CHAPTER V
CONCLUSION, LIMITATION, AND RECOMMENDATION

This last chapter provides the conclusions drawn after having the answers for the two research questions, elaborates in detail the limitations that this study has, as well as proposes several recommendations practitioners, researchers, and policy makers, that possibly have interest and attention in improving the quality of EFL learning, education, and democracy. It consists of conclusion, limitation, recommendation, and concluding remarks sub-chapters.

5.1. Conclusions

This research aims at discovering the EFL lecturers' attitudes toward as well as the practices they performed as the reflection of the four CP principles namely dialogue, problem-posing, praxis, and conscientization. Additionally, this research tries to investigate the challenges perceived by the participants in their effort to implement the four CP principles in their daily teaching practices. In achieving the mentioned purposes, a case study design was employed to the two EFLlecturers teaching different courses at different study program in two types of higher education institutions in two neighbouring regions: a university in Subang and a polytechnique in Bandung.

As a reminder, it is considered crucial to display the research questions. As it is provided in the first chapter of this report, two questions formulated to be answered by performing this research are:

1. What are the attitudes of Indonesian EFL lecturers toward the CP principles-informed classroom activities and how are the attitudesreflected in their actual teaching practices?

2. What are the benefits and constraints perceived by Indonesian EFL lecturers in implementing CP principles-informed classroom activities?

Referring to the data obtained using questionnaire, interviews, andclassroom observations, it is uncovered that the answer the first research question was classified into four subsections grounded on the four CP principles. Those are

(1) attitude on and practice of dialogue, (2) attitude on and practice of problem-posing, (3) attitude on and practice of praxis, and (4) attitude on and practice of conscientization. The conclusions drawn from the answer grouped into those four categories are delineated in the subsequent paragraphs.

Firstly, there are two themes emerge in from the data related to the first CP principle, dialogue, being highlighted in this study. Those are engaging classroom interaction that represents the concept of democracy and negotiating classroom decision that reflects the classroom power distribution aspect of CP. Regarding those two themes, both participants are holding enormously confirmatory views especially on the premise that classroom has to be the place where knowledge is co-constructed by students and their teacher. It can be concluded that Andi's attitudes upon the dialogue is more positive than Meli's. Those attitudes are reflected in both participants' teaching practices. However, the representation of their affirmative beliefs toward dialogue is in the same level and degree of intensity as well as frequency.

Secondly, the identical general confirmatory attitudes are also possessed by the two research participants regarding the principle of problem-posing that are consisting of two themes namely students' generated classroom topics and related to student teaching technique. Although not as strong as their attitude towards dialogue, it is confirmed that both Andi and Meli also have a somewhat positive view on problem-posing as another CP principle. Considering the classroom observation data, it can be concluded that, to some extent, their agreement upon the problem-posing tenet of CP is reflected in their EFL teaching practice.

Thirdly, under the principle of praxis, there are two themes emerging after analysing the questionnaire, interview, and observation data. Those are connection between language and culture along with integration between reflection and action. Both participants are having a strong agreement upon the two themes of praxis principle. It can also be concluded that the participants partially reflected their positive attitudes in their daily teaching practices especially related to the integration of reflection and action. Regarding praxis, it is evident that Meli has a stronger positive attitude and its reflection in daily teaching practices than Andi.

Lastly, the conclusion can be drawn that towards conscientization principle,

the two research participants are viewing positively. The affirmative attitudes upon conscientization include their strong agreement regarding the two themes under the principle that are hidden curriculum and contribution to community. The participants' highly positive attitudes were not fully represented in theirteaching practices specifically related to the hidden curriculum theme. However, taking into account the data obtained using questionnaire, interview, and observation, it can be inferred that the confirmatory views toward the theme of contribution to community was comprehensively reflected in both participants' EFL classrooms and discussion activities.

In summary, even though both participating EFL lecturers do not see themselves as critical pedagogues, it is qualitatively proven that they are generally in favour with the four CP basic principles consisting of dialogue, problem-posing, praxis, and conscientization. Furthermore, it can also be concluded that their positive attitudes upon those principles were somewhat reflected in theirdaily teaching practices. However, their strong agreement towards CP theory werenot comprehensively reflected in their classrooms particularly for the praxis and conscientization principles. Additionally, it is unearthed that both participants had different focuses in viewing and implementing CP principles that was most possibly because of the dissimilar contexts of the participants; while Andi emphasized on the implementation of dialogue and praxis, Meli highlighted the practice of problem-posing and conscientization.

Regarding the second research question, it can be inferred that there are two categories of challenges perceived by the participants that made them unable to comprehensively practice their positive attitudes upon the four CP principles. Those are challenges coming from students and challenges coming from themselves. The challenges coming from students consist of students' reluctance in taking classroom discussion participation and their unfamiliarity with CP and brought topics. In the meantime, the lecturers' unfamiliarity with CP and the lack of institutional supports are considered as the challenges coming from lecturers themselves. In addition to that, it can also be concluded that there are two advantages of fairly practicing their strong confirmatory views and positive attitudes toward CP principles. Those are students' increased social awareness and their increased English language proficiency.

Taking into account the findings discovered in the current research and other relevant study reports, four points can be concluded regarding the Indonesian educational as well as social conditions in general and the Indonesian higher EFL education in particular. Firstly, it can be inferred that even after two decades since the Indonesian Reformation in 1998, discussing political and social issues inside classroom is still considered as a taboo that most of educators as well as students often avoid. Therefore, applying CP in Indonesian schools and even higher education institutions has to be very carefully planned and managed. Additionally, in order to anticipate the possible challenges as well as the unwanted risks, it is endorsed to modify the implementation of CP by accommodating other teaching approaches and, most importantly, considering the contexts. Secondly, connecting English language aspect instruction with daily lived experience is crucial to encourage EFL learners in Indonesia to have ownership upon their EFL learning process. This is essential particularly to make them realize that English language has direct benefits to their lives and to motivatethem to learn English better. Thirdly, to obtain the maximum advantages of the four CP principles implementation in the context of Indonesian EFL higher education, critical EFL lecturers have to fully recognize and anticipate the possible challenges they may face. This includes acknowledging that the intended outcomes of practicing CP principles, including the raised students' critical consciousness, requires a long period of time. Lasty, the answer for the first question of the present research highlights the importance of collaborative works that have to be performed among EFL lecturers, higher education institutions, and policymakers in order to comprehensively integrate CP in higher education EFL classrooms.

5.2. Limitations

It is acknowledged that this study is limited in its number of participants and its data collection as well as data analysis procedures. In order to pursue the depth of analysis, there are only two ELF lecturers teaching at two different higher education institutions in two neighboring cities (Bandung and Subang) in West Java province fully participated in this study. The other limitations of this study are its procedures in collecting and analysing data. In order to give emphasis on the consistency between EFL teachers' claims and their actual practice regarding the implementation of CP principles in EFL classroom, the necessary data for this

study were chronologically collected using questionnaires, structured interview, overt non-participatory classroom observation, and semi-structured interview. In analysing the collected data, only particular data related to the study frameworks employed such as Akbari (2008) and Crookes (2013). Additionally, the CP principles and their actual classroom practices as the focus of this study are limited only that are relevant to the research context. One possible logical consequence of this limitation is that the findings of the study are only applied to the participants of the present research.

Moreover, the limitation of this study is also related to the nature of CP as theory and practice of education that is very broad including philosophy, politics, culture, and activism. Considering the broadness of CP, in order to attain the depth of discussion and analysis, numerous restricting decisions have been made in this study. First, it was decided that only the educational aspect of CP that was placed under the spotlight without being isolated from other aspects of it such as philosophy, culture, and politics as education is not something that can stand alone. Second, for the purpose of making CP more understandable along with suiting it with the context of Indonesian higher education general EFL classroom in West Java, the principles of CP that are focused in this study are limited to dialogue, problem-posing, praxis, and conscientization. Third, there are only two themes emphasized under each CP principle in order to obtain the profound elaboration as can be seen in the previous chapter. Fourth, bearing in mind that each principle covers a massive discussion including philosophical, theoretical, and practical aspects, only specific pedagogical beliefs and implementation of participants analyzed. Fifth, it is also considered fundamental to explicitly mention here the limitation relating to claimed benefits and challenges of practicing the CP principles in Indonesian EFL tertiary education classrooms. The benefits concluded in this study were formulated merely from the participants' statements during the interview along with the result students' verbal and actional behavior observed during the classroom observations sessions; the proofs of those benefits were not derived from any statistical procedure. The identical limitationis also applicable for the discovery of challenges in practicing the CP principle-based classroom activities in terms of the constraints uncovered were obtained from the two participants' answer during the interviews and the results of non- participatory

classroom observations. Lastly, citing Clark's (2018) classification, this study emphasizes the analysis only on the pedagogy or the method and puts aside the curriculum or the content of the participants' classes. These five limitations are considered as the vulnerabilities of this study because of in order tobe able to comprehensively research the application of CP in Indonesian TEFL, those five restricting decisions should not be made.

Another flaw possessed by this study as an attempt to promote the use of CP in the higher education EFL classrooms is that the researcher did not act as the one who taught and practiced the CP principle-based classroom activities. This most possibly is one of the reasons why there is an inconsistency between what the two participating EFL lecturers viewed and what they practiced regarding the application of CP principles in their classrooms. Bearing in mind of this limitation, it is understandable that the participants did not practice their positive attitudes towards CP principles. It is because of, as it is found that one of the challenges is their unfamiliarity with the procedural knowledge of CP, both participants of this research did not study it formally. Therefore, to advocate the integration of CP in the EFL education in Indonesia, it would be better for further researchers to act also as EFL educators who provide a model of how to teach EFL using CP as an approach.

Each limitation contributes to the emergence of the demand to conduct further research in order to pursue the more comprehensive understanding regarding the practice of integrating CP principle-based teaching learning activities in EFL classrooms in Indonesian higher education.

5.3. Recommendations

Taking into consideration the conclusions drawn and limitations possessed elaborated previously, there are several recommendations proposed for EFL practitioners, further researchers, and policymakers. The EFL practitioners addressed in this recommendation include EFL teachers and lecturers. In the meantime, further researchers are those who, in the future, interested in conducting research the integration of CP approach in the field of teaching EFL (TEFL), English language teaching (ELT), or teaching English for speakers of other languages (TESOL). Additionally, policy makers refer to individuals or organizations who have capacity and authority to establish educational policies

including Indonesian Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology.

The first recommendations are addressed for EFL practitioners consisting of teachers, instructors, and lecturers teaching EFL in Indonesian primary, secondary, and tertiary education contexts. It is suggested for EFL educators to, firstly, give more focus on the connections between the taught English language aspects and social as well as political issues in a carefully planned and measured manner to obtain the more meaningful language teaching learning activities for both them and their students. Additionally, in order to, one of them, broaden the expected outcomes of their EFL teaching practices, the utilization of learning management system and other education technological advancements is advocated to be explored by EFL teachers and lecturers committed to the implementation of CP in their classrooms. Thirdly, related to the Emancipated Learning (*Merdeka Belajar*) policy issued by Indonesian Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology, it is recommended for EFL practitioners to exploit the opportunity and spaced provided with the purpose of not only assisting students being more proficient users of English but also encouraging them becoming transformation agents to achieve more democratic, just, and prosperous society by actively participating in or initiating community services. Fourthly, in the micro level of classroom context, it is endorsed for EFL educators to treat their students fairly regardless of their different background and proficiency levels of English. Furthermore, it is also suggested for EFL educators to modify the theory and practice of CP by integrating as well as accommodating other language learning theories and teaching approaches to make CP principles be more acceptable in wider diverse contexts. Lasty, specifically for EFL higher education lecturers, it is promoted for them to integrate the principles of praxis and conscientization with their community service activities by emphasizing the development of students' critical consciousness so that the students can be more both socially and politically empowered.

In addition to replicate this current study involving more diverse participants and longer allocated data collection period, there are other recommendations proposed for further researchers. There is a great demand for further researchers who concern about the incorporation of CP approach in the EFL education to study the long-term effect of participating in the critical EFL pedagogy for students by

conducting the longitudinal research. The study is necessary to be conducted in order to investigate whether students who enrolled EFL classroom incorporating CP principles are willing to take action in pursuing the more just and equal community or not. Moreover, it is also recommended for further researchers to uncover the integration of CP principles in the technologically-enhanced EFL learning especially in the context of Indonesian higher education. Bearing in mind that one of the challenges perceived by the participating lecturers in practicing CP principle-based EFL classrooms is lack of training, it is called for future researchers to conduct the study focusing on what type of supports the EFL educators need to receive in order to make them being able to comprehensively practice CP principles in the teaching activities. Additionally, considering that there is still lack of EFL educators who integrate CP in their classrooms, it is essential for further researchers to conduct the participatory research in which they implement the CP principles in their EFL teaching practices while conducting research.

There are three recommendations directed to policymakers. Firstly, it is advocated for those in charge to provide the necessary space in the EFL curriculum in every level of education to enable teachers reflect, innovate, and experiment with what they believe is most suitable for their classroom contexts. Secondly, it is advocated for policy makers to explicitly incorporate the CP theory and lessons in the existing nationally-wide issued teacher professional development programs such as Teacher Master Program (*Guru Penggerak*) and Teacher Education Program (*PPG – Pendidikan Profesi Guru*). Lastly, considering the promises CP offers in bettering the social, political, and economic situations, most importantly, it is called for those who have the authority to promote the utilization of CP in the EFL classroom in all levels of education generally, and particularly in the higher education context where community service is mandatory along with the teaching and the research responsibilities.

In addition to what has been elaborated in the aforementioned paragraph, especially for the context of Indonesian higher education, it is substantially suggested for the decision makers in the level of institution, faculty, or study program to encourage lecturers and students to integrate the EFL learning activities with the outside campus activities as the implementation of Emancipated Learning Campus Liberated (ELCL - *Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka*) policy as

promoted by Indonesian Ministry of Education, Culture, Research, and Technology. It is written in the policy issued in 2020 through the Minister of Education and Culture Regulations No. 3 the Year 2020 on National Standards of Higher Education that tertiary students have the right to study outside campus by selecting one from the eight provided options of off campus learning activities. Those eight activities are (1) internship, (2) research, (3) teaching in school, (4) students exchange, (5) entrepreneurship, (6) project in village, (7) humanitarian project, and (8) independent study. Related to the social transformation purpose of CP, the three last activities are recommended to be carried out and integrated with the EFL classroom projects focusing on the students' as well as community empowerment. The promotion and the execution of these three off campus activities in the EFL classrooms can both enlarge the impact of CP principles implementation to community and provide students with the more meaningful EFL lesson along withexperience.

5.4. Concluding Remarks

This last chapter has presented the conclusions drawn from the data and interpretation discussed in the previous chapter considering both research questions. Additionally, the limitations possessed by the research have been acknowledged and elaborated in this fifth chapter. Bearing in mind the conclusions and the limitations provided previously, several recommendations proposed for EFL practitioners, further researchers, and policymakers have also been delineated in detail in this chapter.