

CHAPTER VII

CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1 Introduction

This section will provide a summary of the research findings. The conclusions will be discussed, along with the study's implications for tertiary education's creative writing teaching program. This analysis will encompass the limitations of the study. Additionally, suggestions will be considered by the Indonesian government, serving as policymakers, and by university lecturers throughout Indonesia. The need for further investigation will also be highlighted.

7.2 Conclusions

This research explores the impact of a Process Genre Approach (PGA) on enhancing second-year students' creative writing and narrative skills in Ende, East Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia. Additionally, the study aims to assess the students' reactions to how the PGA contributes to the development of these aspects. The investigation involved thirty tertiary English as a Foreign Language (EFL) students

enrolled in a Creative Writing class. These participants were affiliated with the English Literature Study Program within the Faculty of Language and Literature at a private university in Ende, East Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia.

Indeed, the observations recorded in the field notes, the feedback received from students through open-ended questionnaires, transcripts from interviews, and the written text of students discussed in the preceding chapters collectively suggest that the teaching program incorporates a Process-Genre Approach (PGA) has the potential to enhance the creative writing and narrative skills of tertiary English as a Foreign Language (EFL) students who are part of this study.

Regarding how a PGA can enhance the creative writing and narrative skills of second-year tertiary EFL students in Ende, East Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia, the development can occur through teaching-learning activities within the PGA's teaching stages. As outlined in Chapter 4, the teaching stages of the PGA initiates with the Preparation stage. During this phase, students are guided to produce and employ clear, precise, and relevant ideas, arguments, and evidence by engaging with various resources or references. At the same time, the students also learn new word choices, expressions, and linguistic features that can be applied in the Joint Constructing and Independent Constructing stages. Concerning narrative and creative writing, the word choices, expressions, and linguistic features learned from the texts can be used to learn the schematic structure, linguistic features, and creative writing skills such as fluency, flexibility, clarity, elaboration, and originality. As explained below, these aspects will be learned further in the modeling stage.

Next, the process of modeling and reinforcing assisted students in grasping the schematic structure of a narrative text. It demonstrates students' creative writing abilities and language features that reflect their originality. Additionally, it gives students a way to carefully and respectfully communicate their points of view.

Thirdly, the joint constructing stage enabled students, working in groups, to apply the creative writing and narrative skills they acquired during the preparation, modeling, and reinforcement stages. This process involved explicit guidance from the researcher during lectures, fostering a recursive writing approach. Through this recursive writing process, which incorporates feedback from the lecturer and peers,

students can refine their jointly-constructed texts, showcasing a high level of narrative creativity.

Next, the enabled students to apply the principles of creative writing and narrative that they acquired during the knowledge-building and modeling stages, as well as the practical experience gained in the joint construction stage. This independent construction stage took place in an individual setting, signifying that students were deemed prepared to write on their own through a recursive process. The recursive writing process, involving feedback from both the lecturer and peers, played a crucial role in assisting students in refining their independently crafted texts to achieve a high-quality narrative structure.

In Chapter 4, the interview transcripts reveal similar findings from Chapter 4, highlighting that the teaching program has the potential to expand perspectives on the significance of creative writing and narrative in teaching activities. Students engage in these aspects during their practices and reflect on them in their texts, aligning with the idea in the PGA that language learning encompasses broader skills. In this context, students not only acquire language proficiency but also develop skills in creative writing and narrative, afterward mastering the necessary language components to express these abilities (Christie, 2004; Halliday, 1993).

Thus, these results validate the outcomes derived from the textual analysis discussed in Chapter 4. Examining both collaboratively crafted and individually created texts (see Chapter 4, Sections 4.3 and 4.4) reveals a noticeable enhancement in students' creative writing skills, a progress not evident in the diagnostic texts produced before the teaching program (see to Chapter 4, Section 4.2).

Regarding creative writing, the texts generated within the teaching program indicate the students' proficient understanding of the schematic structure of a narrative, demonstrating the ability to create a linear storyline—an essential aspect of creative writing. Furthermore, this implies that the students have successfully develop their skills (Lipman, 2003) showcasing their capability to organize ideas and imagination.

The learners utilized linguistic elements such as past tense, descriptive language, action verbs, mental verbs, and character dialogues to achieve objectivity, an essential aspect of narrative writing. Concerning creative writing proficiency,

this objectivity can enhance the smoothness, adaptability, precision, uniqueness, and elaboration evident in written compositions.

Students' effective achievement of an intended goal depends on their understanding of grammar, as proposed by the scholars in the Process Genre Approach (PGA). In this approach, grammar conveys meaning in a text, as (Clark, 2013) and Feez (2002) highlighted. The absence of grammatical competence, as evidenced by the diagnostic texts (see Section 4.2), leads to students needing to catch up in achieving their intended purpose.

Based on the results mentioned above, it is proved that the PGA (Process-Genre Approach) plays a significant role in enhancing the creative writing and narrative skills of tertiary EFL students at a private university in Ende, East Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia. The findings also propose the applicability of PGA in the Indonesian context, as supported by previous research conducted by Emilia (2005) and (Emilia & Hamied, 2015), particularly in the specified research site.

In addition, this study supports earlier research conducted by Al Azhar and Maolida (2019) and Carvajal (2021), who utilized a PGA for instructing narrative and creative writing, this study also provides support. Moreover, the following sections will explore the constraints and suggestions stemming from this research.

In summary, the present study identified two research questions. For the first research question, the data can be from observation, students' written texts, and interviews. This study aimed to identify and address two research questions. The data shows that the research gaps have been answered in the form of GBA, which is synthesized with the principles of creative writing and creative writing skills that can help students improve their creativity. This can be shown from the data from observation, students' written texts, and interviews. Regarding the second research question, the students expressed the advantages and difficulties of participating in PGA with creativity, namely that they felt bored with the feedback given by the lecturer; peer feedback made it difficult for them to understand the meaning of friends who had revised and edited their writing. Apart from that, they feel that the joint construction stage is very profitable because they can learn to write through the stages of the writing process, such as pre-writing, drafting, editing, revising, and publishing. Moreover, students can produce texts arranged chronologically; they

can produce good story organizational structures; some include one event, and some include more. This is related to the fluency and flexibility of creative writing. Moreover, originality can also be seen in every text produced, where the text is purely the result of their ideas, without copying other people's writing.

7.3 Limitations

The study has limitations concerning its methodology and the teaching program it employed. Four limitations were identified in relation to the study's methodology. Firstly, a single case study was applied, which hinders the generalizability of the findings (VanWynsberghe & Khan, 2008). Despite previous studies indicating the applicability of the SFL PGA to tertiary EFL students, particularly in Indonesian contexts, this limitation needs consideration. To address this issue, the study incorporated multiple sources of evidence (Swanborn, 2010; Yin, 2011), including participant observation field notes, students' writings, questionnaire responses, and interview transcripts.

The second limitation remains to establish the credibility of participant observations. This limitation arose from the fact that the collaborators engaged were fourth-semester students with restricted expertise and abilities in conducting observations, lacking familiarity with the subject matter compared to faculty members who possessed greater access to it (Millis, 1992). To address the challenge of limited observational capacity, the study implemented pre-observation, ongoing observations, and post-observation activities. Despite these efforts, the collaborators' capacity regarding the subject matter remains unresolved (see Chapter 3, Section 3.4.1).

The third limitation pertained to text analysis. Due to spatial constraints, the lecturer did not analyze texts independently constructed by the students. Thus, the study focused on four criteria—authenticity, representativeness, and meaning—when selecting texts for analysis. Six texts were gathered from students, encompassing three diagnostic texts and three independently constructed texts. These documents were deemed authentic and credible representations of the students' work.

To ensure the representativeness of the documents, the lecturer classified the students' writings into three distinct proficiency levels—low, mid, and high—by assessing their diagnostic texts. Mrs. Marni, the lecturer collaborator, participated as an evaluator in determining the students' writing skill levels.

The lecturer examined the students' writings utilizing SFL (Systemic Functional Linguistics) and shared the outcomes of this investigation in Chapter 4, illustrating the development of the student's creative writing and narrative skills. The text analysis primarily covers context, discourse, grammar, and graphic features (see Chapter 2).

The fourth limitations persisted to the interview sessions, where the perspectives of low-achieving individuals were absent. This occurred because the initially chosen low and high achievers, who were meant to be interviewees, were absent from class, with no possibility of attending the following week. Consequently, the lecturer opted for alternative students who were present in the class, taking into account various factors such as the analysis of their diagnostic texts, gender, the researcher's observations of their writing performance, and attendance records.

Because of these limitations, it is justified for this research to employ four different types of evidence. The combination of data collected from field notes, students' open-ended questionnaire responses, interview transcripts, and students' written text contributed to strengthening the validity and precision of the results, addressing inconsistencies and contradictions in the data (see Chapter 3, Section 3.5).

Three limitations were recognized regarding the teaching program. The initial limitation pertained to group work, whose effectiveness was hindered when group members needed more knowledge of their tasks. As a result, students need to be made aware of the assigned group tasks. To address this challenge, the researcher implemented explicit teaching methods to assist students in managing the activity (see Chapter 4).

The third limitation pertained to the teaching program, which focused on SFL GBA teaching stages, explicit teaching, group work, and a recursive process to creative writing involving lecturer and peer feedback. The interviews

demonstrate that the specified teaching activities had the potential to support students in enhancing their skills in creative writing and narrative development, with students effectively managing the associated teaching activities. However, the repetitive teaching activities might lead to boredom as the teaching program requires many reading and writing activities that would exhaust the students. Accordingly, for a future study, the students suggested that the teaching program should be able to provide variations that can arouse the student's interest in the teaching and learning activities.

7.4 Implications

From the research findings, there are two pedagogical implications. The first has to do with Indonesian EFL creative writing instruction. The study's teacher participants implemented two primary concepts found in literature: using models and exploring feelings, memories, experiences, and culture. The Indonesian students involved in this study highly value examples or models. It is feasible that having models will help Indonesian students learn more effectively. Individuals can take ideas from the examples and modify or add to the model as part of the learning process. Investigating feelings, memories, and culture should be encouraged in Indonesian EFL creative writing. Indonesia's multilingual and multicultural nature makes culture a valuable tool for fostering identity in creative writing. Creating tasks that allow students' cultural and intellectual resources to be integrated is essential. Second, writing creatively is vital to learning English, particularly in classes emphasizing it. The results of this study suggest that students can use language in their creative writing to demonstrate their creativity. Additionally, their language and creativity increase when they write with greater fluency, flexibility, accuracy, originality, and elaboration. Thus, reforming the curriculum is necessary, particularly for courses in creative writing at Indonesian universities.

7.5 Recommendations

Creative writing is crucial for tertiary English as a Foreign Language (EFL) students in Indonesia. Its purpose is to demonstrate to the global community that these students possess the necessary competencies within their creative writing

classes, including knowledge, skills, and creativity. Consequently, this research proposes three recommendations.

Initially, those responsible for formulating policies at the specified research site—a private University in Ende, East Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia—ought to contemplate implementing a policy that institutes an annual creative writing course for tertiary students studying English as a Foreign Language (EFL). This course would acquaint students with various facets of creative writing, encompassing skills to measure their creativity. Such an initiative aims to familiarize students with written assignments within a creative framework characterized by distinct genres and linguistic attributes.

Second, lecturers in the research site and even Indonesia should develop their creative knowledge, skills, and creativity. Following the development, the SFL GBA incorporates creative writing and narrative under the term PGA through the teaching stages, explicit teaching, group work, and a recursive process of writing that includes the lecturer and peer feedback. Moreover, the lecturers' understanding of texts should be shared with other lecturers of other subjects.

In future research, it is recommended to employ the Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) Genre-Based Approach (GBA), integrating creative writing and narrative within the framework A Process Genre Approach. This approach can be utilized in instructing undergraduate students in creative writing and narrative skills, enhancing their creativity by focusing on fluency, flexibility, accuracy, originality, and elaboration. Considering students' difficulties in creative writing and narrative, they must continue to have explicit guidance to progress in these fields.

In light of the limitations identified in this investigation, a subsequent study should address both methodology and teaching program. Concerning methodology, a future study must enhance trustworthiness by involving well-informed collaborators in participant observations. Furthermore, the research should ensure equitable representation of participant voices, primarily when participants are classified based on specific variables during certain instances. Extending the study's duration is recommended to augment the depth of findings. Regarding the application of Systemic Functional Grammar (SFG) for text analysis, a forthcoming

study should undertake an analysis encompassing context, discourse, grammar, and graphic features and delve into the lexico-grammatical and discourse semantics aspects. This comprehensive approach has the potential to enhance the outcomes of the text analysis.

Regarding the teaching program, while incorporating stages such as SFL GBA teaching, explicit instruction, group collaboration, and a recursive writing process involving lecturer and peer feedback can enhance the development of tertiary EFL students at the research site, additional research should explore introducing diverse teaching and learning activities to capture student interest. A potential strategy is to involve students in selecting topics and reading materials to engage them more effectively in the teaching and learning activities.

REFERENCES

- Abdalla Elhussien Mohammed, F. (2019). Creative Writing from Theory to Practice: Multi-Tasks for Developing Majmaah University Students' Creative Writing Competence. *Arab World English Journal*, 10(3), 233–249. <https://doi.org/10.24093/awej/vol10no3.16>
- Aunurrahman, - (2018) *A Critical Genre-Based Approach to Teaching Academic Writing and Building Character : A Case Study with Tertiary EFL Students in Pontianak Indonesia*. Thesis Dissertation. Bandung: Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.
- Al Azhar, P., & Maolida, E. (2019). Process Genre Approach in Teaching Writing Narrative Text: Its Implementation, Benefits and Obstacles (A Qualitative Research at a Senior High School in Cianjur). *Print) Jurnal JOEPALLT*, 7(September). <https://jurnal.unsur.ac.id/jeopalltonline%0Ahttps://jurnal.unsur.ac.id/jeopallt>
- Alodwan, T. A., & S.S, I. (2014). The Effect of Using Process Approach to Writing on Developing University Students' Essay Writing Skills in EFL. *American Research Institute for Policy Development*, 139–155.
- Altheide, D. L. (1996). *Qualitative media analysis*. Thousand Oaks California: SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Alwasilah, A. C., & Alwasilah, S. S. (2005). *Pokoknya Menulis: Cara Baru Menulis dengan Metode Kolaborasi*. Bandung: Kiblat.