CHAPTER III

METHODOLOGY

This chapter presents the methodology of the research. It includes the research design, setting, participants, data collection techniques and procedures, data analysis methods, and sample of analysis.

3.1 Research Design

This study investigates how novice and experienced student writers employ rhetorical moves in the conclusion sections of research articles. Using a movebased analysis framework from Yang & Allison (2003), the research examines the structural patterns, communicative purposes, and rhetorical strategies that these writers utilize. To achieve these aims, the study employs a descriptive qualitative method with quantitative elements. Descriptive qualitative research is particularly suited for this analysis as it focuses on understanding complex phenomena, such as the organization and function of rhetorical moves, by interpreting textual features within their specific contexts (Creswell, 2013).

The study incorporates quantitative elements to provide additional clarity and support for the qualitative findings. Quantitative analysis is used to identify and report numerical insights, such as the frequency, distribution, and prominence of each rhetorical move within the data set. Hyland (2004) suggests that combining qualitative and quantitative methods can produce more comprehensive results by bridging interpretive depth with statistical accuracy. This approach ensures a holistic understanding of how novice and experienced writers approach the construction of research article conclusions. It does not only highlight patterns of

use but also reveals discrepancies and variations between the two groups, offering valuable pedagogical and theoretical insights.

By integrating this methodology, the study aims to provide a robust and wellrounded analysis of rhetorical strategies in academic writing. The qualitative aspect captures the nuanced ways in which writers organize and communicate their conclusions, while the quantitative component provides objective data to validate and support these observations. This combined approach enables the study to contribute meaningfully to the understanding of academic writing practices, particularly in the context of teaching and learning how to effectively craft conclusion sections in research articles.

3.2 Data and Sources of Data

The study analyzed research articles from the *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics (IJAL)* and the *Passage Journal* to compare the rhetorical strategies used by novice and experienced student writers in crafting conclusion sections. It focused on articles from Scopus-indexed journals in applied linguistics and English education, representing experienced student writers, with *IJAL* as the selected source. In contrast, the study examined non-Scopus-indexed journals in English literature, primarily showcasing the work of novice student writers, using articles from the *Passage Journal* as samples. The data was collected by accessing the IJAL (Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics) and Passage Journal websites, from which the most recently published articles were downloaded. Using criterion-based random sampling, forty articles were selected from each journal, totaling eighty articles. The criteria for selection included: (1) the article must be written in English, (2) the article must be an original research article (not a review, commentary, or editorial), (3) the article must have a clearly defined conclusion section, and (4) the article must have been published within the last

Muhamad Fikri Nugraha, 2025 NOVICE STUDENTS' WRITERS AND EXPERIENCED STUDENTS' WRITERS IN WRITING RESEARCH ARTICLE CONCLUSIONS: A MOVE-BASED ANALYSIS

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

five years (2020–2024). These criteria ensured that the selected articles were relevant, up-to-date, and suitable for a move-based analysis of conclusion sections. Once selected, the conclusion sections of these articles were extracted for further analysis.

In line with Corder and Foreman's (2014) recommendation that document analysis requires a minimum of thirty samples to ensure reliable and valid results, this study analyzed a total of forty conclusion sections from each research article group. This sample size was chosen to provide a representative and balanced comparison between the two groups of writers. The selected articles reflect a range of writing practices across different academic disciplines, including applied linguistics, English education, and English literature. By analyzing these samples, the study aimed to uncover patterns, similarities, and differences in how novice and experienced writers' structure and articulate their conclusions. This methodological approach ensures that the findings are robust and generalizable, contributing valuable insights to the understanding of academic writing practices in various fields.

3.3 Research Instrument

The researcher used a checklist table. The move model for the conclusion section proposed by Yang and Allison (2003) was used as the framework for the move identification because it was developed from an analysis of Research articles in applied linguistics and English education corpus, which was also the focus of the present study. Also, some moves in their model contain a wide coverage of the constituent steps used to realize the moves explicitly. It was used in this research, as shown in Table 3.1.

Muhamad Fikri Nugraha, 2025 NOVICE STUDENTS' WRITERS AND EXPERIENCED STUDENTS' WRITERS IN WRITING RESEARCH ARTICLE CONCLUSIONS: A MOVE-BASED ANALYSIS Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

Move	Description	Passage (Novice)		IJAL (Exj	Total	
	—	Occurrences	Percentage	Occurrences	Percentage	
Move 1	Summarizing the study					
Move 2	Evaluating the study					
Step 1	Indicating significance/a					
Step 2	dvantage Indicating limitations					
Step 3	Evaluating methodology					
Move 3	Deductions from the research					
Step 1	Recommendi ng further research					
Step 2	Drawing pedagogic implications					

Table 3.1. Move analysis instrument

Adapted from Yang and Allison's model (2003)

This study did not conduct additional validation of its research instrument, as it utilized an established framework developed by Yang and Allison (2003) for analyzing rhetorical moves in research article conclusions. Their move-based model is widely recognized and has been validated in numerous studies, making it a reliable and credible tool for examining the structure of academic writing. By directly adopting this instrument, the study ensured that its analytical framework was grounded in a robust and proven methodology, eliminating the need for further validation.

To enhance the reliability of the findings, the study employed triangulation

analysis, specifically through inter-rater reliability measures. Triangulation in qualitative research involves using multiple perspectives or methods to cross-verify data, which helps minimize bias and enhances the credibility of the results (Creswell, 2013). In this study, inter-rater reliability was achieved by involving multiple coders in the analysis of the data. Each coder independently analyzed the conclusion sections using Yang and Allison's framework, and the results were then compared to ensure consistency in the identification and categorization of rhetorical moves. This approach not only strengthened the reliability of the findings but also ensured that the analysis was thorough and unbiased, providing a solid foundation for interpreting the data and drawing conclusions.

3.4 Data Collection Technique

The data for this study were collected by accessing two distinct online journal platforms: the Scopus-indexed *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics* (IJAL) and the non-Scopus-indexed *Passage Journal*. These journals were specifically chosen to represent the works of experienced student writers (from IJAL) and novice student writers (from Passage), ensuring a clear comparison between the two groups. A total of forty research articles were criterion-based randomly selected from the most recently published volumes available in each journal's online archive. In this sampling method, a set of predetermined criteria was first established to filter eligible articles. These criteria included: (1) the article must be written in English, (2) it must be an original research article (not a review, editorial, or short communication), (3) it must include a clearly identifiable conclusion section, and (4) it must have been published within the last five years (2020–2024). After applying these criteria, all qualifying articles were compiled into a sampling pool for each journal. This approach allowed for a diverse yet

representative selection of texts for move-based analysis, thereby enhancing the reliability of the study's findings.

After the articles were collected, the conclusion sections were carefully identified and extracted as the primary data for the study with microsoft excel. This step adhered strictly to Yang and Allison's (2003) move-based framework, which focuses specifically on the conclusion sections of research articles. The researcher carefully examined each conclusion section to ensure it was a distinct part of the article, not merged with other sections like the discussion or results. Articles in which the conclusion was integrated with other sections or did not adhere to a standalone format were excluded from the analysis to maintain data consistency and alignment with the study's objectives.

The selected conclusion sections were then categorized into two groups: one representing novice student writers and the other representing experienced student writers. These groups provided the basis for a comparative analysis of rhetorical strategies and structural differences in their use of moves. Finally, each conclusion section was analyzed using a structured instrument table based on Yang and Allison's (2003) model. This table allowed for a systematic examination of the presence, frequency, and distribution of rhetorical moves, ensuring that the data collection process was organized, consistent, and aligned with the study's methodological framework.

3.5 Data Analysis Technique

To analyze the data, the researcher adopted a systematic and methodical approach to ensure the consistency and reliability of the findings. The analysis focused specifically on the conclusion sections of the selected research articles and was conducted using content analysis as the main analytical technique. This

approach is suitable for interpreting textual data by identifying patterns and recurring structures (Krippendorff, 2018). The analysis was guided by the move structure model proposed by Yang and Allison (2003), which served as a framework for identifying rhetorical moves commonly found in research article conclusions. Each conclusion section was examined line by line, and textual segments were carefully classified according to the move categories defined in the model. The identification process was supported by a set of predefined indicators, including key linguistic features and discourse markers that typically signal each move. This method allowed the researcher to consistently detect and categorize the rhetorical strategies used by both novice and experienced writers.

Once the moves were identified, they were categorized and coded systematically. The coding process involved assigning a unique label or code to each move based on its function and alignment with the move structure. To ensure accuracy and consistency, the researcher cross-verified the coding with the guidelines of Yang and Allison's model. After coding, the moves were grouped into categories for further analysis.

Finally, to examine the distribution of rhetorical moves within the dataset, a frequency count analysis was employed. The occurrences of each move category were tallied, and their proportional representations were calculated to determine how frequently each move appeared across the articles. This quantitative step helped reveal observable patterns and trends in the use of rhetorical strategies in conclusion sections, allowing comparisons between novice and experienced writers. By combining this frequency-based analysis with the earlier qualitative content analysis, the study ensured a thorough and well-rounded interpretation of the data.

Muhamad Fikri Nugraha, 2025 NOVICE STUDENTS' WRITERS AND EXPERIENCED STUDENTS' WRITERS IN WRITING RESEARCH ARTICLE CONCLUSIONS: A MOVE-BASED ANALYSIS Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia | repository.upi.edu | perpustakaan.upi.edu

29

3.6 Sample of Data Analysis

Here is an example of data analysis from one section of the article's conclusion:

Table 3.2 Sample of data analysis

Conclusion	Move					
	Move 1	Move 2		2	Move 3	
		Step 1	Step	Step 3	Step	Step
			2		1	2
The research aims to create	The research	The data	-	The proposed	-	-
a model for writing in an	aims to create	from		model has		
academic setting,	a model for	interviewing		some		
especially with the purpose	writing in an	three expert		similarities		
of writing for journal	academic	authors		and		
publication. The data from	setting,	coming from		differences		
interviewing three expert	especially	different		with the		
authors coming from	with the	fields of		previous		
different fields of expertise	purpose of	expertise for		models. The		
for 270 minutes were	writing for	270 minutes		stages that are		
analyzed using a six-phase	journal	were		similar to the		
thematic analysis (Braun &	publication.	analyzed		previous		
Clark, 2006). The themes		using a six-		models lie in		
that emerged from the		phase		the writing		
findings of the study were		thematic		process and		
that experienced writers		analysis		searching and		
who participated in the		(Braun &		reading		
research deploy similar		Clark,		sources, and		

30

stages in writing loading to	2006). The	the different
stages in writing leading to	,	
their publications. The	themes that	stages lie in
practical stages that they	emerged	steps in the
have practiced can be	from the	model are
categorized and made into	findings of	determining
stages, namely search,	the study	the topic,
topic, research, writing,	were that	research, and
and publication. To make	experienced	publication,
the model easy to	writers who	which might
implement, each emerging	participated	happen
theme includes several	in the	because the
subthemes that novice	research	final purpose
writers can practically	deploy	of the
conduct when they would	similar	creation of
like to write journal articles	stages in	the mode is to
intended for publication.	writing	help the
The proposed model has	leading to	novice
some similarities and	their	writers create
differences with the	publications.	a composition
previous models. The	The	with the
stages that are similar to	practical	intention of
the previous models lie in	stages that	publication.
the writing process and	they have	
searching and reading	practiced	
sources, and the different	can be	
stages lie in steps in the	categorized	
model are determining the	and made	
L		

topic, research, and	into stages,
publication, which might	namely
happen because the final	search,
purpose of the creation of	topic,
the mode is to help the	research,
novice writers create a	writing, and
composition with the	publication.
intention of publication.	

3.7 Research Procedure

The researcher adopted a systematic and well-structured approach to conduct this study, ensuring clarity and reliability throughout the research process. The first step involved collecting forty research articles from two reputable journals: the Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics (IJAL) and Passage. A random sampling technique was employed to select these articles, which ensured that every potential sample within the population had an equal chance of being chosen. This method is particularly advantageous because it minimizes bias and provides a representative subset of the entire population, making it suitable for drawing generalizable conclusions. The selected articles focused specifically on topics related to Applied Linguistics and English education, aligning with the objectives of the study.

Following the selection process, the researcher directed attention to the conclusion sections of the articles. Each conclusion was meticulously examined to identify its format, structure, and rhetorical patterns, which served as the primary analytical units for the study. This detailed examination was crucial for identifying linguistic clues and textual elements that signaled the presence of distinct moves as defined by the Yang and Allison (2003) model. The researcher utilized these signals

³²

to systematically code each conclusion section, marking the occurrence and frequency of each move. This step was integral to categorizing the moves into three main types, as outlined in the data analysis technique, and quantifying their distributions.

In the final phase, the researcher assessed the validity of the findings to ensure the accuracy and credibility of the analysis. Since no universally standardized system for naming or coding techniques exists, the researcher exercised professional judgment and methodological rigor to verify the reliability of the classifications and results. This phase also included cross-referencing the findings with the research objectives and theoretical framework to confirm their alignment. By integrating these systematic steps, the researcher was able to provide a comprehensive and methodologically sound investigation into the rhetorical structure of research article conclusions.

33