rapid shift to online learning during the pandemic exposed gaps in teachers' preparation and their ability to effectively use remote teaching strategies.

Therefore, exploring and improving the teaching presence strategies used by Indonesian EFL teachers in emergency remote teaching is urgently needed. This is in addition to these approaches being in accordance with the recent shifts in Indonesia's national English curriculum, which stresses the importance of communicative competence, autonomous learners, and digital literacy. This means that, as stated in Kurikulum Merdeka, teachers should create flexible and student-oriented technology-embedded learning experiences that focus on the language skills that are important for learners (Fajari & Aminuddin, 2024).

1.3 Theoretical Framework

The research presented here is framed within the Community of Inquiry, or CoI framework for understanding online learning, which identifies meaningful online

learning as the convergence of teaching presence, social presence, and cognitive presence (Garrison, Anderson, & Archer, 2000). The emphasis is on teaching presence, the “planning, guidance, and control of the cognitively and socially supportive experiences that make learning meaningful” (Anderson et al., 2001). The CoI framework influences the questions asked, the way in which the tools for collecting data are designed, and the coding by theme done during the analysis.

My work is framed through this ERT paradigm during the COVID-19 crisis in Indonesia. The teachers I observed were not proactively developing e-learning programs but were rather responding to a crisis, oftentimes with little funding and almost no instructional training. Online native learnings, nevertheless, their approaches, including scaffolding via WhatsApp, asynchronous feedback loops, and culturally responsive design, represent lessons to be taken for any following online learning in Indonesia.

1.4 Research Objectives

The objective of the study was to explore Indonesian EFL secondary school teachers’ strategies for bringing teaching presence into their remote instruction. In this research, teaching presence is defined as design or organization, facilitation of discourse, and direct instruction (Anderson, Rourke, Garrison & Archer, 2001). As teaching presence encompasses the three elements mentioned above, the study addressed the strategies developed to implement each of them. For more clarity, here are the details of the research objectives:

1. To explore how EFL teachers in secondary schools designed and organized their online course(s).
2. To explore how EFL teachers in secondary schools facilitated discourse among course participants.
3. To explore how EFL teachers in secondary schools engaged in direct instruction to course participants.

1.5 Research Questions

Anchored in the Teaching Presence of Community of Inquiry framework, the present study will address the following three research questions:

1. How did EFL teachers in secondary schools design and organize their online course(s)?
2. How did EFL teachers in secondary schools facilitate discourse among course participants?
3. How did EFL teachers in secondary schools engage in direct instruction to course participants?

1.6 Methodology

This study explored teachers' Teaching Presence strategies in response to the challenge of teaching and learning remotely. The study specifically strived to disclose teachers' strategies in bringing Teaching Presence into remote teaching and learning. The study employed a qualitative research design. In qualitative research, the researcher learns to understand the meaning of the lives of participants (Rossman & Rallis, 2016) and seeks to reveal more wholly the importance and meaning of human experience. Narrative Inquiry was used in the study through which teachers at secondary schools were examined to reveal Teaching Presence strategies in response to remote teaching and learning phenomena they experienced.

The participants were selected through purposive sampling (Patton, 2023), which is a technique widely used in qualitative research for the identification and selection of information-rich cases for the most effective use of limited resources. The researcher selected 10 EFL teachers as participants from Junior and Senior High schools in several cities in West Java Province who were actively teaching remotely during the pandemic. The researcher identified and selected those who were especially knowledgeable about or experienced with the phenomenon of interest and willing to participate (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2017).

Data were mined through virtual semi-structured interviews, Focus

Group Discussions (FGDs), and Teacher Journals. First of all, the interviews relied on asking questions within a predetermined thematic framework. However, the questions were not set in order or in phrasing. Semi-structured interviews offer advantages like more comparable and reliable data, flexibility to ask follow-up questions, no disruptions, more detail and richness as it is more open-ended nature (Cyr, 2019). Secondly, Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) are qualitative research method that can collect rich and diverse data from the participants. They bring together a small group of people who share some common characteristics or experiences related to your research topic, and engage them in a moderated discussion. FGDs, as Green Garage (2020) mentions, provide a deeper understanding of the perspectives, opinions, attitudes, and feelings of the participants, as well as the reasons behind them. And finally, Teacher Journals are a form of reflective writing that can help document and analyze the participants' online teaching experiences, challenges, and achievements. They also benefit from communicating and collaborating with other online teachers and sharing their experiences, challenges, and best practices (Staake, 2023).

Narrative inquiry was used to analyze and present the findings due to its ability to capture human interaction and experience. It is a sophisticated and incredibly helpful way to elucidate the nuances and specifics of past events (Wang and Geale, 2015). Then, the process of analysis made use of NVivo 12 Plus qualitative data analysis software as it helps the researcher gather all materials about a theme, idea, or topic together through coding and speed up the analysis by automatically coding the data ("14 Reasons Why NVivo is the Best Qualitative Data Analytics Software", 2023).

1.7 Significance of the Study

The result of the study could offer several important contributions, both theoretically and practically, for various stakeholders:

1. To begin with, the study could reap theoretical benefits. It could enrich and

strengthen the existing e-learning framework, particularly in the context of EFL instruction. Teaching presence has been developed with the invention of Community of Inquiry (CoI) framework. However, the research still calls for further exploration to settle better implementation. The research on teaching presence has been conducted mainly at the university level; on the other hand, little attention is given to secondary education. Therefore, the result of the research could yield new insights into how teaching presence strategies are applicable in secondary schools. By exploring the presence strategies used by Indonesian EFL teachers, the study added depth to our understanding of effective teaching practices in online settings. Finally, research on teaching presence was commonly survey-based. Narrative inquiry employed in this study could pave the way for a better understanding of online learning instructional strategies performed by teachers. Through narrative analysis of EFL teachers' voices, the research could contribute to the advancement of theoretical frameworks related to online course design, discourse facilitation, and direct instruction. It might provide insights into the adaptation of existing educational theories to the digital learning landscape.

2. The second contribution was that the government and stakeholders could consider the result of the research to issue a policy with regard to online learning implementation. For teacher colleges, policy regarding teaching presence could be in the form of integrating teaching presence into the course of teaching methodology. Research in Indonesia so far, as previously elaborated, has centered around online learning infrastructure, internet facilities, and digital literacy. This research, which focused on Teaching Presence, could be the government's foothold in providing training for teachers. The policy could potentially enhance the quality of distance learning in Indonesia. The research findings might have implications for educational policies related to online learning in Indonesia. Insights into effective presence strategies could inform policy decisions regarding the integration of technology in education and the

provision of support for EFL teachers transitioning to online instruction.

3. Practically, the research could provide alternative viewpoints and solutions to the problems of online learning. What teachers had been trying to practice was how to use information and communication technology (ICT) and various learning platforms with their learning features. This study could provide a picture of how learning materials should be delivered in accordance with good Teaching Presence strategies, thus motivating teachers to learn and try out the strategies in their online classes. Online learning will prevail after the pandemic. Many predicted that it will be the future of education (Li & Lalani, 2020; Chatterjee & Mousomi, 2023; Josep, 2020; Bashir & Lapshun, 2024) . Therefore, the world will not return to normal 100%. Educational technology can bridge the limitations of space and time in the future. It can also be the solution to those who have limited access to education due to geographical isolation or in case of an emergency. What this means is that teachers' knowledge and skills in teaching presence are imperative for a future teaching career. Teachers have to acquire the knowledge and skills of teaching presence strategies even when the pandemic is over. The research findings can inform teacher professional development programs aimed at enhancing EFL teachers' competencies in online instruction. Practical insights into effective course design, discourse facilitation, and direct instruction can support teachers in delivering high-quality online education.
4. The practical insights garnered from the research can be used to enhance curriculum development, especially in creating online EFL classes. Knowing effective strategies in designing and organizing online courses and facilitating discourse can help curriculum developers create more engaging and effective learning experiences for students.
5. And last but not least, the result of the study could enhance student learning outcomes in EFL instruction. This work can help to the creation of a more engaging and supportive learning environment for students by identifying effective presence strategies employed by teachers in future online learning

contexts.

1.8 Clarification of Key Terms

1. **Cognitive Presence**, in the context of online learning, refers to the intellectual effort and critical thinking required for meaningful learning. It involves learners actively constructing and confirming understanding through reflection, inquiry, and sustained dialogue with others. This presence supports deep learning by encouraging analysis, integration of ideas, and knowledge application (Moore & Miller, 2022).
2. **Curriculum requirements**: are the knowledge, skills and standards students are to learn and educators are to teach. These are normally set in some kind of national or institutional framework and generally are to guarantee consistency, relevance and quality. These include subject matter, methods of teaching, methods of assessment, and contributing goals, such as equity, inclusion, and lifelong learning. Curriculum demands to be understood as the “systematic and intentional signal of what, why, how, and how well students should learn in a given context” (UNESCO IBE, 2023) .
3. **Direct Instruction**: is a component of Teaching Presence in the Community of Inquiry Framework that focuses on giving clear instruction, explanations, and clarifications to improve comprehension and support learning advancement (Anderson et al., 2001). It includes a range of teaching methods such as lectures, demonstrations, guided practice, and modelling skills or concepts.
4. **Distance Learning**: refers to a method of studying where students are not physically present in the classroom, and the instructor is located in a different place using technology to connect, like web-based programs, video calls, and management systems. It enables learning facilitators and learners to interact asynchronously or synchronously without being in the same physical space in a traditional classroom. However, it can provide a flexible approach to learning useful for students from all walks of life who are trying to balance education

with work or family obligations. Distance learning that is good has appropriate instructional materials and promotes rigorous communication and feedback to meet learning goals (Moore & Kearsley, 2012). As technology advances, distance learning also becomes an integral way of continuing education in the context of higher education, professional training and lifelong learning (Hodges et al., 2020).

5. **Emergency remote teaching (ERT)** refers to a “sudden and involuntary transition of instructional delivery to an alternate delivery mode in response to a crisis”. It is the remote teaching options used for an in-person or blended/hybrid course that will return to its original in-person instructional format once the crisis or emergency has passed. In these cases the goal was less about recreating a vibrant educational system, but instead about “access to teaching and teaching supports which can be easily deployed and are dependably accessible in an emergency or crisis situation” (Hodges et al 2020 Fuchs 2022; Bozkurt & Sharma 2020; (Ferri et al, 2020; Menezes, 2025; Whittle et al, 2020).
6. **Facilitating Discourse** is a key component of Teaching Presence in the Community of Inquiry Framework. It entails leading and encouraging meaningful interactions among learners to promote a collaborative learning atmosphere (Garrison, Anderson, & Archer, 2001). The approach includes methods, as well as prompting conversation, giving feedback on contributions, moderating discussions for relevance and depth, and promoting active engagement from all learners.
7. **Focus Group Discussion:** qualitative research commonly employed in social science and market research. It is a small group of individuals of 6 to 12 participants, to discuss a specific topic under the guidance of a moderator (Bernard, Wutich, & Ryan, 2016).
8. **Narrative Inquiry** is a qualitative method of data collection for exploring and collecting information of specific individuals or small groups over time,

drawing in or focusing on the unique narratives, stories, or lived experiences of each. The technique largely draws on extensive interviews, which researchers record, transcribe and arrange in a chronological sequence based on the narrative the individuals create regarding their experiences (Kwon, 2021).

9. **Online learning** is a purposeful, flexible, and pedagogically supportive form of teaching and learning that uses technology to mediate learning. It is also generally accompanied by institutional support in the form of infrastructure, teams of instructional designers, and time frames for planning. As Hodges et al. (2020) online learning should be “the product of purposeful design and planning through a systematic model for development”.
10. **Online Learning Pedagogy** refers to a structured set of methods, strategies, and practices designed to facilitate effective teaching and learning in online or blended environments. It emphasizes instructional design, active engagement, and meaningful interaction to ensure student success when learners and instructors are separated by distance (Arnavut, 2020).
11. **Remote Instruction, or Online Education**, refers to teaching and learning methods designed for situations where students and instructors are separated by distance and do not meet in a traditional classroom. It relies on digital technologies and online platforms to deliver content, engage learners, and facilitate interaction and assessment (Hodges et al., 2020).
12. **Social Presence** refers to the degree to which individuals feel socially and emotionally connected with others in a mediated, often online, environment. It reflects the ability to project oneself as a real person, fostering interaction, trust, and collaboration, which are essential for meaningful learning experiences in virtual settings (Kreijns, Xu, & Weidlich, 2021).
13. **Teacher Journal**: is a reflective journal or teaching diary, is an instrument used by teachers to document their thoughts, reflections, experiences, and insights related to their instructional practice (Ragawanti, 2024; Almutawa, H.,

& Alfahid, M, 2024). It functions as a personal record of professional development, allowing teachers to reflect on their teaching strategies, classroom interactions, successes, challenges, and areas for improvement.

14. **Teaching Presence:** refers to the design, facilitation, and direction of cognitive and social processes to support meaningful learning, especially in online or blended environments (Anderson et al., 2001). It is a key element of the **Community of Inquiry (CoI)** framework, ensuring that learners are guided through structured instructional design and active facilitation (Garrison, 2016). Teaching presence involves planning content, moderating discussions, and providing feedback to promote critical thinking and engagement (Shea et al., 2006). Importantly, **Teaching Presence** is distinct from **Teacher Presence**. While teacher presence emphasizes the instructor's social and physical visibility in the learning space (Castellanos-Reyes, Richardson, & Swan, 2021), teaching presence focuses on pedagogical actions that guide and support learning, whether or not the teacher is visible. Thus, teaching presence reflects the instructor's role in shaping the learning experience through thoughtful instructional practices, making it essential for effective online learning.
15. **The community of Inquiry (CoI) framework** is a model for understanding meaningful learning in online and blended environments through the integration of teaching presence, social presence, and cognitive presence (Garrison et al., 2000). It emphasizes that effective learning occurs when instructors guide the learning process, learners engage socially, and critical thinking is fostered. Teaching presence focuses on designing and facilitating learning, social presence enables learners to interact authentically, and cognitive presence supports deep reflection and knowledge construction (Anderson et al., 2001). According to Kelly & Zakrajsek (2023), unlike general online learning models that often emphasize content delivery, CoI highlights collaborative knowledge building as central to learning. It offers a practical guide for educators to design interactive learning communities where dialogue

and reflection are key components (Shea & Bidjerano, 2010).

16. **Virtual Learning Environment:** is an online platform that facilitates the delivery of instructional content and interaction between teachers and learners in remote settings. It functions as a digital classroom where students can access course contents, submit assignments, involve in discussions, and engage in collaborative activities (Anderson & Dron, 2011, p. 80).
17. **Virtual teaching**, or “teaching” of “virtually an online teaching environment or organization,” is presenting an organized curriculum in a space for teaching that is connected online and in which activities, assessment, and communication with learners occurs online via real-time, or synchronous, interactions such as live video lessons, or chat as well as through online or asynchronous interactions such as courses or units presented in Learning Management Systems (LMS), online forums, or threaded discussions and does not take place in a place where students and instructors meet face to face ” (Makda, 2025).

1.9 Organization of the Dissertation

The dissertation is organized into six chapters, namely Introduction, Theoretical Framework, Research Methodology, Findings, Discussion, and Conclusion and Implications of the Study.

Chapter I, Introduction, is an introductory section of the dissertation. It encompasses the background of the research, statement of the problems, research objectives, research questions, methodology, significance of the study, clarification of key terms, and organization of the dissertation. To begin with, the background of the research presents the context of why the research was conducted. It provides background on the topic or the issue to be raised in response to the development of the situation and conditions today. In this section, the topic of the research is positioned in a broader context, through which the research gap is identified. The result of literature searches related to the theories and findings of previous research

on the same topic is also presented for further investigation. Then, the statement of the problems covers the specific identification of the problems to be researched. This statement is usually written in the form of research questions. Next, research objectives present general and specific research objectives so that the scope of the research can be clearly defined. Then, the benefit or significance of the research presents an overview of the extra value or contribution that can be made given by the results of the research conducted. Clarification of key terms is a section that defines the main concepts and terms used in a research paper or proposal. This section helps the reader to understand the researcher's meaning, simplifies the thesis, demonstrates the researcher's knowledge, and avoids confusion or ambiguity. Finally, the organization provides a picture of the content of each chapter, the systematicity, and the relationship among the chapters in forming a complete thesis framework.

Chapter 2, the theoretical framework, provides a clear context for the topic or issue raised in the study. This section presents the latest developments in the scientific world, often called the state of the art of the theory being studied, and the position of the research problem in the field of science under study. Principally, this theoretical framework covers concepts, theories, postulates, laws, models, and their main formulas and derivatives in the field under study. This framework also presents previous research relevant to the field researched, including procedures, subjects, and findings; and the theoretical position of the researcher with respect to the problem researched. In this section, the researcher compares, contrasts, and positions the position of each research study through association with the problem under study. Based on the study, the researcher explained that his position/stance is accompanied by logical reasons. This section is intended to display the "why and how" theories and research results of previous experts applied by researchers in their research, for example, in formulating the assumptions of the researcher.

Chapter 3, Research Methodology, is the section that serves as a systematic and logical process of designing and conducting a research study. It

serves as a plan that guides the researcher in choosing the most suitable methods and techniques to answer the research question or test the hypothesis. Research methodology also helps ensure the validity and reliability of the research findings by explaining and justifying the choices made. Researchers determine their research design by starting with the applied research method, selecting appropriate instruments, conducting data gathering stages, executing data analysis phases, and finally interpreting the results of data analysis.

Chapter IV, Findings and Discussions, presents the core results of the research in a systematic and comprehensive manner. The chapter begins with Section 4.1, *Narrative Overview*, which introduces the chapter by situating the research findings in relation to the overarching research questions. This section provides a narrative summary of participants' experiences during Emergency Remote Teaching (ERT), emphasizing how they structured their online teaching practices through the lens of teaching presence, namely course design, discourse facilitation, and direct instruction.

Section 4.2, *Data Presentation Techniques*, outlines how the qualitative data were organized and presented throughout the chapter. Subsection 4.2.1 explains the categorization of data under the three major components of teaching presence—*Course Design and Organization*, *Facilitating Discourse*, and *Direct Instruction*. Subsection 4.2.2 describes the coherent and logical flow used to organize these data thematically, ensuring clarity and traceability of interpretation.

The core of the chapter is structured thematically around three major themes that emerged from the data analysis. Section 4.3, *Designing and Organizing Online Courses in Virtual Learning Environments (VLEs)*, presents the strategies teachers employed to structure their courses, the challenges they encountered in doing so, and the specific features that contributed to effective course design. Section 4.4, *Facilitating Discourse Among Course Participants*, focuses on how teachers encouraged student interaction and communication using both synchronous and asynchronous platforms. It highlights techniques such as peer

feedback, breakout sessions, and discussion forums, along with the role of teacher-student engagement and the challenges of discourse facilitation in a virtual environment. Section 4.5, *Engaging in Direct Instruction to Course Participants*, details the methods used for content delivery, including live instruction, video recordings, and step-by-step guidance. It also explores how teachers balanced direct instruction with student-centered strategies, and how their instructional practices evolved in response to the online teaching context.

Following the thematic findings, Section 4.6, *Participants' Individual Teaching Presence Strategies*, presents detailed portraits of each teacher, highlighting their distinct pedagogical choices and adaptations during ERT. Section 4.7, *Comparison of Findings with the CoI Framework*, then situates the findings within the theoretical framework introduced in Chapter II, especially focusing on how teaching presence was enacted, challenged, and sustained.

Section 4.8, *Discussion of the Findings in Light of Existing Literature*, expands on the findings by comparing them with previous research related to social presence, cognitive presence, teacher autonomy, and the specific challenges within the Indonesian educational context. The chapter then moves to Section 4.9, *Summary of the Key Findings*, which synthesizes the major insights that emerged from the study. Finally, Section 4.10, *Conclusion to the Chapter*, reflects on how the findings answer the central research questions and contribute to the broader discourse on virtual pedagogy and EFL instruction during periods of crisis.

Chapter V, Conclusion and Implications, serves as the final chapter of the dissertation, bringing together the study's major findings and articulating their practical, theoretical, and policy-related significance. It is systematically organized into five sections. **Section 5.1, Summary of Key Findings**, revisits and synthesizes the core discoveries from Chapter IV, demonstrating how the research questions were addressed and highlighting the key contributions of the study to the field of online language education. **Section 5.2, Implications for Practice**, discusses the practical relevance of the findings for educators, instructional designers, and

stakeholders engaged in Virtual Learning Environments (VLEs). This section emphasizes how the insights from the study can enhance teaching presence, improve course design, and promote more effective interaction and instructional strategies in digital contexts.

Section 5.3, Recommendation for Policy, offers guidance for policymakers and educational institutions by suggesting targeted policy actions and institutional frameworks that can better support teachers and learners in remote or hybrid educational settings. These recommendations address systemic challenges identified in the research, such as digital access, teacher preparation, and pedagogical support. **Section 5.4, Limitations of the Study**, critically acknowledges the methodological and contextual boundaries of the research, providing a transparent account of factors that may have influenced the scope or interpretation of the findings. Finally, **Section 5.5, Final Thoughts**, presents the researcher's concluding reflections, offering insights into the research journey, proposing directions for future inquiry, and underscoring the broader implications of the study for educational theory, practice, and policy in a post-pandemic context.